

NORTHWEST ARCTIC FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE
REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL

PUBLIC MEETING

VOLUME I

Northwest Arctic Borough Assembly Room
Kotzebue, Alaska
October 25, 2017
9:06 a.m

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

Enoch Shiedt, Chair
Percy Ballot
Vern Cleveland
Louie Commack
Michael Kramer
Enoch Mitchell
Beverly Moto
Calvin Moto

Regional Council Coordinator, Zach Stevenson

Recorded and transcribed by:

Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC
135 Christensen Drive, Suite 2
Anchorage, AK 99501
907-227-5312; sahile@gci.net

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2
3 (Kotzebue, Alaska - 10/25/2017)

4
5 (On record)

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Sorry about
8 the delay, there was a technical problem and I think
9 it's solved. And welcome all. Welcome all. And we'll
10 -- I did not prepare to see who could give the
11 invocation so we will do a -- we'll get through the
12 agenda and a moment of silence, please.

13
14 Okay. Thank you. Amen in favor -- our
15 favor. Okay. We'll go to the agenda. There's a
16 revised agenda for the Council members with their
17 red.....

18
19 Go ahead, Zach.

20
21 MR. STEVENSON: Pardon me. Through the
22 Chair. Through the Chair we have call to -- call to
23 order and then roll call and establish quorum. We're
24 on item number 2 which was call to order and then roll
25 call and establish quorum.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, thank you. I
28 was just recognizing that our agenda is unread, some
29 people were asking early. Okay. To the agenda, number
30 2, call to order by the Chair. Roll call and by the
31 Secretary. Zach, I think you'll have to do it, the
32 roll call to establish quorum.

33
34 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, Mr. Chair. We
35 have two individuals that were excused absent and that
36 is Percy Ballot, Sr. and Hannah Loon, both of whom were
37 excused for medical.

38
39 Otherwise we do have a quorum for
40 today, Mr. Chair.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Could we have a roll
43 call please, Zach.

44
45 MR. STEVENSON: Starting from the left.
46 Member Cleveland.

47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're on roll call.
49
50

1 MR. CLEVELAND: I'm here.
2
3 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair.
4 Establishing quorum, we have quorum. And starting from
5 the left with Member Cleveland.
6
7 Member Cleveland.
8
9 MR. CLEVELAND: Here.
10
11 MR. STEVENSON: Member Mitchell.
12
13 MR. MITCHELL: Here.
14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Member Kramer.
16
17 MR. KRAMER: Here.
18
19 MR. STEVENSON: Member Shiedt.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Here.
22
23 MR. STEVENSON: Member Moto.
24
25 MR. MOTO: Yeah. Yeah.
26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Member Moto as well.
28
29 MS. MOTO: Here.
30
31 MR. STEVENSON: Okay. Member Commack.
32
33 MR. COMMACK: Here.
34
35 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, we have
36 quorum.
37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. There's a
39 quorum established. Now we need to go to the welcome
40 and introductions.
41
42 I'm Attamuk Enoch Shiedt here from
43 Kotzebue. Good morning.
44
45 I'll start it to say good morning to
46 all.
47
48 Go ahead to my left.
49
50

1 MR. KRAMER: Morning. Vice-Chair
2 Kramer.
3
4 MR. MITCHELL: Enoch Mitchell, Noatak.
5
6 MR. CLEVELAND: Vern Cleveland,
7 Noorvik. Welcome.
8
9 MR. STEVENSON: Member Commack.
10
11 MR. COMMACK: Commack, Ambler.
12
13 MR. STEVENSON: Make sure you turn your
14 mic on when you speak.
15
16 Go ahead, Calvin.
17
18 MR. MOTO: Huh.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Good morning.
21
22 MR. MOTO: Good morning. Oh, is that
23 -- morning, everybody. Could I -- well, that's all I
24 have to say.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.
27
28 MR. MOTO: Okay. For now.
29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Go ahead,
31 Beverly.
32
33 MS. MOTO: Good morning.
34
35 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you all.
36 And now we'll go back -- we'll go back to agenda.
37 Review and adopt of agenda.
38
39 Are there any changes anyone wants to
40 make on it?
41
42 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.
45
46 MR. STEVENSON: For our audience on the
47 phone, the Council members have before them an updated
48 agenda. And I'll briefly for our audience on the phone
49 note those changes as the Chair considers the approval
50

1 of the agenda.

2
3 Specifically on item six we've added
4 6A, item 6A, which is condolences for Raymond Stoney.

5
6 Under item number 7, reports, we've
7 added a report from the designated federal officer
8 addressing the items of sign-in, muting phones for the
9 teleconference by pressing star six as well as 2018 RAC
10 nominations.

11
12 Under item 10 on the agenda we've added
13 consideration of the adoption of a caribou working
14 group to be addressed by the designated federal officer
15 or DFO.

16
17 Under item 11, regional proposals,
18 proposal 18-41/42 will be addressed by Megan
19 Klosterman.

20
21 Proposal 18-43 by Lisa Maas, 18-44 by
22 Joshua Ream, 18-45 again by Lisa Maas, 18-46/47 by Lisa
23 Maas.

24
25 Proposal 18-57 has been removed, that's
26 not relevant to this Council, this region does not have
27 customary and traditional use, that's been eliminated
28 from the agenda.

29
30 Proposal 18-32 will be addressed by
31 Lisa Maas.

32
33 Proposals 18-48/49 by Lisa Maas as
34 well.

35
36 Turning to the third page of the agenda
37 under item number 12, agency reports, we have
38 eliminated under Office of Subsistence Management the
39 legislative update and special actions. The special
40 actions will be addressed under the wildlife proposals.

41
42 And that concludes the modifications to
43 the updated agenda, Mr. Chair.

44
45 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

46
47 Now for the approval of the agenda.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Anyone from
50

1 the Council who would like to make changes to the
2 agenda?

3
4 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chair.

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.

7
8 MR. COMMACK: Yeah, Mr. Chairman, I
9 would like to propose that the -- under National Park
10 Service, Gates of the Arctic report by Marcy and Ambler
11 access project report be moved up to maybe sometime today.

12
13 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

16
17 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, I had
18 neglected to request introduction of those on the phone
19 so I wanted to point that out to allow for the
20 introduction of those who are on the phone.

21
22 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

25
26 Go ahead, radioland.

27
28 MS. DAGGETT: This is Carmen Daggett
29 with Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

30
31 MR. LINCOLN: Good morning. This is
32 John Lincoln with NANA.

33
34 MR. GONZALEZ: This is Daniel Gonzalez
35 with Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

36
37 MR. SHARP: Good morning. This is Dan
38 Sharp with Bureau of Land Management, Anchorage.

39
40 MR. BURCH: This is Mark Burch with the
41 Department of Fish and Game.

42
43 MS. RATTENBURY: Good morning. This is
44 Kumi Rattenbury with the National Park Service in
45 Fairbanks.

46
47 MS. OKADA: Hi. Good morning. This is
48 Marcy Okada with Gates of the Arctic National Park and
49 Preserve.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Morning all.
2
3 Anyone else in the radioland?
4
5 (No comments)
6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not welcome and
8 back to the agenda. Now where were we.
9
10 Oh, Louie, I was trying to ask you what
11 part of the agenda you wanted to move up to so I can
12 find it.
13
14 MR. COMMACK: I don't have a preference
15 as long as it's done today wherever you might fit.
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Your mic please,
18 Louie.
19
20 Your mic, turn your mic on so the
21 recorder to have it on file.
22
23 MR. COMMACK: I don't have a time
24 preference as long as it's sometime today, however you
25 feel.
26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.
30
31 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, responding
32 to the request from Member Commack I wanted to point
33 out that the update on the Ambler road issue was
34 scheduled for item number 12 on the agenda, agency
35 reports. And you'll see that reflected on the third
36 page under National Park Service, item C, C as in
37 Charlie, subsistence study on Ambler access project.
38 And that was to be delivered by telephone from Dr.
39 Anette Watson. So that is on the agenda and it was
40 likely going to be discussed tomorrow. So if you're
41 going to move that agenda item through the Chair, we
42 would need to see whether or not Ms. Watson would be
43 available to do that presentation by the phone today.
44
45 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. The request by
48 Commack was requested because there's a storm coming in
49 tomorrow and he would like to catch the early plane
50

1 back to Ambler. That's why he.....
2
3 MR. COMMACK: Afternoon.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: In the after -- in
6 the afternoon.....
7
8 MR. COMMACK: Afternoon.
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:so we need to do
11 it if possible maybe you could call whoever's speaking
12 on it to see if they could move it up for in the
13 morning.
14
15 MR. COMMACK: That'd be fine.
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: With their
18 approval.....
19
20 MR. COMMACK: That'd be fine.
21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:we need the
23 speaker's approval to.....
24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
28
29 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
30 Marcy, if you're on the line could you -- could you
31 follow-up with Dr. Anette Watson today and see if she's
32 available to deliver that information today rather than
33 tomorrow?
34
35 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
36
37 MS. OKADA: This is Marcy with Gates of
38 the Arctic and I can give Dr. Anette Watson a call
39 today. I know she was available tomorrow after 1:00
40 p.m. because she's located on the east coast and
41 there's a four hour time difference. But I'll try and
42 get ahold of her today and see if she's available to
43 present the information later on today.
44
45 Thanks.
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Louie, can you live
48 with 1:00 o'clock tomorrow then if possible.....
49
50

1 MR. COMMACK: Wonderful.
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:because her
4 presentation will be only about 15 minutes long.
5
6 MR. COMMACK: Wonderful.
7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Sorry.
9
10 MR. COMMACK: Thank you.
11
12 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
15
16 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
17 The other item I wanted to mention is that wildlife
18 trooper Justin McGinnis with the Alaska State Wildlife
19 Troopers may be joining us today and he offered to
20 provide an update on law enforcement issues regarding
21 caribou in unit 23. So I don't know, I haven't seen
22 this morning, but I did want to mention his willingness
23 to offer that update.
24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: He's here somewhere.
26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Okay.
28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, I can see his
30 hat.....
31
32 MR. STEVENSON: He's in the back.
33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:I'm looking at
35 his hat. He's here.
36
37 MR. STEVENSON: So that's an item for
38 your consideration if you'd like to see that update
39 from Mr. McGinnis -- Trooper McGinnis today.
40
41 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
42
43 MR. KRAMER: That would be under agency
44 reports?
45
46 MR. STEVENSON: Correct.
47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Agency reports. I'm
49 a little bit slow this morning.
50

1 MR. STEVENSON: That's quite all right.
2 That was -- that would have been scheduled for
3 tomorrow, Mr. Chair, under Alaska Department of Fish
4 and Game and Trooper McGinnis has offered to do that
5 this morning given his availability if the Council so
6 chooses.

7
8 Thank you.

9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Maybe we could
11 move -- maybe we could move McGinnis to under -- right
12 ahead of DFO reports, that way he could do his thing
13 and give us a briefing on what he's seeing out there
14 with approval by the Council.

15
16 Go ahead, Vern.

17
18 MR. CLEVELAND: I so move to approve
19 the agenda as presented.

20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Do I have
22 a second on that? Kramer, I need a second.

23
24 MR. KRAMER: Second.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: There's a second.
27 With the changes made on the agenda all signify by
28 saying aye.

29
30 IN UNISON: Aye.

31
32 (No opposing votes)

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you all.

35
36 Okay. That -- we're -- okay. We're on
37 number 6, review and approve previous minutes on our
38 last meeting here. I'll get -- we'll -- anybody need
39 to look it over, the minutes, and make changes if they
40 see it as needed. Give you a few minutes to look at
41 your.....

42
43 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.

46
47 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
48 For the Council those that are here in the audience, we
49 have the minutes from our last meeting reflected on
50

1 page 5 of your meeting books, page 5 of your meeting
2 books.

3

4 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5

6 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.

7

8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Vern.

9

10 MR. CLEVELAND: I so move on the
11 approval of previous meeting of.....

12

13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: March 1-2.

14

15 MR. CLEVELAND:March. Thank you.

16

17 MR. MITCHELL: Second.

18

19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Second. All in favor
20 of approval of the minutes signify by saying aye.

21

22 IN UNISON: Aye.

23

24 (No opposing votes)

25

26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you all.
27 Now we're -- okay. This is going to be kind of hard.
28 This is going to be kind of hard. This is on 6A,
29 condolence for Raymond Stoney. Anyone from the Council
30 who would like to speak for the condolence for Raymond
31 Stoney, the one that passed on. He served us for a
32 long time and he did tirelessly -- I'll start everybody
33 off. Tirelessly he served and let's just say thanks to
34 his family, especially his wife for him to be able to
35 attend. He attended a lot of meetings and he traveled
36 a lot. You know how rich we are getting from our per
37 diems and stuff like that and he never asked for no
38 more and he did lots for us. And I'm -- the wisdom he
39 take with him we will probably never see it on this
40 table. He was in many different councils. He did a
41 lot, I learned a lot from him. I think I'm not the
42 only one that learned from Raymond what he did and how.
43 But as before he was getting sick. Like I stated at
44 the Park Service he did call me and recommended that we
45 take a reduction from five to three a day and he asked
46 me if I could push for it. Out of respect I'm going to
47 ask what he -- I'm going to try this with approval of
48 the Council see if I could -- we could do that here.
49 And he did a lot and I can't deny him and from the

50

1 Council I'd like to hear and anyone else from the
2 audience also for Raymond Stoney's condolences.

3

4 Thank you. Go ahead, anyone else want
5 to say. It's open.

6

7

Go ahead, Enoch.

8

9

10 MR. MITCHELL: We the people of Noatak
11 would like to send our condolences to the family of
12 Raymond Stoney. It is a great honor for me to know
13 Raymond as a wise councilman and a dear, good friend.
14 We went through a lot of subsistence meetings together.
15 I looked up to Raymond and I listened to him a lot.
16 When we sit around and talk a lot about subsistence,
17 but all these years and a lot of things he passed on to
18 me. Little did I know that he was teaching me and I'm
19 going to hold on to what he taught me. He had a lot of
20 wisdom and he put it to use for every one of us. He
21 made a good path and made big steps in protecting our
22 subsistence. I will miss him a lot. When he talked to
23 me he really built up my confidence especially when he
24 told me that you're doing the right thing. And that
25 just by saying that to me gave me a lot of confidence
26 and know more, to hang in there a little longer, a few
27 more years for our subsistence, for our people. We
28 will miss him.

28

29

Taikuu.

30

31

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thanks, Enoch.

32

Anyone else?

33

34

MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.

35

36

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

MR. CLEVELAND: I've been with Raymond,
man, 15 years I've been his alternate for 15 years and
just there with him. I mean, I -- you know, he's an
alternate and when he stepped down I got in to the
Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group. I stayed
there three years and I became a chairman. He always
did tell me that (in Native), don't be afraid to say
anything. Say what's in your mind, don't let it go
off. He gave some good advice, Raymond did. Inupiaq
or (indiscernible), I could understand, I could talk
both Inupiaq and English. And real like a friendly
guy, you know, always there talking. He'll be missed,

1 but I missed his funeral, I was -- I ran out of fuel, I
2 was way up river so I missed his funeral in Kiana. But
3 condolences to the family from the people of Noorvik,
4 his wife is from Noorvik.

5
6 Taikuu.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thanks, Vern. Anyone
9 else?

10
11 Go ahead, Calvin.

12
13 MR. MOTO: Yeah, I think one of the
14 best deal about Raymond is -- you know, I stayed with
15 him for almost 17 years on this Commission and every
16 time he brought up something it's something I learned
17 from him, you know, he was knowledgeable about his
18 resources, he was knowledgeable about a lot of things
19 that concern our people. And he was a good negotiator
20 I think, and he never backed down from his decision
21 most of the time. I know that because I was impressed.
22 What impressed me most is how he tell us the different
23 things that we know, but we don't know, you know. It's
24 -- he's going to be missed very much because he's a --
25 he was a good advocate for his people. And that's all
26 I -- I can't say more, if I say more I'll probably --
27 so I just want to say he'll be greatly missed and our --
28 my condolence to his family.

29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Calvin.
31 Anyone else?

32
33 Go ahead, Kramer.

34
35 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, I worked with
36 Raymond for a number of years, looked up to him, you
37 know, he's a very wise man. He might have been little,
38 but his words were tough, you know. He taught me a
39 lot, you know, me being the youngest person on this
40 Board, you know, he told me to stand up for a long time
41 and fight for what we believe in and take no noes for
42 an answer. You know, when an elder tells you to be
43 strong he means it, nobody else tells you what and
44 where and how to do it. He taught me that doing it
45 with respect and you should get respect in return. So,
46 you know, Raymond taught me a lot. My other hometown
47 is Kiana so I used to see him from -- pretty frequent
48 basis because I'd be traveling the Kobuk River trapping
49 up there. There'd be many times where me and him would
50

1 stop on the side of the trail and talk for a few hours,
2 hour or so, say hi, how's it going. He'd always give
3 me pointers on surviving up there because try and have
4 a saltwater boy live the freshwater way was a totally
5 different thing. And, you know, my mentor passed away
6 quite a few years ago, but, you know, learning from a
7 lot of them elders that are -- that live up in that
8 area, you know, about a lot of the difference between
9 freshwater and saltwater, the way it freezes, the way
10 it acts, you know, I couldn't have had such a better
11 mentor than Raymond. And, you know, now there's more
12 elders up there that are always giving me wise advice
13 for up that country. You know, Raymond will be greatly
14 missed. I talked to several of his family members and
15 they wanted to say thank you for serving with him. And
16 I believe that, you know, he's forever present in our
17 meetings. I made a -- I talked with Zach, made a
18 suggestion that in the corner of our books for the next
19 several years that we have a picture of Raymond in the
20 front. Anybody have an objection to that?

21
22 (No comments)

23
24 MR. KRAMER: No. Hearing none, Zach,
25 is there a possibility we could get Raymond Stoney's
26 picture on the corner of our book every meeting?

27
28 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, we can do that.

29
30 MR. KRAMER: Thank you.

31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Kramer.
33 Anyone else? I'm going to -- I'll get to you later,
34 Zach. Anyone from the members who'd like -- I mean,
35 the audience who'd like to give condolence on Raymond's
36 behalf?

37
38 Yeah, go ahead. Come to the mic,
39 please.

40
41 MS. ATKINSON: Hi. Thank you for
42 having time today to remember Raymond. I coordinate
43 the Subsistence Resource Commissions for the National
44 Park Service and so I've worked with Raymond since 2014
45 because I'm pretty young, just starting my career. And
46 at our October meeting we remembered Raymond and I
47 wrote this letter to his family so I wanted to share
48 it.

49
50

1 The staff at Western Arctic National
2 Parklands would like to express condolences for the
3 passing of Raymond Stoney. We would like to recognize
4 his 28 years on the Kobuk Valley Subsistence Resource
5 Commission as an invaluable service to the people and
6 resources of the Northwest Arctic. We would also like
7 to thank his family and community. Raymond Stoney
8 represented the community of Kiana and the subsistence
9 needs of the Kobuk River people for 31 years, through
10 the ups and downs of Federal subsistence management.
11 He served on the Kobuk Valley Subsistence Resource
12 Commission and was also a charter member of the Federal
13 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council meaning that he
14 served on the Council since it was created. He has
15 often been recognized by agency staff and other Council
16 members for his elder wisdom.

17
18 In this letter I wanted to share a
19 personal story to express my gratitude for Raymond's
20 wisdom. Recently Raymond was reflecting on his years
21 of service and told me a story to illustrate the
22 changes he has seen in Federal management. He told me
23 that in his parents' time the shotgun was becoming
24 peoples' livelihood. Inupiaq people would trade pelts
25 at the trading post and one pelt was the value of an
26 empty coffee can. It was still a useful tool at that
27 time for people, but to earn a gun they would have to
28 trap enough pelt to make a pile the height of the gun.
29 After ANILCA the game regulation began in Northwest
30 Alaska and they would take guns from people who were
31 not following the regulations. the regulations that
32 they were enforcing were foreign to the Inupiaq people
33 who had been living on the land since time immemorial.
34 Raymond said that he had begun working with Federal and
35 State subsistence management so that his people would
36 be able to know the regulations that were impacting
37 their lives and so that they would have a voice.
38 Raymond said that when he started going to meetings
39 they were dominated by Federal agency representatives
40 talking and no room for feedback from local people. He
41 said that he has been -- he has seen a big change since
42 then and wrapped up his story by saying I am glad that
43 you are finally listening. And I could always tell
44 when I was working with Raymond, he had worked for so
45 many years with subsistence that he was frustrated, but
46 he still showed up to every meeting with a smile and a
47 willingness to work together. So I share this story to
48 illustrate the changes that Raymond witnessed in his
49 lifetime and the impact that he had made on me and on
50

1 all of my co-workers that he has taught me that change,
2 even if it happens slowly, is worth working for.

3

4 Thank you for time to share that.

5

6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Thank
7 you. Is there anyone else that would like to say
8 something? If not, go ahead, Zach, I know you wanted
9 to read something, a letter.

10

11 Go ahead, Zach.

12

13 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
14 Raymond was a friend and a mentor to me and I wanted to
15 share a letter from the Federal Subsistence Board. And
16 the Federal Subsistence Board represents the five
17 Federal agencies that address subsistence use issues on
18 Federal public lands in Alaska, including the United
19 States Fish and Wildlife Service, the Bureau of Land
20 Management, the National Park Service, the Bureau of
21 Indian Affairs and U.S. Forest Service. The letter I'm
22 about to read to you is in front of you, dated October
23 3rd from the Federal Subsistence Board to Ida Stoney,
24 the wife of Raymond Stoney.

25

26 Dear Ida. On behalf of the Federal
27 Subsistence Management Program we extend our deep
28 condolences for the loss of your husband, Raymond. He
29 was a recognized leader and admired in our
30 organization. Raymond personified the cultural values
31 of the Inupiaq (in Native), he was a statesman who
32 showed respect for others and respect for nature
33 through his leadership and advocating for the
34 subsistence way of life. He was a gentleman known for
35 his hard work, humor and humility. Raymond was one of
36 the charter members of the Federal Subsistence Regional
37 Advisory Councils. He served with distinction on the
38 Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council
39 since its inception in 1993. Raymond served for the
40 Council Chair as recently as last year. Raymond also
41 served as the Chair of the Western Arctic Caribou Herd
42 Working Group. Additionally Raymond served on the
43 Northwest Arctic Region Alaska Migratory Bird Co-
44 Management Council. Raymond's friendship, knowledge
45 and public service inspired others and had a positive
46 impact on many people. Raymond's involvement in the
47 Federal Subsistence Management Program will be
48 remembered with gratitude throughout Alaska. Our
49 sympathies are with you and your family. Sincerely,

50

1 Anthony Christianson, Chair.

2

3

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4

5

6

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach. On the radioland, is there anyone else want to speak for Raymond's condolences, Raymond Stoney?

7

8

9

(No comments)

10

11

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not.....

12

13

14

MS. DAGGETT: I'd like to say something, Mr. Chair.

15

16

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

17

18

19

MS. DAGGETT: This is Carmen Daggett from Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

So Raymond had been an AC member for quite some time, an advisory committee member on the State side of things and been a consistent and knowledgeable advocate for quite a long time, something like 25 to 30 years if my memory serves me right. And so I would just like to acknowledge and commend him for his service to the State and his energy that he put into that system and trying to work with both sides, both State and Federal to ensure that the regulations were working for his people of the region. And also from a personal standpoint he was a very easy person to work with and a very sincere person to work with.

34

35

So thank you to him and his family.

36

37

38

39

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. If there's nobody else we'll get back to the agenda. Or let me ask one more time, is there anyone else like to do a brief on Raymond?

40

41

42

(No comments)

43

44

45

46

47

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not, we'll -- and thank you all for speaking on Raymond's behalf. We'll go back to the agenda, number 7, Council members' reports and please try to make it brief.

48

49

50

Go ahead, we'll start with -- from my left. Go ahead, Vern, your brief reports or Council

1 report.

2
3 MR. CLEVELAND. No caribou, no moose.
4 Saw a lot of antlerless moose on the river. Somebody
5 just kill moose and just leave -- take the antlers off.
6 I saw one above Kiana, I think McGinnis must have got
7 one, but that was on the Squirrel River, but on the
8 Kobuk River there was another one. There are a couple
9 more just no horns, just cut the horns off. I think we
10 ought to get that guy that's trying to buy horns and do
11 the same thing like we did with the caribou a few years
12 back when they were buying caribou horns. Now that one
13 guy's buying moose horns, going from village to
14 village. I tried stopping him, but it seems like our
15 trespass officer supervisor didn't believe me or
16 anything, he just started going against me, started
17 pulling against me, not trying to help me. And just
18 teach ways he's getting worst. We report it, I tell
19 them, hey, go report it, there's antlerless moose, but
20 they must have washed away when the river got high
21 because we got to put a stop to this immediately. We
22 got to have this guy that's buying horns, I don't know
23 where he came from, but I think they had him up --
24 there's a couple guys that are bringing them out. Lot
25 of guys out hunting, not from our area, nothing's being
26 done about it. We got our trespass officer right here,
27 I tried to tell him, but he just go to white guys, I
28 guess he -- maybe or something, I don't know, but this
29 got to be done, this got to be stopped, this is wrong.
30 We couldn't get no moose, nothing and lot of guys from
31 out of state on the river and they say oh, we're going
32 to stop them, that -- they're not going to stop them,
33 it's getting worst and worst every year. Our caribou,
34 the hunter -- the sports hunters up here are -- there's
35 too many of them, we got to put a stop to that too.
36 Caribou were late, they're -- I think they're Kobuk
37 crossing right now and I'm really getting antsy because
38 I spend a lot of money on gas and I don't know if I'll
39 last through the day. I might have to go home because
40 my freezers are full -- empty. I don't have nothing,
41 no moose, no caribou. We've got to put a stop to these
42 guys that are coming in from down states. I had three
43 guys, but I -- I don't think nothing will happen.

44
45 Thank you.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Vern. Go
48 ahead, Enoch.

49
50

1 MR. MITCHELL: This year we had a lot
2 of salmon, especially the second run, there's abundant
3 salmon. We had a lot of berries, a lot of
4 (indiscernible) picks this year. And we had a lot of
5 caribou, but they were kind of high and early on. The
6 last week of August when we hunt Teshekpuk herd way up
7 by Abraham's camp and they lasted like for a week and
8 then they were gone. And then we waited like not as
9 much as we did last year for the caribou, Western
10 Arctic caribou herd to come in. And there was quite a
11 bit this year, but they were quite -- kind of high,
12 high up on the hill, high up on the mountains and
13 didn't want to come down for some reason, but when they
14 come down in the late evening and early morning they
15 would get their quota. A lot of boats get their quota
16 this year. We have -- we had a lot of planes up there
17 and they were -- we had a lot of -- quite a few people
18 that call and -- me and tell me that there are planes
19 diving and harassing caribou again. We got to do
20 something about that too, the planes harassing caribou.
21 We had people take pictures, but we never see no action
22 done, it seems like nothing's being done, like we're
23 taking pictures for nothing. That last time we had
24 meeting they said we need evidence. We give them the
25 evidence, now they say it's more than that, we need
26 more than that. I didn't know what else you need,
27 maybe they should be more clear as to what they need
28 for us to put a stop to it, to take action on these
29 harassing caribou. And we had -- we had a couple small
30 earthquakes this summer, nothing serious. And also our
31 Council directed me when we got a letter from BLM to
32 comment on the Western Arctic caribou herd when they
33 were trying to develop on the calving grounds. And
34 then we -- I wrote a letter to comment on that and the
35 deadline was September 6th of this year. Let me see.
36 Oh, also for our subsistence wise ukpik was placed on
37 the endangered species list, but our Natives can hunt
38 and our harvest did not have much impact on the census
39 of the ukpik, but something to pay attention to in the
40 future. And that's about all.

41
42 Taikuu.

43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch. Go
45 ahead, Kramer.

46
47 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, this year was pretty
48 different, I never seen so much rain in my life up here
49 in -- you know, living up here in Northwest Alaska.

50

1 Spring was good, you know, we got our -- we got our
2 take on bearded seals, ukpik, got them all successfully
3 put away. Summertime, you know, I did put some salmon
4 away, salmon looked like they were running pretty good.
5 Fall caribou hunt, spent a lot of money, came home with
6 nothing. You know, I received a lot of complaints
7 about aircraft, you know, complaints against agencies.
8 I mean, they say that we need to, you know, make
9 complaints, we need evidence. I think the cure to that
10 is to just shut down caribou hunting completely to all
11 nonresident hunters. I think the population is within
12 that threshold to be able to shut it down. I think
13 that's one of the best things for it. And as I was
14 told at our last meeting speaking with Raymond that if
15 they are going to do a partial opening that hunters be
16 required to come up here from June 1st to June 7th to
17 come up here and get their registered caribou ticket.
18 And they're only allowed one and there will only be 50
19 tickets available. That was one thing that Raymond
20 Stoney said that we need to start being strict with the
21 amount of tickets that are out there, if not just close
22 it period. It's got to be on our terms, not the
23 Federal Subsistence Board's terms. You know, he
24 advised me to always be strict and I've always learned
25 from all of these guys right here to be strict, be
26 tough, don't take no for an answer. You know, this
27 fall caribou hunting I've never seen the Kobuk River so
28 high before, I'd have to say it was 30 feet higher than
29 it normally is. You could drive anywhere you want to
30 in the Kobuk River and not hit a gravel bar unless you
31 hit the bank. Caribou, there is caribou around, but
32 seemed like we were just game watching more than we're
33 -- you know, more than they were wanting to travel and
34 migrate south. A lot of it was hit and miss, some
35 people got some, a lot of people didn't. We were one
36 of the ones that didn't, there was a lot of boats that
37 didn't get any caribou, but spent a lot of money up
38 there. You know, my time up there was short, it was
39 all I can afford. And after that I went up here on the
40 Noatak, you know, same thing up there, caribou were
41 right there on the other side of the river, but had no
42 intent to cross, no intent to migrate. We did hear
43 some aircraft up in the Aggie, you know, there was a
44 lot of people snapping pictures. I seen a lot of posts
45 on Facebook, you know, about aircraft, all the guide --
46 transporter and guide aircraft that are available out
47 here on the ramp, could have people can identify them.
48 I've even seen the picture of an aircraft that had its
49 tail numbers all taped up. You know, it's getting
50

1 ridiculous, it's time to put a stop to them, absolute
2 stop to them. You know, the Federal Subsistence Board
3 said they wanted a partial opening to prevent conflict,
4 I think they created conflict, they must love conflict.
5 We don't like conflict. Our herd and our moose
6 population are dropping. It's time to start taking
7 measures to protect the subsistence way of life here
8 and our resources. And if they don't take us seriously
9 then they are not following the laws of ANILCA. We
10 have to take action. You know, I hope that this winter
11 I hope that the caribou do very well, it appears that
12 they're doing very well. I see that they're on the
13 move again, kind of late, you know, from the fall
14 transition to the winter transition was almost
15 overnight. Other than that I'm hoping that, you know,
16 we have a good winter and I hope all our subsistence
17 resources, you know, do very well. I heard a lot of
18 complaints about bears, you know, bears need to start
19 getting taken out of the equation period. I've heard
20 of a whole bunch of incidences where bears came into
21 people's camps, they shot them and chucked them in the
22 river. You know, I seen several sows, I've seen some
23 pictures of sows with four cubs. That's a lot of baby
24 bears. Something's got to be done, they got -- we got
25 to start limiting them. I mean, four cubs, that's a --
26 you figure every year they're starting to have twins to
27 triplets to quadruplets now, that's going to more than
28 double in about five years. The biggest mistake was
29 back in the day in the '80s when they said one bear for
30 every four regulatory years, that's where it screwed
31 up. So now we're paying for a lot of bears. That's
32 all I have for right now other than when it does come
33 down to agency reports, I know it was brought up that
34 we need their law enforcement reports also along with
35 that, very detailed, because we would like to start
36 making note and making records and having them on our --
37 in our books as to what happened, how many were cited,
38 how many complaints that they got. That's a very
39 necessary thing for us to conduct business.

40
41 Thank you.

42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Kramer.
44 I'll give a brief. Our fishing was good. Caribou the
45 way I hear it is good for most people, not all. Noatak
46 was lucky this year. And let's put it this way, Noatak
47 suffered few years, now in return Kobuk get the same
48 thing this year, hardly any caribou. And I'm not
49 trying to say -- being funny or anything, it's just the
50

1 way the caribou migrate and due to global warming.
2 Caribou came in plentiful the way I hear it from Noatak
3 and they just turned around, it got warm and they just
4 about faced and just went back up. When I went to
5 Rickey's camp that's what he tell me. Rickey Aspi's
6 camp and he said they were about 200,000 not too far
7 from his camp, all of a sudden next day they were gone,
8 they were heading north. I mean, these are mother
9 nature we have to live with and do with global warming.
10 And they did get caribou near my camp at Aggie this
11 year. They -- but they waited right up to freeze up
12 before they cross. Some crossed during the day, but
13 mostly close to dark and early in the morning. And, I
14 mean, there was some caribou caught and I had to -- it
15 was getting dark and I'd tell my boy if I see one with
16 felt we're going after it. We got luck, we got three,
17 but it was getting dark. I saw one more, but it was --
18 I tell him it's too dark now. And there was how many
19 bulls there. They got their fill, we got all we search
20 and I tell them to search both sides -- both sides of
21 the river to make sure we -- there's no caribou left.
22 And they did good around my camp. There was -- I heard
23 later there was a caribou left behind, but it's hard to
24 say because I -- we couldn't get any caribou so I let
25 my boy go pick up the four-wheeler and he did and he
26 went up there and he said there was a lot of caribou,
27 but they weren't crossing. Just when they getting
28 ready to move a boat would show up and make noise. But
29 due to -- I think it's global warming affecting our
30 caribou and we have to make changes in our regulation
31 to affect the global warming for the migration on
32 behalf of Northwest Arctic people. And rest of the
33 migration went from Barrow to Unalakleet.

34

35 Thank you.

36

37 Go ahead, Louie, we'll start this way
38 from you.

39

40 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Beverly.

41

42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: All right, Beverly.
43 It doesn't matter which way it goes.

44

45 MS. MOTO: Lately I've seen a lot of
46 wolves and predators, bears mostly. They kind of
47 destroyed my property in Candle and I'm still
48 renovating. But they live there, the wolves live there
49 and they're -- there's not one bunch, there's three,
50

1 four, you know, herds. So I don't know what to do
2 about that. That's all I had to say about that, wolves
3 and the bears, and there are way plenty.

4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

6
7 Go ahead, Calvin.

8
9 Thanks, Beverly.

10
11 MR. MOTO: To expand on her about the
12 predators, you know, it's come to a point now where we
13 have wolves, fox and other animals come into town in
14 evening time most of the time. Therefore early morning
15 we have to make sure that the children go to school
16 with somebody who had a Honda, we never let them walk
17 alone because last year they killed two wolf right near
18 town. And a couple of years ago we had a problem with
19 fox, they were digging the graves. We have -- and some
20 of our subsistence hunters when they go out to hunt
21 caribou they count the bears and they said they just
22 turn around and go back home. We have -- we've got --
23 so far we've got less caribou this fall than we usually
24 get in the falltime when they first come around. Guys
25 go out, hunt right now and they -- they're further
26 back. So it's hard for them to get up there with
27 machines so they have to wait until the snow come. But
28 geese is something that our people rely on is the food
29 that's out there on the tundra. It's just like in the
30 '40s and '50s when we'd just subsist off the country.
31 I know it because when I was a teenager I had to stay
32 home from school and do the subsistence hunting for my
33 family because my dad was working and I used to see a
34 lot of animals that I don't hear about much anymore,
35 you know. Wolf, we have that problem. I think most
36 people have that problem. But the -- so this is
37 something that also this spring we got a surprise. You
38 know, I talk quite a bit about whitefish, there was a
39 bunch of whitefish come to -- come to Daring Creek
40 last. I told those boys, I said how come you didn't
41 let me know. They said we're trying to catch them with
42 rod and reel. I said you have to use string. I laugh
43 at them because they thought that they could hook them
44 like tomcod -- like trout and them, you know. I told
45 them you have to use nets to get them. But I don't
46 know if that's a sign of us getting whitefish again or
47 not, but, you know, this is something that -- something
48 new. And the ducks and geese, crane, they left early
49 again this year. So you can think a cold winter like
50

1 I'm taught that you should tell us.

2

3 If the birds leave early look out for a
4 cold winter.

5

6 That's all I just want to pass on to
7 you guys.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Calvin.

12

13 Go ahead.

14

15 MR. COMMACK: Yeah, lots of rain,
16 different climate all summer. We had first wave of
17 caribou herd went by Ambler, up Shungnak and didn't
18 last very long. There was hardly any moose. People
19 started picking berries, seining, fishing. The geese
20 and ducks left early. So that's the report I got. And
21 we're hoping that the caribou will show up sometime
22 during the winter and pass through.

23

24 Thank you.

25

26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Louie.

27

28 Okay. Thank you all.

29

30 I hate to go on a break because we had
31 a long delay. So if anybody need to have mother nature
32 break go ahead and do it and we'll keep on going, we'll
33 keep on moving due to time conflict.

34

35 And, okay, we're on seven.

36

37 I did my report already so we'll go to
38 Zach.

39

40 Go ahead, Zach. DFO -- it's on DFO
41 report, Zach.

42

43 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
44 Just a few quick housekeeping reminders.

45

46 Item number A is if you haven't done so
47 already please sign in at the sign in sheet on that
48 front desk there.

49

50

1 Item number B was to avoid disruption
2 of the teleconference, if you're not speaking please
3 mute your phone by pressing star six. And obviously
4 when you're talking you want to unmute your phone so we
5 can hear you.

6
7 And then lastly a reminder about the
8 upcoming deadline, the deadline being February 2nd,
9 2018 for the Federal Subsistence Regional Advisory
10 Council. We're now accepting membership applications
11 and nomination packets for 2018. And I did want to
12 mention that in the past year this Council, the
13 Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council,
14 had the highest number of applicants statewide of all
15 the councils that are out there. There were 11
16 applicants this past year which is great. And we want
17 to keep that interest and participation strong.

18
19 As a reminder there are nominations for
20 10 Federal Subsistence Regional Advisory Councils being
21 accepted now through February 2nd of 2018. The
22 Regional Advisory Councils provide advice and
23 recommendations to the Federal Subsistence Board about
24 hunting, trapping and fishing issues on Federal public
25 lands. The Council -- participation and membership on
26 the Councils is one way for the public to become
27 involved in the Federal subsistence regulatory process.
28 Each Council has either 10 to 13 members and membership
29 includes representatives of subsistence use and
30 commercial sport use. If you're interested in applying
31 you'll want to contact Carl Johnson or if you have
32 questions you can reach me in Anchorage at 800-478-1456
33 or directly at 907-786-3674.

34
35 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

38
39 Go ahead, Calvin.

40
41 MR. MOTO: On RAC nominations I was
42 thinking why don't we have like all the other boards
43 they have student reps come, like internships to these
44 meetings. So they could -- we could have rotating
45 around that way we could find out who wants to be our
46 next RAC committee, you know. And if they find out
47 what we do and how we do it maybe they'd be glad to.
48 That's just a suggestion to have a student rep, one or
49 two, like they have. It would be good for them to
50

1 learn especially if they're in high school. And we had
2 -- the school board had two and NANA had one or two,
3 but this is something that I've always wanted to see
4 are young people sitting and listening to us.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Thank
9 you, Calvin, that's well said.

10
11 We need to have students. I think the
12 Federal need to come out and get some money for a
13 student, probably write essay or something to be part
14 of the one here. Or we could go through local schools
15 like we have our meeting here at Kotzebue we could ask--
16 I'm so used to Kramer doing it and I overlooked to ask
17 the school if the students could come by and listen.
18 Or if we have it in any other village. That's a well
19 said point, Calvin.

20
21 Thank you.

22
23 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you. Through the
28 Chair, if that's something that the Council would like
29 to add to your annual report as an action item we could
30 certainly revisit that if the Council so chooses.

31
32 Thank you.

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

35
36 Kramer, go ahead.

37
38 MR. KRAMER: Yeah. I know that, you
39 know, at times we're -- you know, we're shorthanded and
40 I know that there's times where, you know, some Council
41 members, you know, they want to head up and go hunting.
42 And I spoke with Zach and I spoke with Attamuk I think
43 on the last time that, you know, we should have
44 alternates in the high conflict areas. The high
45 conflict areas is either Kivalina, Noatak, Kiana or
46 Noorvik, you know, we should have alternates.
47 Especially the Kobuk River and the Noatak River we
48 should at least have two or three more Council members
49 onboard. I know the last time it was brought up there

50

1 was a motion made and everything, but the Federal
2 Subsistence Board didn't do nothing about it. Nothing
3 was said, we never got any kind of report as to what
4 occurred or what happened regarding that, whether it
5 just got shoved under the table, but, you know, I think
6 it's an absolutely necessary thing for us to have
7 alternates, you know, that way more voices are heard
8 and also more people to represent the local people
9 here.

10

11 Thanks.

12

13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Kramer.

14

15 So we'll go back to the agenda on
16 number 8, service awards.

17

18 Go ahead, Zach.

19

20 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
21 We have -- we had two service awards to present. The
22 first is to Calvin Moto and the second was for Percy
23 Ballot, but due to medical issues he's not with us this
24 morning, but we will be presenting that to Percy when
25 he's at our winter meeting. So I just want to make
26 that clear.

27

28 Regarding the service award for Calvin
29 Moto, I'm going to turn the mic over to Chris McKee,
30 the Wildlife Division chief at the Office of
31 Subsistence Management and our LT representative here
32 at today's meeting.

33

34 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

35

36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

37

38 Go ahead, you have the floor.

39

40 MR. McKEE: I'm going to have to do
41 some moving around during this, but I just wanted to
42 talk about this certificate of appreciation for Member
43 Calvin Moto. He's been on the Northwest Arctic Council
44 since 2012. He's a subsistence hunter, a respected
45 elder and an advocate for both the subsistence way of
46 life and his people. And we all on the Federal
47 Subsistence Program really appreciate the amount of
48 effort and time away from your subsistence activities
49 that the -- your activity on this Council requires.

50

1 And so when somebody can be on this Council for an
2 extended period of time it's really, really important
3 because it takes time to know -- get to know the system
4 that is necessarily complicated. And I work with this
5 everyday of my life and it's difficult enough for me
6 much less somebody that is understandably busy doing --
7 living a subsistence lifestyle and have to come in and
8 deal with some of these complicated issues. And Calvin
9 has been a consistent member of this Council and the
10 Federal Subsistence Board wants to recognize that. So
11 I just want to briefly read off of this certificate of
12 appreciation. It's presented to Calvin Moto in
13 recognition of his years to the Federal Subsistence
14 Management Program as a member of the Northwest Arctic
15 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council for the years
16 2012 to 2017.

17
18 So thank you very much, Calvin, we
19 appreciate it.

20
21 (Applause)

22
23 MR. MOTO: Thank you.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

26
27 MR. MOTO: Cover my surprise. I don't
28 know what to say for once. But I want to thank you for
29 this plaque, I will cherish it. And, I'm sorry, I
30 appreciate, I enjoyed working with you people, with the
31 people I work with. I set my goal to be on this for 20
32 years and I will finally say good-bye. I have two more
33 years to go so I'm going to try to make 20 years. But
34 then maybe I'll try to make another 20 years after
35 that.

36
37 I've always been involved in
38 subsistence. I was in the last subsistence fight when
39 we -- in the '80s when we were in Anchorage, when I was
40 Chairman of the Fish and Game Advisory Board for four
41 and a half years. We drafted what we thought was a
42 great subsistence thing, but then the -- it got knocked
43 out. But, you know, we spent almost three months
44 trying to draft this, finally got it worded right,
45 Patricia knows, she was there with us. And I remember
46 how I used to go to meeting, I'd look where I see non-
47 Natives I walk down the aisle and accidently step on
48 their toes. Excuse me, pardon me. And then I'd get up
49 and go the other way, but I did this because I was
50

1 thinking of our young people. Subsistence to me has
2 always been here, it'll always be. I was on a
3 commercial board, fishery board, where I was the only
4 subsistence member.

5
6 We started the Bering Sea Fishery
7 Association and it's still going.

8
9 But I just want to say thank you to the
10 Federal Subsistence Board, tell them I appreciate this.

11
12 Thank you.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thanks,
15 Calvin.

16
17 Back to the agenda. We'll -- we -- our
18 law enforcement, McGinnis, you're up next.

19
20 Thank you.

21
22 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Morning, Mr. Chair.
23 Thank you, Board members. Folks in the audience and in
24 radioland out there, good morning.

25
26 First of all I'd like to offer my
27 condolences to the Stoney family. I briefly knew
28 Raymond through this process and was always very
29 humbled and impressed with his knowledge and just the
30 person he was. So again my condolences to him and his
31 family.

32
33 Congratulations on your award, sir,
34 well deserved.

35
36 My name's Justin McGinnis, I'm with the
37 Alaska Wildlife Troopers here in Kotzebue, Alaska. I'm
38 the only wildlife trooper here, my primary patrol area
39 is game management unit 23, 26A and as needed in the
40 Koyukuk drainage and on the Seward Peninsula unit 22.
41 So a very large geographical area with a number of fish
42 and wildlife resources that are critical to subsistence
43 needs.

44
45 This fall, to answer your question, Mr.
46 Kramer, I have some numbers for you. I contacted 348
47 people during this fall hunting season. Citations were
48 issued, warnings were issued for various wildlife
49 violations and several investigations which are still
50

1 ongoing are on my plate right now. We tried something
2 new this fall and I was able to get an additional
3 aircraft asset up here so we had an aircraft on floats
4 and on bush wheels which increased our area of
5 coverage. Unfortunately we did not have any additional
6 manpower so I had to just work between the two aircraft
7 and weather dependent, call related or -- use one of
8 the two to get out and answer calls, investigate crimes
9 and do proactive patrols.

10
11 Coordination went well with Dan
12 Stevenson with the National Park Service. He and I met
13 up quite a few times, early morning to kind of go over
14 notes, talk about what was going on and what we were
15 seeing and those kinds of interactions. And so I'd
16 like to thank the Park Service that's here for their
17 help with that, that goes a long way towards covering a
18 really large area.

19
20 Got a meeting this afternoon with the
21 BLM ranger you see in the back, we're going to talk
22 about some things for next year so we can get together,
23 be more efficient and get out there and do our jobs.

24
25 This fall the one thing I will say is I
26 appreciate very much the reporting. I've strived to
27 have sort of an open door policy and make myself very
28 approachable and available. And so I appreciate the
29 complaints, the calls, the tips that we receive. I'm
30 just one person up here working a lot of hours in a big
31 country doing my very best to be a good game warden for
32 you. Please continue to feed me information.
33 Sometimes it might not seem significant, but I'm very
34 interested in something new, things that may be out of
35 place or something that may give you cause for concern,
36 please let me know. I can tell you that with a lot of
37 coverage I get out a lot, I take my job seriously and
38 get out as any game warden should and be out as much as
39 I can and you start to notice the way things should
40 look in the country and the way -- and when something's
41 out of place. But I'm just one guy in one area at one
42 time. So when you bring me a complaint or a tip about
43 something that you saw it helps me immensely. So I
44 appreciate that, thank you. Please continue to send
45 those complaints and tips my way. Know that when you
46 send those to me not all of them will turn into -- may
47 not turn into something. It's the nature of what we do
48 and there may not be anything to it and it may not
49 actually be out of the ordinary, but it might be. And
50

1 we've had enough of those that were -- that resulted in
2 investigations that resulted in serious wildlife
3 crimes. So I appreciate those calls. I will do my
4 best to follow-up with you and give you some closure on
5 that, some feedback so that you know that your call
6 didn't go unanswered. Be patient with me, this stuff
7 doesn't happen overnight, but we do have a lot of open
8 investigations that we are actively working on. And I
9 don't need to tell you the reason for that. These
10 resources are critical and they're worth our very best
11 efforts. And so striving to provide you with those.

12
13 I'll give you one example of how prompt
14 reporting resulted in an investigation this fall. I
15 was on patrol in the -- I think I was headed to the
16 upper Ambler or the Shungnak River, received a call as
17 I passed within cell reception to land and call post.
18 We'd received a report of a moose that had been shot
19 allegedly with an arrow and the head removed. So very
20 serious. So I headed that way, met up with the
21 individual, with the assistance of one of Lance's
22 trespass officers, used a boat to access the kill site.
23 We hiked in, I examined the scene, collected evidence,
24 identified a possible suspect. What we found out was
25 that the arrow was actually a piece of a aluminum from
26 a pack frame, it wasn't an arrow, but it looked like an
27 arrow. And the antlers are gone, but all the meat was
28 gone too. However they had failed to comply with game
29 management unit 23 salvage requirements that require
30 you to leave the bones or the meat naturally attached
31 to the bone before you bring it out of the field. The
32 evidence at the scene suggested that that had not been
33 the case because there was rib bones there with knife
34 marks on them. We identified suspects and they were
35 issued citations for failing to adhere to GMU 23
36 salvage requirements. That happened quick, the reason
37 we were able to make that case is because of prompt
38 reporting. That evidence by the time we even got to it
39 a bear had already been on it and there was a bear
40 still in the area. So that evidence goes away quick,
41 those kill sites, those tracks. So please prompt
42 reporting more than anything, pictures are great too,
43 but more than anything get the information to me as
44 quickly as you can and that will help me a lot.

45
46 And again I thank you for your time,
47 thanks for your help in this big job I've got to try to
48 tackle here.

49
50

1 I'm always available if you have
2 questions or need help with something.

3

4 Thanks, Mr. Chair.

5

6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. I
7 will say this. I hope they hear me out there. I
8 always thought of how short we are in enforcement. I
9 would like to see NANA, Selawik Wildlife Refuge,
10 Kivalina Monument and Bering Land Bridge get together,
11 have a contract with NANA to help with enforcement to
12 see what's going on at our resources. Not as
13 enforcement, but information to lead to direct line to
14 McGinnis because our NANA enforcement could only work
15 on NANA lands, they can't work in any other place,
16 don't work on KIC land or they can't do it. And so
17 they would make it a contract and they will say, hey,
18 McGinnis, this is what we see. That way they could
19 report to any other landowner, not just NANA. And I
20 think it would help the problems and issues we have
21 here. That way we would not have only McGinnis because
22 our NANA trespass officers will go out there and fly.

23

24 But I think if they partnership with
25 all landowners with the Federal agencies I think we
26 could do better out there to help save our resources
27 because Northwest Alaska is one of the last resources
28 we have here that is plentiful, not only in caribou,
29 sheep. Like we say we try to tell them that many time,
30 bears, moose, but they didn't say anything about bears,
31 but any other resource, fish to the birds out there.
32 We need to conserve Northwest Alaska and I always say
33 that and I will say that on my last hunt. And so I
34 think something need to be done. That's why when I was
35 with the Western Arctic caribou herd we try to work it
36 out so I'm going to ask Vern maybe to look into it
37 because I think he will have more say than we do here
38 as the Chairman for the Western Arctic caribou herd to
39 try to help.

40

41 So all I can say I hope this helps you
42 in the future, something could be done like that
43 because we need enforcement now because our land is
44 plentiful, yet our people in population is a lot of
45 people. And the land could take only so much take
46 before animals start declining and start hurting. We
47 need to worry about that. So I hope this helps and I
48 hope you'll be able -- it's something to think about.
49 We need to start now before it's too late. It could

50

1 take only so much and it's going to crash and keep
2 crashing, who's it going to hurt. Not only Northwest
3 Alaska, there's North Slope, Nome, Western Interior.
4 They're the ones that -- our migration route affects
5 them, all of us.

6
7 Thank you.

8
9 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chair.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.

12
13 MR. COMMACK: Thank you. Could you
14 hear me?

15
16 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes, sir.

17
18 MR. COMMACK: Okay. On your report you
19 indicated that you went after a moose that was shot
20 with a bow and arrow?

21
22 TROOPER MCGINNIS: That was what the
23 report indicated initially, yes.

24
25 MR. COMMACK: But you found it dead?

26
27 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes.

28
29 MR. COMMACK: And what I didn't
30 understand, you said there was meat there or the whole
31 body or everything was there?

32
33 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No, everything had
34 been salvaged.....

35
36 MR. COMMACK: Salvaged.

37
38 TROOPER MCGINNIS:however it
39 hadn't been salvaged properly. There's some -- a very
40 particular way that meat is required to be salvaged on
41 moose and caribou in unit 23 and that it has to be left
42 on the bone. That promotes a good, clean and thorough
43 salvage. And the evidence suggested at the scene that
44 it -- those -- that regulation was not complied with.

45
46 MR. COMMACK: So it was -- your report
47 is saying that the meat, everything else was done
48 properly?

49
50

1 TROOPER MCGINNIS: The meat was brought
2 out of the field, but some of it was removed from the
3 bones at the kill site which is unlawful.
4
5 MR. COMMACK: I -- okay. You said
6 there was bones left.....
7
8 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes.
9
10 MR. COMMACK:ribs?
11
12 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Rib bones.
13
14 MR. COMMACK: Rib bones.
15
16 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Correct.
17
18 MR. COMMACK: And leg bones and.....
19
20 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No.
21
22 MR. COMMACK: Nothing, everything was
23 gone?
24
25 TROOPER MCGINNIS: The lower leg
26 bones.....
27
28 MR. COMMACK: What I'm trying to
29 understand is when you said the policy or whatever we
30 have to deal with is they could leave rib bones out
31 there?
32
33 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No.
34
35 MR. COMMACK: No?
36
37 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No. No, the GMU 23
38 salvage requirements state that for moose and caribou
39 taken before October 1st, the meat.....
40
41 MR. COMMACK: October 1st.
42
43 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yeah. The meat must
44 remain naturally attached to the front quarters, hind
45 quarters and ribs, the neck and backstrap -- back meat
46 can be removed. That's the only thing that can be
47 taken off the bone at the kill site. So one of the
48 things that I inspect in camps is when I look to make
49 sure that the meat has been salvaged thoroughly and
50

1 properly is that those parts have been left on the
2 bone. It makes a huge difference in the quality.....

3
4 MR. COMMACK: Yeah.

5
6 TROOPER MCGINNIS:the life of the
7 hanging meat and, you know, the thorough --
8 thoroughness of the salvage job.

9
10 MR. COMMACK: Okay. Thank you.

11
12 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Thanks for a good
13 question.

14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

16
17 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.

18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

20
21 MR. MITCHELL: I've got a couple
22 questions. Do you receive the phone calls or do you
23 get them from a secretary or agency or do you have
24 people talk directly to you?

25
26 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Good question,
27 Enoch. I get them in various ways. People sometimes
28 directly contact me or see me at the store or wherever
29 they may see me in town and report something. So
30 that's one way that I receive complaints and reports.
31 Sometimes they go to a dispatch center in Fairbanks,
32 sometimes they go to the post here in Kotzebue and
33 every once in a while they come to the Alaska wildlife
34 safeguard hotline. So there's various way to get ahold
35 of the Alaska Wildlife Troopers in Kotzebue.

36
37 Good question.

38
39 MR. MITCHELL: My second question is
40 how much evidence does it take to take action to stop
41 aircraft from harassing caribou or what does it take?

42
43 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Good question. It's
44 hard to answer how much evidence, it's not a matter of
45 how much or not enough, it's whether there's evidence
46 to support that a crime has occurred. Okay. So let me
47 give you an example. The Noatak controlled use area as
48 defined in the regulations is a five mile corridor
49 either side of the Noatak River from the mouth of the
50

1 Aggie to the mouth of the Nimi, right. That area from
2 August 15th to September 30th is closed to the use of
3 aircraft in any manner for big game hunting. Okay.
4 That's what the rule states. So when I get a call
5 about an aircraft in the controlled use area what it's
6 referring to is being on the ground, it's a
7 geographical boundary on the ground, not air space.
8 Okay. So if it's flying overhead they haven't violated
9 the law, but I still want to know about it, I will
10 still take that information. That helps me, it does.
11 If they're on the ground then what I want to know is
12 what are they doing on the ground there. Are they
13 having a picnic, are they picking up park rangers, are
14 they fishing or are they big game hunting. So there's
15 a lot of things that they can legally do on the ground
16 in the controlled use area that don't violate the rules
17 regarding that controlled use area. So I want to know
18 if they're big game hunting. And so that's -- and
19 there's things that are evidence of big game hunting
20 that, you know, we may or may not come across in our
21 investigation.

22
23 So again I appreciate all of the calls
24 because it's up to me to then find out, if you tell me
25 about an aircraft in the Noatak controlled use areas
26 between those dates I'm going to investigate it and
27 determine if their actions meet the elements of that
28 crime of using an aircraft in any manner for big game
29 hunting within the Noatak controlled use area.

30
31 MR. MITCHELL: One more question.

32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

34
35 MR. MITCHELL: You already said you
36 have no jurisdiction over air space?

37
38 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Correct.

39
40 MR. MITCHELL: So if it happening it's
41 diving on some caribou.....

42
43 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.

44
45 MR. MITCHELL:you have no
46 jurisdiction over that?

47
48 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No, that's something
49 we do. If they're harassing, if their actions are
50

1 intentionally attempting to harass game or molest game,
2 drive it, herd it, then we want to know about it.

3
4 And I'm actually working with a
5 resident of Noatak trying to get a video that we're
6 having trouble linking up and getting ahold of. Again
7 I work within the rule of law and it's about facts,
8 black and white evidence, actions that meet the
9 elements of crimes. Video definitely helps because
10 there are certain things that airplanes are allowed to
11 do to safely operate in an airport environment, however
12 there are some things that they're not allowed to do.
13 And if their actions fit the elements of a particular
14 crime we'll address that. Video definitely helps,
15 okay, and so we appreciate any and all efforts to get
16 video picture to us in a timely manner.

17
18 MR. MITCHELL: Thank you.

19
20 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Thank you. Any
21 other questions, Mr. Chair.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Anyone else.

24
25 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chair.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Kramer.

28
29 MR. KRAMER: I know yesterday at our
30 meeting, you know, they're -- we were up there at the
31 Aggie.....

32
33 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.

34
35 MR. KRAMER:we saw your plane
36 through the pass because it was a yellow Cub. And, you
37 know, you did explain to us that, yeah, you were up
38 there investigating something, but, I mean, we don't
39 know that.....

40
41 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Okay.

42
43 MR. KRAMER:you know. So I think
44 that it would be good that, you know, in the future
45 that, you know, if you guys are going to be in a
46 certain area kind of mark down the date and time and
47 which area you're at, that could -- I mean, if people
48 say, man, there was a yellow Super Cub over there
49 really circling, well, maybe that's you investigating a
50

1 crime that happened there, you know. That way, you
2 know, it's covering a law enforcement basis, you know,
3 their basis as to what they're doing over there, you
4 guys are covered, you know.

5
6 I mean, I said well, maybe -- because
7 when we were there I saw your Cub flying.....

8
9 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.

10
11 MR. KRAMER:past, you know, I
12 mean, you were high enough. And I said well, he's
13 probably over there, you know, investigating something
14 because we were all sitting there watching caribou and
15 there's musk ox over there.

16
17 So, you know, and I told them, I said
18 well, if they're up there they're most likely doing
19 business.

20
21 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Okay.

22
23 MR. KRAMER: They're not up there, you
24 know, harassing anything that's -- I did recognize your
25 plane flying through there.

26
27 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yeah. Good.

28
29 MR. KRAMER: And it would be good even
30 on the Federal side and the BLM side, that way their
31 tracks are covered, you know, they're -- not covered,
32 but, I mean, they're -- you know, if somebody complains
33 about a Park Service plane in a certain area well, Park
34 Service will say well, we were in that area, we were
35 dropping off rangers, we were dropping off people doing
36 some studies, you know, I mean, that way you guys are
37 covering yourselves.

38
39 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Sure. I'll take
40 that into account. We'll do our best to help you with
41 that, Mike.

42
43 Just remember we, you know, sometimes
44 have to respond quickly and we can't always share all
45 of that what can sometimes be sensitive information.

46
47 But I'll take that into account and I
48 appreciate that input.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. On the thought
2 he had maybe, McGinnis, maybe to cover yourself, most
3 boats have VHF.....

4
5 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:and you probably
8 have one in your plane.

9
10 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes.

11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And you could say I'm
13 here in a certain area, if you see, you know, boats out
14 there in the river and you can say I'm in so and so
15 area, I'm investigating, I think it would have a lot
16 less conflict. And, you know, it's the same thing with
17 the Park Service people, they had VHF and they announce
18 it they -- I think the conflict would change a lot.
19 That's a thought, that might help big time.

20
21 Announce it, boats have VHF.....

22
23 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yeah.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:and there are a
26 lot of handheld radios.

27
28 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chair.

29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.

31
32 MR. COMMACK: Thank you. I'm not
33 familiar with the hunting camp itself and what consists
34 in the hunting camp. My question would be is there a
35 freezer in the hunting camp, is there a generator that
36 works a freezer?

37
38 TROOPER MCGINNIS: I've seen that in my
39 years as a game warden, I've seen that -- seen it once,
40 but typically no, not a freezer. And when you say
41 hunting camp, are you referring to at somebody's
42 subsistence camp or are you talking about at a drop off
43 camp?

44
45 MR. COMMACK: Drop off camp.

46
47 TROOPER MCGINNIS: No, I've not seen a
48 freezer and a generator.

49
50

1 MR. COMMACK: With our weather
2 condition being what it is today.....
3
4 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.
5
6 MR. COMMACK:the climate change,
7 the.....
8
9 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes.
10
11 MR. COMMACK:the wetness, how do
12 they maintain meat for -- to be edible in two or three
13 days with no refrigeration?
14
15 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Good question. The
16 first thing they do is hang it up, keep it dry, keep it
17 clean, keep it out of the sun, keep it out of the rain.
18
19 MR. COMMACK: I would ask my elder.....
20
21 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yeah.
22
23 MR. COMMACK:with today's weather
24 conditions if that's still viable, could you hang meat
25 for three days and it'll be edible or with the weather
26 it's going to start deteriorating?
27
28 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Well, I can tell you
29 what I see in the field and one of the things that I
30 look for. The salvage regulations require you to
31 salvage the meat for human consumption. And so if you
32 can't eat the meat, if it's not salvaged for human
33 consumption because you let it go bad, we're going to
34 address that issue as if you just left it in the field
35 all together, okay, because you have to take care of
36 that meat, you can't let it spoil. One of the things
37 that they do because they know that we enforce that, we
38 know that when I'm in a camp and I'm inspecting the
39 meat, I'm taking a look at it, is it green, is it
40 being, you know.....
41
42 MR. COMMACK: Yeah.
43
44 TROOPER MCGINNIS:absolutely
45 we're looking like -- looking at that. And so before
46 that happens most of them call to have that meat picked
47 up and shipped out of here so that it can be put in a
48 freezer or handled appropriately and processed.
49
50

1 MR. COMMACK: Okay. Thank you, Mr.
2 Chairman.

3
4 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Thank
5 you, Louie. Thank you, McGinnis.

6
7 Go ahead, Enoch.

8
9 MR. MITCHELL: All right. I'd like a
10 quick clarification to clarify that for some boats that
11 didn't stop when you or Ken was landed on the ground
12 bars.

13
14 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Uh-huh.

15
16 MR. MITCHELL: You said that -- you
17 said that the water was too shallow to stop to you,
18 they didn't try to run away or ignore you, it was.....

19
20 TROOPER MCGINNIS: I understand.

21
22 MR. MITCHELL:just too shallow to
23 stop and.....

24
25 TROOPER MCGINNIS: I understand, Enoch.
26 Thanks for clarifying that. And I did do my best to
27 try to find the gravel bar that's near that upper
28 overcut bank so that we can meet and if we can't
29 because it's not safe, I hear you. And then in return,
30 yeah, just let them know that I'm just -- just there
31 trying to -- trying to my job and be a friendly game
32 warden, make sure everything's being done right.

33
34 But, yeah, thanks for that input and I
35 remember that.

36
37 MR. MITCHELL: Right. Right.

38
39 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Thank you.

40
41 MR. MITCHELL: They didn't try to run
42 away.

43
44 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yeah, appreciate
45 that.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
48 Your mic -- you're done -- are you done? Okay.

49
50

1 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Yes, Mr. Chair.
2 Thank you for time.

3
4 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

5
6 TROOPER MCGINNIS: Okay.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. And back to
9 the agenda.

10
11 We're on number 9, public and tribal
12 comments is open.

13
14 Go ahead, Maija. You have to come up
15 to the mic.

16
17 MS. LUKIN: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
18 Maija Lukin, Western Arctic National Parklands. I just
19 wanted to point out that our law enforcement officer,
20 so we're going back to the previous agenda item. Our
21 law enforcement officer is out of town and we do have
22 National Park Service resource protection update and
23 coordination summary that I believe Hillary passed out
24 to all of the RAC members this morning.

25
26 And I just wanted to point out a couple
27 of things that were -- that might alleviate some
28 questions.

29
30 I know Mike brought up rural and local
31 preference. And I just wanted to point out that in
32 Kobuk Valley National Park and in Cape Krusenstern
33 National Monument you must be a local person to be able
34 to hunt in those areas. And Kobuk Valley includes
35 Onion Portage and the Kobuk River in that area. So
36 those are local rural preference parks and monuments
37 and so that's one of the things that I wanted to make
38 sure that we pointed out.

39
40 And then I wanted to also point out
41 that it's a really good idea to be able to avoid
42 conflict to let people know or let the tribes in areas
43 know which of our planes, like the Park Service plane
44 or the state trooper aircraft, is going to be in a
45 certain area. But it can hinder a law enforcement
46 investigation, yeah. So we are -- one of the changes
47 that I've requested and that I'm enforcing I guess is
48 that when research is happening or when we're picking
49 up, you know, routine pick ups like on the Aggie gravel
50

1 bar when we picked up a couple of Park Service
2 employees, that we let the Noatak Tribe know, we let
3 the areas that are affected basically, so Kotzebue
4 Tribe and Noatak Tribe know what the aircraft tail
5 numbers are, what we're doing in that area because it's
6 routine, it's research or we're picking up Park Service
7 staff or we're dropping off Park Service staff, things
8 like that.

9
10 But I just wanted to make sure that you
11 understood that we aren't going to -- so if Myla -- if
12 our law enforcement officer is going to routinely be
13 flying in an area then I think letting the affected
14 tribe or communities know is fine, but if he's on a
15 patrol or a -- you know, if I get an email say -- one
16 of the things Justin brought up is how things are
17 reported, I get a lot of emails, I ask for photos, I
18 handed out my card at every village that we visited
19 this fall, they send me a lot of information, I forward
20 that to both Justin and Dan and I'm confident that they
21 take care of it and they do, they respond to myself and
22 the person who's emailed. So if Dan -- and I'm
23 speaking just for Park Service, but if Dan is going up
24 there on an investigation that it's probably not a good
25 idea to let people know that he's going up there just
26 because the affected people or, you know, that may be
27 breaking the law could also hear that he's going up
28 there and we don't want to hinder that kind of an
29 investigation. So but for every other -- you know,
30 every other research that's going on in the Parks,
31 routine pick ups and drop offs, things like that, we
32 are sending tail numbers over to the tribes. So we do
33 send them to Herbert and Nicole at Noatak and Kotzebue
34 Tribe when we're doing anything in the Noatak Preserve
35 and then we send them to Noorvik, Kiana, Ambler,
36 Shungnak, Kobuk when we're doing anything in the Kobuk
37 National Park.

38
39 So that's a really good idea and we're
40 going to keep on trying to make sure that we send that
41 information out and if there's a better way than
42 sending it over to the tribe then please let us know,
43 let me know and we'll try to do that.

44
45 We can -- we have a Friday radio show
46 and as long as we know that the research is going on we
47 will let people know we are doing research in Cape
48 Krusenstern on for example shorebird die off and these
49 are the planes and the tail numbers and the colors of
50

1 the planes that the Park Service is sending out. So we
2 -- so people are understanding and people who listen to
3 KOTZ radio do know that. So I just wanted to point out
4 that maybe the last two paragraphs are some -- will
5 answer some of the questions about -- maybe that Enoch
6 had about how many contacts happened and things like
7 that. And so it's on here, I'm available for questions
8 if you want.

9

10 I wanted to make sure that the National
11 Park Service law enforcement resource protection update
12 was also talked about during the RAC.

13

14 Thank you.

15

16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Maija.
17 Thank you so much.

18

19 Okay.

20

21 Anything else.

22

23 (No comments)

24

25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Still back to
26 number 9, public and tribal comments is on right now.

27

28 Anyone from the public.

29

30 (No comments)

31

32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Do we recognize the
33 radioland. Anybody at the radioland, we're on number
34 9, public and tribal comments.

35

36 (No comments)

37

38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not, we'll go to
39 number 10, old business.

40

41 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

42

43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

44

45 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.

46

47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Caribou working
48 group.

49

50

1 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
2 In December of 2016 there was interest from this
3 Council, the North Slope Council and the Seward
4 Peninsula Council and Western Interior to form a
5 caribou working group. And the purpose of that group
6 as it was originally envisioned was to provide a means
7 for those four Councils to address issues that affect
8 Federally-qualified subsistence users, particularly
9 those that utilize the Western Arctic caribou herd, the
10 Central Arctic herd and the Mulchatna and Teshekpuk
11 herds. And in doing so help to provide a means for the
12 sharing of information that could be brought back to
13 the Councils for their information. This issue was
14 brought up in a teleconference in 2016, winter of 2016,
15 where Chairs and/or Vice Chairs from those four
16 affected Councils were present. And there appeared to
17 be interest in moving forward with forming this body.

18
19 This issue came before the Northwest
20 Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council at their
21 February, 2017 winter meeting.

22
23 And at that time the Council had
24 requested further clarification on what the function of
25 that body might be and what the roles and
26 responsibilities of participating members might be.
27 And I -- I'm going to read some information that came
28 out of last week's meeting of the Western Interior
29 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council which addressed
30 that question that this Council had raised.

31
32 Specifically we addressed at the
33 Western Interior meeting the desire amongst the
34 affected Regional Advisory Councils who share the
35 resources of the various caribou herds in the northern
36 part of Alaska, specifically the Western Arctic,
37 Teshekpuk, Mulchatna and Central Arctic herds as I
38 mentioned. The Chair noted the need to have a
39 discussion on the record to authorize the formation of
40 a working group and who would represent the Council on
41 the working group.

42
43 I'm going to take a pause for just a
44 moment and state that the Western Interior Council
45 recognized that for their purposes having Council
46 members that would be able to speak to the various
47 herds given their various locations would be effective
48 in helping to address their needs. Specifically the
49 Western Interior Council voted to form two separate
50

1 working groups, one to address the northern end herds
2 and one to address the Mulchatna. The northern working
3 group would include members of the North Slope,
4 Northwest Arctic, Seward Peninsula and Western Interior
5 regions. The Mulchatna group would include members of
6 the Western Interior, Bristol Bay and Yukon Delta
7 regions. And the goal of these working groups would be
8 to provide for the coordinated information sharing and
9 coordinated recommendations to take back to their
10 various Councils for actions. This would hopefully
11 provide for greater consistency and coordinated action
12 on recommendations for caribou management. Membership
13 on the northern work group includes the Western
14 Interior Chair, Jack Reakoff, Darrell Vent and Pollack
15 Simon. For the Mulchatna working group their
16 membership would include Dennis Thomas, Raymond Collins
17 and Jack Reakoff.

18
19 So I hope that that helps to provide
20 some clarification how this caribou working group is
21 being envisioned and how it's being pursued presently
22 in the Western Interior region who voted unanimously to
23 pursue that approach.

24
25 Similarly the North Slope Regional
26 Advisory Council has taken action as of last winter to
27 adopt participation in a caribou working group as well.

28
29 So through the Chair I respectfully
30 submit that the Council would have the opportunity now
31 to determine whether or not they want to participate in
32 and sign onto a four region caribou working group.

33
34 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach.
37 Yes, I think there's interest in it.

38
39 So from the rest of the Council, I got
40 a question for you to clarify that the caribou working
41 group, is it going to be on the federal lands because
42 we have a Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group
43 also, but that's out -- really out of the State. So
44 this one here will be out of the Federal -- on the
45 Federal lands?

46
47 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair, if I
48 may. I want to clarify that with a question to our LT
49 representative, Chris McKee.

50

1 Chris, am I correct in stating that if
2 that -- if such a group were to be formed that their
3 comments would be specifically applicable to Federal
4 public lands, that's correct?

5
6 MR. McKEE: Well, I mean, the group
7 would be made up of representatives from the Federal
8 Council so I'm -- obviously they're going to be
9 speaking to issues on that -- the Board might have some
10 influence on Federal lands, but they're also free to
11 speak on issues related to caribou anywhere within the
12 range of those herds and obviously that's going to
13 include State lands as well.

14
15 I mean, we don't want to limit
16 discussion or potential action to just those Federal
17 lands, it's just that those would be the only lands
18 that the Federal Subsistence Board would have
19 regulatory authority of. So I don't want anybody that
20 participates on that group to feel like they're limited
21 to discussion only on those lands.

22
23 So hope that helps.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
26 Yeah, I think there would be great interest.

27
28 What does the Council think about this
29 caribou working group -- because nods don't tell me
30 much and being on a recorder I think I need yes or a
31 nay. I think I have great interest in this, not only
32 me, rest of you because caribou is our main diet and we
33 depend on it heavily.

34
35 So I will leave it up to the council,
36 how they want to go about this.

37
38 Any comments from the Council.

39
40 Go ahead, Mike.

41
42 MR. KRAMER: I know I've brought it up
43 in the past that, you know, that, you know, just having
44 a caribou working group, I think I wanted to try and
45 make it just, you know, subsistence resource group
46 where we work on a number of different subsistence
47 resources that are, you know, either their numbers are
48 falling or they're getting critical. It should be, you
49 know, everything in general. It should be a wildlife

50

1 working group, that way we can address a bunch of
2 different species, you know, whether they're threatened
3 or non-threatened, but, you know, the main issues would
4 be caribou.

5
6 So I think it needs to be a wildlife
7 working group.

8
9 Thank you.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Are you
12 taking -- I see you taking notes, Zach.

13
14 (In Native)

15
16 Go ahead, Enoch.

17
18 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair, I support
19 this caribou working group. It would be good for all
20 of us to know how other groups are doing and how the
21 herds are doing in other parts of the State and other
22 parts of the region and all around. And how they
23 operate or how they handle their situations.

24
25 I think it would be good in the long
26 run.

27
28 I support this.

29
30 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch.
33 Yeah, I think it would be a great idea for the caribou
34 working group. And I will say you guys always say
35 we're short of money, now how is this going to go about
36 if we have meeting, are we going to have it one year in
37 Fairbanks, one year at Kotzebue and one year at North
38 Slope?

39
40 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

43
44 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
45 Presently there are not funds dedicated towards
46 bringing these various groups together to meet in
47 person so right now the thought would be to have these
48 discussions telephonically by teleconference. And that
49 could be done whenever any of the participants feel
50

1 that that's necessary. The intent is not to create
2 more work or more bureaucracy, but to be responsible
3 for what the Councils need.

4
5 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach.

8
9 MR. MOTO: Mr. Chair.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Calvin.

12
13 MR. MOTO: I was wondering to know when
14 we're talking about caribou how is it possible that it
15 would drop so far down, maybe some biologist could let
16 me know. Because I remember one time when they're
17 declining of caribou they found out that some of the
18 Western caribou were going east instead of southwest.
19 So how much of a -- where they -- when they give a
20 count do they combine the Happy Valley plus the Western
21 caribou herd together or is it just, you know, we have --
22 actually we have two separate types of caribou, we got
23 the Happy Valley caribou which go primarily to the
24 eastern part and we have the caribou that come to our
25 area. And all of a sudden now we're getting caribou
26 going further south and some getting lost on ice flows.
27 How much are they allowing for that. Even though you
28 talk about the increasing of predators you got to take
29 all the other things into consideration, not just the
30 fact that it's -- they're being overhunted or they're
31 being predator killed or what. But, you know, the
32 calves are very vulnerable to predators so how much --
33 so I would like to find out what -- do they take all
34 these into consideration or they just lump up all in
35 one.

36
37 Thank you.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Calvin.

40
41 Yeah, go ahead.

42
43 MR. HANSEN: May I address Mr. Moto?

44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, come up to the
46 mic and turn the mic on and your name please, for the
47 record.

48
49 MR. HANSEN: Mr. Moto, this is Alex

50

1 Hansen. I'm the caribou biologist for the Western
2 Arctic caribou herd, Alaska Department of Fish and Game
3 here in Kotzebue.

4
5 And I may have to ask you to rephrase a
6 couple of your questions, but to address your initial
7 question when we count the caribou we just take into
8 account the specific herd units or specific herds. If
9 I may for instance when we do the Western Arctic herd
10 we wait for the herd to come together in an aggregation
11 and we know that those individuals are part of the
12 Western Arctic herd because we have a certain number of
13 collared individuals within that herd. And we can
14 define that by, you know, where they spend their time
15 during the year. I hope that answers some of your
16 question.

17
18 And another question that you had
19 mentioned as you wondering about other, you know,
20 causes of mortality and you mentioned the calves. And
21 we are currently working on a calf mortality study and
22 I can speak to that a little bit later, but, you know,
23 we are very proactive about that, we're interested in
24 finding out all mortality causes to the Western Arctic
25 caribou herd. And we are finding, you know, that there
26 is certainly some mortality that's caused by predators
27 and other things as well.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Calvin.

30
31 MR. MOTO: Are you also considering the
32 fact that how many caribou are taken commercially or,
33 you know, because we never really find out how much
34 commercial -- how many caribou the commercial hunters
35 take. We've always given a like well, you know. So
36 this is something else that I was thinking about, you
37 know, like trophy hunters, stuff like that.

38
39 MR. HANSEN: No, if you're speaking
40 about commercial harvest that would -- you know, there
41 is no legal way to commercially harvest and sale
42 caribou. So that would be I guess not an issue, but,
43 yeah, we certainly deal with the non-local hunters as
44 well. Currently the -- you know, the non-local hunters
45 harvest a very small component of the population and,
46 you know, it's probably declined over the past couple
47 years, but probably only a few hundred animals are
48 harvested by non-local hunters each year.

49
50

1 MR. MOTO: Thank you.
2
3 MR. HANSEN: Thank you.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
6 Thank you.
7
8 So are we done on number 10, Zach.
9
10 MR. STEVENSON: To clarify -- through
11 the Chair. To clarify I -- we have a motion regarding
12 this item to adopt the formation of the caribou working
13 group. I don't know if we have a motion or a second or
14 a vote on that, I think we're lacking a vote.
15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We do have a
17 motion on the floor.
18
19 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.
22
23 MR. MITCHELL: Could I ask Zach a
24 question before the motion?
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.
27
28 MR. MITCHELL: Zach, are you sure
29 there'll be funding in the future for this working
30 group or there's people that could look for funding for
31 this working group?
32
33 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Enoch.
34 Through the Chair. I'm not in a position to speak to
35 future funding, but if -- my recommendation might be if
36 this body is something that's important to this region
37 perhaps adding that as an agenda item in the future at
38 some point into your annual report so that that
39 information could be brought to the attention of the
40 Federal Subsistence Board.
41
42 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach.
45 Does that answer your question?
46
47 (No comments)
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: To clar -- we ought
50

1 to start with teleconference for now until they
2 eventually work into it, the.....
3
4 MR. MITCHELL: Oh, okay.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:for funding
7 purposes under layman terms.
8
9 Okay. Number 11, new business.
10
11 Go -- Zach, you asked for a -- sorry
12 about that. The motion -- there is a motion -- asking
13 for a motion to start this caribou working group.
14
15 Go ahead, Enoch.
16
17 MR. MITCHELL: I move to support this
18 caribou working group.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Motion on the floor.
21
22 Any second.
23
24 MR. MOTO: Second.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: There's a second on
27 the floor. All in favor signify.....
28
29 MR. COMMACK: Discussion.
30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.
32
33 MR. COMMACK: Yeah. When we're talking
34 about a caribou working group is Vern the Chair of the
35 caribou working group?
36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: No, this one is a
38 different working group, it's a completely different
39 working group they're trying to organize. For your --
40 Vern is in the Western Arctic Caribou Working Group.
41
42 MR. COMMACK: Oh.
43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.
45
46 MR. MOTO: Yeah, I was going to say.
47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: To clarify, he's the
49 Chairman for Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group.
50

1 MR. COMMACK: So this.....
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This is just a
4 caribou working group.
5
6 MR. COMMACK: Oh.
7
8 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach. You
11 understand?
12
13 MR. COMMACK: So what we're going to do
14 is propose to have two caribou working groups, the
15 Western and the -- what the.....
16
17 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: The one you talk
20 about, the one Vern's on is always funded mainly by
21 the.....
22
23 MR. COMMACK: State.
24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:BLM. No, our
26 State hardly ever put money into it. It come in mostly
27 -- correct me if I'm wrong from someone out there, most
28 of the funding coming out of BLM, the Park Service and
29 the Selawik Wildlife Refuge.
30
31 Correct me if I'm wrong someone.
32
33 Go ahead. I know it don't come all
34 from the State.
35
36 MR. SEPPI: Mr. Chair, Members of the
37 Board, Bruce Seppi with BLM.
38
39 I've been tasked with putting together
40 the contract for the Western Arctic Caribou Herd
41 Working Group meeting that is funded by Fish and
42 Wildlife Service, Park Service and BLM. That meeting
43 is very expensive to put on and it's not a -- it's not
44 a given. And so when you talk about making another
45 meeting you want to consider what it takes to put that
46 together. But right now the Western Arctic Caribou
47 Herd Working Group is Federally funded.
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, I forgot that
50

1 was Federally funded and hardly from the State.
2
3 Go ahead, Zach. I'll give to you,
4 Calvin, later. Zach.
5
6 MR. MOTO: I was wondering on this
7 caribou working group how come we don't have anybody
8 from our regional subsistence on that working group so
9 we could have better knowledge of what's going on with
10 the caribou herd?
11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I think our -- Vern
13 will have to answer that, you're talking about the
14 Western Arctic caribou herd.
15
16 MR. MOTO: Okay. Thank you, Vern.
17
18 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, your
19 representative from Deering is Ron. So Enoch and I are
20 on the working group too.
21
22 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.
23
24 MR. CLEVELAND: Your representative is
25 Ron Moto.
26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
28
29 MR. CLEVELAND: And he attends
30 your.....
31
32 MR. BALLOT: Attamuk.
33
34 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
35
36 MR. MOTO: I didn't know that.
37
38 MR. STEVENSON: Responding to the
39 comment from Member Commack, the idea behind.....
40
41 MR. BALLOT: Hello, Attamuk.
42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Sorry about
44 that, Zach. Go ahead, radioland.
45
46 MR. CLEVELAND: Turn that mic on.
47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, you could
49 speak. Turn the mic on, please. Yeah, thank you. Go
50

1 ahead. Go ahead whoever's on radioland, you have the
2 floor.

3
4 MR. BALLOT: Yeah, Ron Moto is the
5 Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group primary --
6 he's the presenter and I'm his alternate. I've never
7 had to go, he's always been able to attend these
8 working group meetings so I -- I'm sorry if I couldn't
9 be there, but I just wanted to point that out.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Percy.
12 Good to hear your voice.

13
14 Go ahead, Zach.

15
16 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
17 Responding to Member Commack's question a moment ago,
18 the purpose behind or I should say the reason this
19 whole discussion started was because there was concern
20 amongst the various councils, all who rely -- who
21 represent Federal users, Federally-qualified users
22 throughout unit 23 about being able to share
23 information in real time as things are changing with
24 other councils. But it was separate from the caribou
25 working herd group that's funded, that's got money
26 behind it. And the thought was how do we do that. And
27 the way the Federal system is set up is that unless
28 that is done in a scheduled public way there won't --
29 it can't be done unless you form a working group on the
30 record that will allow that to happen. Not to be
31 funded, it's a much smaller thing, just for the
32 regional councils.

33
34 So that's -- I hope that provides some
35 clarification for your question.

36
37 MR. COMMACK: Yes. Yes.

38
39 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.

40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

42
43 MR. STEVENSON: So in the Western
44 Interior region when they addressed this topic about a
45 week ago, they considered a motion to form a group,
46 form a working group, caribou working group, and then
47 they also decided who would serve on that group amongst
48 their Council.

49
50

1 So I just wanted to invite that for
2 consideration.

3
4 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Then we'll put
7 it under the next agenda item who will represent this
8 working group out of this Council. And the way I see
9 it right now I think we all should call in and talk
10 about this together with the Fairbanks, North Slope and
11 Nome area. And also I -- sorry about that I got up to
12 specify something that -- the funding, Vern, is getting
13 harder and harder for them too. So I don't know what
14 the future on the Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working
15 Group that the State will ever -- there's no funding.
16 I don't think you guys will have any meeting. I'm just
17 -- I just verified with him and we all are getting --
18 they all -- everybody's getting cut and funding
19 services are getting harder and harder. And this
20 caribou working group I think that's the way it might
21 have to go in the future. That's just the way I see it
22 and I will support it and it was vote on earlier that,
23 yes, they would like to see -- start a caribou working
24 group, not the Western Arctic caribou. To clarify not
25 the Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group, but the
26 caribou working group, different title completely just
27 to make sure you guys understand.

28
29 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.

32
33 MR. CLEVELAND: Wouldn't that do a
34 conflict with the Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working
35 Group and we got representatives from the whole state.
36 We got a rep from the.....

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

39
40 MR. CLEVELAND:Kuskokwim. As far
41 as Allakaket, all over North Slope. Would it be a
42 conflict with our Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working
43 Group because it cost a lot of money to get a meeting
44 together. It -- and we get sort of funding from
45 different entities. And -- and it's good -- and we're
46 having a meeting December 13 and 14.....

47
48 MR. SEPPI: That's right.

49
50

1 MR. CLEVELAND:in Anchorage and
2 you guys are welcome to come over to listen.

3
4 Thank you.

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead,
7 Seppi, you can use that.

8
9 MR. SEPPI: Mr. Chair, Bruce Seppi,
10 BLM. The meeting in December which is -- we'll talk
11 about later, but in -- that's funded this year, but
12 it's always hard to come up with those funds. In fact,
13 this meeting this year is funded for \$20,000 less than
14 it was in the last two years. So and we expect major
15 cuts to our budget after this year. So you guys are
16 talking about having other caribou working groups, this
17 unit 23 working group or the Western Arctic Caribou
18 Herd Working Group if of course only for the Western
19 Arctic herd and you guys are talking about Mulchatna or
20 statewide herds or I'm not -- I'm kind of scratching my
21 head a little bit about where you're going with this
22 and how you want to do it.

23
24 We also have the Unit 23 Working Group
25 which was usually in Kotzebue and funded by the state.
26 And I'm not sure of the status of that or if it's still
27 meeting and we've always asked the question, do you
28 want to continue with these working groups and the
29 answer has always been yes. And I believe that's a
30 good answer because a lot of good information gets -- I
31 mean, it's about herd management, that's what we want
32 to do here, but it is very expensive to bring people to
33 Anchorage or wherever, we've got to find a way to make
34 it cheaper, to make it more efficient, to get the
35 management and the discussion done without spending as
36 much money as we're spending now because I don't think
37 it's sustainable.

38
39 But now I'm a little bit -- I don't
40 know where you guys want to go when you're talking
41 about a statewide, including the Mulchatna herd.

42
43 I mean, the Western Arctic and the
44 Mulchatna herd don't overlap their areas.

45
46 And so I see a reason for maybe the
47 Western Interior RAC to have a working group for
48 Mulchatna, but -- and you guys continue with Northwest
49 Arctic, but I'm unclear where you guys want to go with
50

1 this and just the fact you can get together a working
2 group really doesn't solve a lot of issues, you still
3 have major issues up here with Northwest Arctic caribou
4 or am I missing something here?

5

6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

7

8 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
9 Responding to the question from Member Cleveland and
10 responding to the question from Mr. Seppi, what the
11 North Slope and Western Interior Councils voted to
12 adopt was not to repeat what is already in place by the
13 Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group.

14

15 The working group has money, they've
16 got money behind them, maybe not as much as we would
17 like, but there's money there.

18

19 What's being proposed now has no money
20 associated with it. There would be no in person
21 meetings involved at all, it would be a teleconference,
22 not scheduled, but when the Council or this body says
23 that it needs to talk. And the purpose and rationale
24 as I mentioned earlier was simply to provide a means
25 for councils whose rep -- whose -- who they serve,
26 their subsistence users and rely on caribou, to share
27 information with each other when they need to do so.
28 That's their only purpose, to share information,
29 nothing more, nothing less, among other councils, no
30 one else, just among their fellow councils who are
31 along and make use of shared subsistence resources, in
32 this care caribou. That's it. They can meet whenever
33 they want, they can address whatever they want to,
34 they're not taking action, they don't have the
35 authority to do so, rather they're sharing information
36 that can be brought back to the Council in a timely
37 way. Because right now we don't have the means to do
38 that, when timely issues need to be considered we need
39 to be able to share information and currently we can't
40 do that without the formation of a working group.
41 That's the intent.

42

43 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

44

45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Thank
46 you.

47

48 MR. MOTO: Mr. Chair.

49

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Calvin.

2
3 MR. MOTO: I was fired to see the fact
4 that we talk one time about combining North Slope,
5 Arctic region and Nome together to have a RAC meeting.
6 I always fired we didn't get to do that because of
7 budget, you know. I think if we met with -- as one
8 group we could hash over and find out what the -- what
9 we could really do because we could say we got to do
10 this and they want to do something else. But I was
11 hoping that that would materialize and too bad it
12 didn't.

13
14 Thank you.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Calvin.
17 Thank you. Calvin is right, I think it need to meet
18 with the rest of the Council from our migration route
19 of the caribou together out of the Council even if you
20 have to start off with teleconference and work out from
21 there. Not to take over for the Western Arctic caribou
22 herd, but to address our issues in our Federal lands
23 the way they migrate.

24
25 Thank you.

26
27 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chair.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Kramer.

30
31 MR. KRAMER: You know, with this
32 working group, you know, the key issue here is funding.
33 It was brought up to my attention that, you know, what
34 we need to concentrate on is the Western Arctic caribou
35 herd/Teshekpuk herd and their range. So it should be
36 within those RACs that should be able to, you know, be
37 on this group. I think the key things there is, you
38 know, everybody's talking about funding is why can't we
39 when there's a Northwest Arctic, you know why don't we
40 have a North Slope RAC rep here, why don't we have a
41 Seward Pen rep here or Western Interior, you know, or
42 either have them on the phone because we share that
43 caribou herd, that caribou herd is a vital portion to
44 all of these RACs. I think it would be better if we
45 were all to be able to attend each other's meetings and
46 be able to sit down and be able to talk about caribou
47 issues. You know, because, I mean, like Vern said, you
48 know, there's already a caribou working group, why do
49 we need another one, why can't we just sit in -- why
50

1 can't we put a seat in on theirs, see if they --
2 they'll allow a Federal RAC seat on theirs, someone to
3 represent the RACs.

4
5 Also, you know, why can't we attend
6 other rural advisory council meetings that serve the
7 Western Arctic caribou herd that are, you know, within
8 the Western Arctic caribou herd.

9
10 And the other one -- the other thing is
11 is I think we have a motion on the table, don't we?

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

14
15 MR. KRAMER: Okay.

16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And it was already --
18 correct me if I'm wrong, did every -- did we vote on it
19 or not?

20
21 MR. KRAMER: It was in discussion.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Oh.

24
25 MR. STEVENSON: We're discussing this.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Still under
28 discussion?

29
30 MR. MOTO: Yeah.

31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're done. Are we
33 going to discuss it because we need to vote on
34 this.....

35
36 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

39
40 MR. MITCHELL: Here I'm getting the
41 picture of a fish/caribou working group who'll be
42 dealing mainly with our RAC members and other RAC
43 members to work together, mainly people. So and the
44 Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group just deal
45 with the Western Arctic caribou herd. I think that's
46 the picture I'm getting that the Western Arctic Caribou
47 Herd Working Group will work with the Western Arctic
48 caribou herd and the caribou working group here will be
49 working with more like people working together for the
50

1 caribou.
2
3 Am I correct?
4
5 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.
8
9 Go ahead, Zach.
10
11 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
12 Responding to Member Mitchell's question.
13
14 Again the major differences between
15 what's on the table right now and considered by this
16 RAC and what currently exists for the Western Arctic
17 Caribou Herd Working Group is that what's being
18 proposed now would not be an in person meeting, there
19 isn't money to do that, it would be a teleconference, a
20 telephone call. And that would occur whenever this
21 body felt that was necessary. And unlike the working
22 group which has people from many different places,
23 what's being considered right now on the table would be
24 just the Council members, just this Council and other
25 RACs that choose to develop and participate in that
26 working group.
27
28 And right now there are four councils
29 all considering this idea. And again the purpose would
30 be only.....
31
32 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.
33
34 MR. STEVENSON:only to share
35 information.
36
37 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Thanks, Zach.
40
41 Go ahead, Percy.
42
43 MR. BALLOT: Yeah, I'm just wondering
44 and listening in on the conversation and I don't know
45 what -- how many years, but we have a system in place
46 to -- a concern for subsistence issues and one of them
47 is the caribou which is very important for all of us in
48 our region. And when we share our information and we
49 decide to take recommendations to the Western Arctic
50

1 caribou board, Federal Subsistence Board and it's a
2 system that works and knowing that we're really running
3 out of money to have meetings and create another
4 bureaucracy it's going to be kind of hard or another
5 layer of people watching out for the caribou is going
6 to be kind of hard.

7
8 If we're talking about having future
9 meetings maybe audio now, anybody can have an audio
10 system where we use Ipads and stuff, it seems to work.
11 Not quite as good, but it's a working -- with
12 technology now we could be able to share our stuff.
13 And when there's something real bad if there's no
14 funding, I -- we have the borough and the -- we have
15 Maniilaq and we all have -- and NANA has committees and
16 maybe we need to utilize them for travel when we need
17 people that have to attend meeting and take part in
18 recommendations or discussing the guarding of caribou,
19 we got to start looking ahead about how are we going to
20 plan to address what's going on down the line with no
21 funding and stuff.

22

23 Thank you.

24

25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

26

27 Thank you, Percy, we heard you.

28

29 We had a motion on the floor, we have
30 this question on it. And start to -- right now it's
31 going to be all teleconference for now looks like. And
32 so we need to vote on this to see if anyone wanted to
33 be part of it.

34

35 All in favor signify by saying aye.

36

37 IN UNISON: Aye.

38

39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I hear ayes. I hear
40 one, two, four, five. I see -- I'm calling five ayes
41 -- I didn't see Vern because I was turning the other
42 way. Okay. Looks like it passes. What I saw was five
43 ayes and I didn't see any nays on it.

44

45 MR. CLEVELAND: Nay.

46

47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We have one nay.

48

49 MR. STEVENSON: We're missing one vote.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. I never hear
2 -- I never see -- you were aye?

3
4 MS. MOTO: Yeah.

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Sorry about
7 that. I didn't see your -- because it's hard to see,
8 you're trying to turn on -- in both ways.

9
10 Okay. Percy, which way you vote, I
11 need to hear which way you go?

12
13 MR. BALLOT: Can you restate the.....

14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: What they are trying
16 to do -- what we're trying to do is start a working
17 group teleconference with North Slope, Barrow and Nome
18 on this caribou working group. It's all going to be
19 all teleconference for now and we need to start setting
20 it up.

21
22 MR. BALLOT: The system's already in
23 place to have that be the -- another caribou herd
24 working group so I'd say no.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This is just for RAC
27 members, not the Western Arctic caribou herd.

28
29 The way I hear it from the BLM earlier
30 in this winter meeting is already funded and next year
31 going to have a major cut, going to have a major cut
32 and the Western Arctic caribou herd might be -- it's
33 going to be cut, we'll find out this winter how much
34 they're going to cut it. If it still exists it's got
35 to have money. Let's put it that way. It might not,
36 the Western Arctic caribou herd will be cut heavily.
37 That's all I could tell you. I'm not in charge of the
38 funding or anything, but that's what I'm hearing from
39 the agencies. And I think this work -- caribou working
40 group eventually might have to take over and it's going
41 to be coming from the Council members from the Federal
42 Advisory Boards and the migration route of the caribou.

43
44 MR. BALLOT: As for the -- well, I
45 don't think the funding's out there or how it now works
46 and stuff like that and because we already have in
47 place and so I guess I'll vote no.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We have two
50

1 noes and six yes. Two no, six yes. Record that.

2

3

Thank you.

4

5

6

7

8

9

Okay. With the caribou working group done, I think it's close to lunch, I think we should all take a break for lunch. At least try not to eat your caribou right now, we need to work on it. Let's eat fish this afternoon.

10

11

Let's go on break until 1:15.

12

13

(Off record)

14

15

(On record)

16

17

18

19

20

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Could we all get seated please, so we can start -- reopen this meeting. I'd like to call this meeting back to order.

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

We're all here except for Calvin Moto, we have a quorum so we'll reopen the meeting at 1:25 in the afternoon. And we're on number 10A. On 10A we need to identify who's going to represent this working -- caribou working group from out of this Council. So we need to have someone representing us on the caribou working group that was North Slope, Nome and Fairbanks area. And we need to have someone from here, from this working group.

30

31

For now I think we could.....

32

33

MR. CLEVELAND: Okay.

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:for now I -- my idea -- this -- I think for now to make -- while -- to get it started, to be all comfortable, it's just going to be teleconference and now I -- why can't all of us just call in and -- at that date and later on we could decide who should represent us if that's okay with the Council.

42

43

MR. MITCHELL: To.....

44

45

46

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Enoch.

47

48

49

MR. MITCHELL: I'd like to nominate Mike Kramer.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Turn your mic on.
2
3 MR. MITCHELL: I said I'd like to
4 nominate Mike Kramer.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Mike Kramer has been
7 nominated. Do I have a second.
8
9 Vern.
10
11 MR. CLEVELAND: Nominate Louie Commack.
12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I need -- okay.
14
15 Do I have a second for Mike Kramer.
16
17 Go ahead, Vern.
18
19 MR. CLEVELAND: I nominate Louie
20 Commack.
21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'll second Louie
23 Commack. We need to spread it out a little bit for the
24 caribou working group.
25
26 MR. COMMACK: Okay.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. I hope it
29 don't conflict with your Maniilaq. Okay. Louie will
30 be -- okay. But anybody, I would recommend if
31 anybody.....
32
33 MR. COMMACK: Right.
34
35 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:wanted to listen
36 in.....
37
38 MR. COMMACK: Right. Everybody's
39 welcome.
40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:to listen in
42 since it get first started.
43
44 MR. CLEVELAND: How many you need?
45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We need only one.
47
48 MR. CLEVELAND: Oh, just one.
49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.
2
3 MR. STEVENSON: You can have as many as
4 you want.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Or you -- or you
7 could nominate as many as you want. We can.....
8
9 MR. MITCHELL: All right.
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:I'll nominate
12 everybody here for now.
13
14 MR. MITCHELL: I'd like.....
15
16 MR. STEVENSON: It's allowed.
17
18 MR. MITCHELL:Mike Kramer added.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We can have
21 Mike Kramer, I'll second Mike Kramer then.
22
23 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.
24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That way they would
26 be together.
27
28 MR. COMMACK: No problem.
29
30 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Is that.....
33
34 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.
37
38 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, that's good. I
39 mean, I was just saying, yeah, okay.
40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. You want to
42 close the nominations?
43
44 MR. CLEVELAND: I make a motion to
45 close the nominations.
46
47 MR. MITCHELL: Second.
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Closing for -- we
50

1 have Louie and Kramer. Reason why I say Kramer as his
2 first name, I always tried to mix up and his brother so
3 he's Kramer to me.
4
5 For these two, all in signify by saying
6 aye.
7
8 IN UNISON: Aye.
9
10 (No opposing votes)
11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Okay.
13
14 Now back to number 11.
15
16 MR. STEVENSON: Sorry, Mr. Chair. Just
17 to clarify that vote, that was one, two, three,
18 four.....
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Six.
21
22 MR. STEVENSON:six in favor?
23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.
25
26 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: There were six in
29 favor. Calvin's still on his way.
30
31 Okay. Back to the agenda. We'll go to
32 item 11, new business.
33
34 Go ahead, Zach. Fill in for me on
35 this.....
36
37 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.....
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:on the wildlife
40 proposals.
41
42 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
43 For those in the room and on the teleconference, we're
44 now on agenda item 11, new business. And we're going
45 to Address item A, wildlife proposals. And that is
46 being delivered by both the Office of Subsistence
47 Management, Wildlife and Anthropology staff.
48
49 And first on the proposals is wildlife
50

1 proposal 18-41/42 which addressees modifying the season
2 dates, sex restrictions and hunt areas for moose in
3 unit 23, as well as the establishing a bull only season
4 and an any moose winter registration hunt with a set
5 quota for moose in unit 23. Addressing that proposal
6 is Megan Klosterman, a biologist with the Office of
7 Subsistence Management in Anchorage.

8

9

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10

11

12

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. And Walt
will be right after her, right.

13

14

15

MR. STEVENSON: When we come to -- when
we come to public testimony, item six.

16

17

18

19

20

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
We're going to -- right behind our name is our -- the
procedures we go through on the proposals, we're on
number 1.

21

22

Go ahead.

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

MS. KLOSTERMAN: Good afternoon,
Council Chair and members of the Council. As was
stated my name is Megan Klosterman and I'm a wildlife
biologist with the Office of Subsistence Management.
Today I will be reviewing wildlife proposal WP 18-41
and 42 which were analyzed together because they cover
the same topic. Proposal WP 18-41/42 can be found on
page 17 of your meeting materials.

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

The proponent of WP 18-41 was the
Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council
and requests the moose season be modified throughout
unit 23 to a two month cow season of November 1st
through December 31st, the bull season be shortened by
three months from July 1st through March 31st to July
1st through December 31st and the Federal and State
hunt areas be aligned.

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

The proponent of WP 18-42 was Louie
Cusack of Chugiak, Alaska. And he requests that the
moose seasons be modified throughout unit 23 to include
a winter any moose Federal registration permit hunt
with a harvest quota aimed at reducing total cow
harvest by 20 percent and that the harvest limit be
modified from one moose to one bull during the rest of
the season.

1 At the January, 2017 Alaska Board of
2 Game meeting the antlerless moose season in unit 23 was
3 modified to a bag limit of one antlered moose due to
4 conservation concerns. At the March, 2017 Northwest
5 Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council public
6 meeting the Alaska Department of Fish and Game
7 mentioned that the nonresident moose hunt was canceled
8 for the current regulatory year due to conservation
9 concern.

10
11 In April of 2017 the Federal
12 Subsistence Board rejected temporary special action 17-
13 02 which requested that the Federal lands in unit 23 be
14 closed to all non-Federally-qualified users for the
15 moose harvest during the 2017/2018 regulatory year.

16
17 The current moose population for unit
18 23 is estimated at 7,500 moose. This is below the
19 overall population goal of 8,100 to 10,000 moose for
20 unit 23. The most recent data which was collected
21 between 2010 and 2017 and actually I think we might
22 have some updated data that can be reported by ADF&G
23 and the Park Service later shows adult moose densities
24 in unit 23 ranging from 0.03 to 0.44 moose per square
25 mile. And the recent calf/cow ratios ranged from four
26 to 24 calves per 100 cows depending on the survey area.
27 According to harvest reports 165 moose, 144 of which
28 were bulls and 21 cows, were harvested in unit 23 in
29 2015 and 85 of these were taken by local resident users
30 in 2014. Community household surveys show that harvest
31 reporting among local users in unit 23 is generally
32 low. After reviewing community household surveys ADF&G
33 estimated that approximately 300 moose are harvested
34 annually in unit 23.

35
36 The moose population is in decline
37 across most of unit 23. These proposals could reduce
38 overall harvest by shortening the moose season and
39 reducing the harvest of cows which are key to
40 population growth. Creation and enforcement of a
41 Federal registration permit could provide more accurate
42 harvest reporting among Federally-qualified subsistence
43 users in unit 23 who are estimated to be responsible
44 for as much as 73 percent of the moose harvest in the
45 unit, but it could also lead to greater confusion and
46 an additional decrease in harvest reporting.

47
48 It may be worth considering eliminating
49 the antlerless season and changing the overall harvest
50

1 limit to one antlered bull. This would simply
2 regulations and could aid in conserving cow moose which
3 are essential to maintaining a healthy moose
4 population. This modification would result in
5 additional reduction of harvest opportunity to
6 Federally-qualified subsistence users and therefore
7 further discussion with the relevant councils and the
8 public would be warranted.

9
10 So for now the OSM preliminary
11 conclusion is to support proposal WP 18-41 with
12 modification to change the harvest limit to one
13 antlered bull July 1 through December 31st and create a
14 November 1st through December 31 antlerless season by
15 Federal registration permit and delegate authority to
16 the Federal land manager to determine quotas and to
17 close the season via a delegation of authority letter
18 and then take no action on proposal WP 18-42. Changing
19 to antlered bull and antlerless moose seasons rather
20 than bull and cow seasons helps to reduce the risk of
21 inadvertent cow harvest outside of the antlerless moose
22 season. Limiting the antlerless moose harvest to a two
23 month season and determining a quota could limit the
24 harvest of antlerless moose and aid in increasing the
25 moose population in the unit. Combining Federal hunt
26 areas to align with State areas could reduce user
27 confusion in unit 23. For this conclusion we would
28 need to discuss who would receive the delegation of
29 authority to do those.

30
31 And that is all I have, Mr. Chair, and
32 I am open to taking questions.

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Okay.
35 We'll go to number 2, report on Board consultation with
36 the tribes and ANCSA corporations.

37
38 Any, Zach?

39
40 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, I don't have
41 information in front of me at the moment regarding
42 tribes and ANCSA corporations. I'm double checking
43 that now, but I have nothing to share at this moment.

44
45 I will report back if I have any
46 further information.

47
48 Thank you.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. On WP 18-41
2 and 42, number 3, agency comments, ADF&G.

3
4 MR. SAITO: Mr. Chair, my name's
5 Brandon Saito, Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

6
7 MS. ROBISON: Mr. Chair, my name's
8 Hillary Robison with the National Park Service.

9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. You have
11 the floor.

12
13 MR. SAITO: We work together on a lot
14 of this information, putting a lot of the data together
15 for these. So I guess it didn't -- we just had some
16 updates.

17
18 MS. ROBISON: So we have some updates
19 here from the lower Kobuk/Squirrel River area. We did
20 a fall composition count last fall looking at the
21 number of cows and bulls and yearlings in the
22 population. And then we did an abundance estimate in
23 the spring of 2017 in the lower Kobuk/Squirrel River
24 area. The last time that that population was surveyed
25 was five years prior to that in the fall of 2011 and
26 the spring of 2012. Over that period of time there was
27 a 40 percent decline in moose estimates over that five
28 year period. Previous to that in the fall of 2015 and
29 the spring of 2016 the Park Service and Fish and Game
30 worked on -- we did a composition survey in the fall of
31 2015 and a count in spring of 2016. And we found that
32 there was -- there were fewer moose in that area than
33 previously. And the surveys prior to that were five
34 years ahead of -- were five years prior so 2010.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
37 Are you done?

38
39 MS. ROBISON: That's just -- yeah,
40 that's our brief update. So overall between those two
41 survey areas the numbers have declined. And we're set
42 to do another survey, a composition survey, this fall,
43 this November hopefully if the snow keeps falling and
44 we have good condition in the lower Noatak area. And
45 then in the spring we'll do an abundance estimate in
46 the same area. So we don't have data from -- the data
47 we have on the lower Noatak was five -- from five years
48 ago, but we're set to do that again this year.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Is that
2 -- are you -- okay. Now we need to hear from the
3 Federal. I'm just going through the process of them,
4 I'm not making -- okay. Are you two done, please?

5
6 MR. SAITO: Yeah, the.....

7
8 MS. ROBISON: Brandon's from the State
9 and I'm from Federal and we work together on these
10 surveys so we just came up together to report the
11 information together to you.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. Go
14 ahead. Now we need to hear from the Federal, someone
15 was coming up.

16
17 Zach, maybe you could put up one more
18 chair up there and.....

19
20 Thank you.

21
22 MS. ATKINSON: Hannah Atkinson with the
23 National Park Service. I have comment from the Cape
24 Krusenstern SRC and the Kobuk Valley SRC. I don't know
25 if that's what you were looking for, but the comments
26 that we have from them, the Cape Krusenstern
27 Subsistence Resource Commission voted to support the
28 proposal and the Kobuk Valley National Park Subsistence
29 Resource Commission voted to support 41 because it
30 aligns the Federal bull in this hunt with the State
31 bull in this hunt and does not limit the opportunity
32 for harvesting antlerless moose in the fall and winter
33 season which is important to people.

34
35 And both Commissions decided to take no
36 action on WP 18-42.

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. And I'm
39 sorry, I should have asked.

40
41 Saito, are you -- does the State
42 support this or not?

43
44 MS. ROBISON: Which one, 41-42?

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
47 I'm just going through the procedure.

48
49 Now I need to hear from the tribal
50

1 governments. Anybody here from the tribes.

2

3

You hear anything, Zach.

4

5

6

7

8

9

MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair. I do not have that information at the moment. I'm going to -- I'm working to confirm whether or not we have any comments from tribes or ANCSA corporations, but I don't have that information in front of me at the moment.

10

11

12

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13

14

15

16

17

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. And for the -- anybody hear from the advisory groups, other regional councils, Fish and Game Advisory Committees, Subsistence -- SRCs, do I hear anything on this proposed WP 18-41 and 42?

18

19

20

MS. OKADA: Mr. Chairman.

21

22

23

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, radio.

24

25

Name, please.

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

MS. OKADA: Mr. Chair, this is Marcy Okada. And the Gates of the Arctic National Park Subsistence Resource Commission is in support of proposal WP 18-41. In the upper Kobuk the bulls enter rut around the middle part of the September -- middle part of September and no local bull users will shoot bulls after that. So this proposal still allows for a bull season after they come out of rut.

34

35

36

37

And the SRC has no comment for WP 18-42.

38

39

Thank you.

40

41

42

43

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

44

45

Summary of written public comments.

46

47

48

49

50

MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Reviewing the proposal, we do not have any public written comments regarding wildlife proposal 18-41 dash 42.

1 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. From the
4 public.

5
6 Walter, go ahead. Walter Sampson.

7
8 MR. SAMPSON: Are you addressing each
9 proposal or can I give sort of a overview of -- in
10 general about the proposals because I'm not supporting
11 or objecting to some of the proposal. So I sort of
12 want to give a perspective in regards to the process
13 that is taken through to bring proposals to the table.

14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.

18
19 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair and
20 through our LT representative. I just want to confirm
21 are we allowed to provide more general comment at this
22 stage, is that permissible.

23
24 MR. McKEE: I mean, we can, but right
25 now, I mean, it -- depending on the content of what his
26 comments are, I mean, we're kind of addressing each
27 proposal in turn. So, but it's totally at the Chair's
28 discretion.

29
30 MR. SAMPSON: Well, I guess it's not
31 going to work then if that's what -- the intent is to
32 go proposal by proposal. I don't want to convolute
33 what the discussion that you're having and confuse
34 people.

35
36 So at this time maybe I'll just decline
37 not to say anything in regards to those proposals.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. And maybe when
40 you think it's right for -- you have any comments on
41 any of the proposals I can call on you if you're around
42 and just sort of, you know, make it less confused.

43
44 MR. SAMPSON: Well, in this case I
45 guess maybe I'll just generally comment on the moose
46 proposal which certainly is being supported by
47 different regional advisory groups.

48
49 I think we've heard the report n
50

1 regards to the biologists in regards to moose on a
2 decline. And I would first of all like to know what is
3 really the definition of decline. If decline is such
4 that the health of the moose herd is going to be
5 interrupted or hurt then I -- two things can happen.
6 One is really restrict a hunt for moose because for the
7 last five years I've been hunting moose and I see the
8 decline of moose already the first two years. Usually
9 I go out on a hunt, my first day, first two days of a
10 hunt I will get a bull moose, but for the last two
11 years I've gotten nothing that I've hunted five to
12 seven days each time. And which shows to me there is a
13 decline on the moose population. And not only that
14 there's more take of moose than there used to be
15 before. And I can see that because of the very fact
16 that the caribou herd has declined. So the hunters are
17 now converting over to moose hunt. And I think that's
18 why the moose herd is certainly on the decline. We
19 heard the report of a 40 percent decline and these are
20 going to be -- they're going to continue to decline.

21
22 The bad part is the impacts that are
23 made to the local community of each village. And some
24 folks are dependent on moose, some on caribou. And it
25 seems that every year the community seems to be now
26 more dependent on moose than caribou because the
27 caribou's been late migrating south, more south.

28
29 And so I -- as far as the process is
30 concerned I would like to hear from the villages in
31 regards to their thoughts and how much it's impacting
32 their livelihood by placing restrictions on them for
33 taking of resource.

34
35 Thank you.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Walter for
38 your information that's what we've been hearing on our
39 Council meetings from Kobuk area and Noatak area that
40 moose is declining overall. And I think it would have
41 been better for you to understand that. When they gave
42 a report of how many moose they should have given
43 numbers out instead of 40 percent of whatever moose
44 they got. We could be talking about 10,000 caribou and
45 40 percent decline.

46
47 MR. SAMPSON: Yeah.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's -- I

50

1 understand your part. So I think we need numbers too.
2 That way the public could understand better because me,
3 I've been here for 20 years I know what they're talking
4 about, but for the public -- you know what I'm saying.

5
6 MR. SAMPSON: Just to follow-up I
7 guess.

8
9 If discussions are going to occur here
10 in Kotzebue I would suggest also that either the staff
11 or several of the members can take all these proposals
12 out to the villages so the villages can understand what
13 it is that they're being restricted to or what they're
14 being open to so they can fully understand what they're
15 really getting into. Because anytime you place a
16 restriction or a process that would -- people have to
17 follow through from the State side or the Federal
18 system side, everything is based here in Kotzebue.
19 Somebody in Kobuk has to pay a \$500 round trip ticket
20 to go register for a moose ticket. And that's a
21 hardship for people.

22
23 There's got to be a process that's open
24 to everyone that take the resource for their
25 consumption.

26
27 Thank you.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Walter, I'll
30 -- or should he answer your question. Under SRC and
31 the Federal advisory and the State ACs, we -- one day
32 we have meeting, they had representatives from every
33 village. I think the problem is the representatives
34 are not reporting in the village, they just keeping it
35 to themselves. And when they attend their meeting
36 they're not saying I understand what you're saying. I
37 do get calls even from my hometown, they have a
38 question on moose and I said you have a representative,
39 ask him. And I think what we need to do, we need to
40 have more educational purposes and I know the -- they
41 write letters and they say this on these proposals and
42 every village have it -- through their tribal council
43 have a time for comments.

44
45 Thank you, Walter.

46
47 MR. SAMPSON: Thank you.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I hear you, what

50

1 you're saying.
2
3 Okay. Now number 7, Regional Council
4 recommendation, motion to adopt.
5
6 Are we there, Zach.
7
8 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, Mr. Chair.
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So we need to have a
11 motion on this proposal, WP 18-41/42. And this one is
12 to adopt or not.
13
14 Go ahead. What I.....
15
16 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, am I reading this
17 right, does the moose bull season open July 1 not
18 August 1?
19
20 MS. KLOSTERMAN: Mr. Chair, this is
21 Megan again. That depends which hunt area you are in.
22 So some hunt areas open July 1st and others open August
23 1st.
24
25 MR. CLEVELAND: It says unit 23, right?
26
27 MS. KLOSTERMAN: Yes.
28
29 MR. CLEVELAND: Bull season from July 1
30 to March 31 to July 1 to December 31st.
31
32 MS. KLOSTERMAN: Yes.
33
34 MR. CLEVELAND: Usually August 1 moose
35 season open, right?
36
37 MS. KLOSTERMAN: In two different hunt
38 areas within unit 23 you are correct, it opens August
39 1st. In one of the hunt areas, that portion north and
40 west of and including the Singoalik River drainage all
41 lands draining into the Kobuk and Ipewik Rivers, that
42 area opens July 1st.....
43
44 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah.
45
46 MS. KLOSTERMAN:but only that
47 area.
48
49 MR. CLEVELAND: Okay.
50

1 MS. KLOSTERMAN: But the rest you are
2 correct, open August 1st.
3
4 MR. CLEVELAND: Thank you.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Understand, Vern.
7
8 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah.
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'm trying to figure
11 out where she can go look this at too. Could someone
12 explain to me?
13
14 Go ahead, Zach, you can explain better
15 I guess where.
16
17 MR. SAITO: Yeah, that's just the Point
18 Hope area. The Singoalik River, that's just the Point
19 Hope area. Because -- and the reason why that season
20 is different is because there's not very many moose up
21 there and the only realistic chance that they have to
22 get a moose is in July when they're wandering around in
23 the summer. So.....
24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
26
27 MR. SAITO:that's why it's
28 different.
29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Got that?
31
32 (No comments)
33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
35
36 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.
39
40 MR. CLEVELAND: I make a motion to
41 accept 18-41.
42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Do I have a second.
44
45 MR. MITCHELL: Second.
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: By Enoch. All in
48 favor signify by saying aye.
49
50

1 IN UNISON: Aye.
2
3 (No opposing votes)
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
6
7 MR. KRAMER: That's in support of 18-
8 41?
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This is in support of
11 -- what the -- how -- W 18.....
12
13 MR. STEVENSON: 41 and 42.
14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:41 and 42.
16
17 MR. MITCHELL: Not 42, he said 41.
18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Oh, 41 only?
20
21 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah. That's only 41.
22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Is that right,
24 Zach?
25
26 MR. MITCHELL: That's what I seconded.
27
28 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I was trying to
29 do both of them, 41 and 42. I didn't see, I didn't
30 have my glasses on.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Zach, explain 41-42.
33
34 MR. MITCHELL: Remodify, you got to
35 remodify his.....
36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Wait, wait. Go
38 ahead, let Zach -- let Zach explain it first, I think
39 they're real close.
40
41 MR. STEVENSON: For clarification, and
42 I just want to clarify this with Ms. Klosterman.
43
44 We're now taking a motion on both 18 41
45 and 42 collectively, correct?
46
47 MS. KLOSTERMAN: That is correct, but
48 you can move to support WP 18-41 and take no action on
49 42.
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Withdraw your motion.
2
3 We're trying to do this.....
4
5 MR. CLEVELAND: I so call my motion
6 back, 18-41.
7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You're recalling your
9 proposal. I need to hear from the second that he's
10 going to.....
11
12 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.
13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. There was a
15 misunderstanding. Okay. Let's put it this way. We --
16 they thought you were talking about WP 18-41.
17
18 MR. MITCHELL: That's the one.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Someone explain
21 clearly and one more time what the process, could we do
22 both or do we need to do 41 and then 42.....
23
24 MR. MITCHELL: Right.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:at completely
27 different -- with no other interruptions.
28
29 Somebody say it, please.
30
31 MR. MITCHELL: You can take -- support
32 18-41 and take no action on 42.
33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I understand what
35 you're saying. Zach, is that correct?
36
37 MR. STEVENSON: Correct.
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're trying to do
40 this correctly. Go ahead.
41
42 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair, I'd like to
43 make a motion to support WP 18-41 and take no action on
44 proposal 18-42.
45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Wait. Enoch, I was
47 going to call on Zach. We'll get back to you in a
48 minute.
49
50

1 Go ahead, Zach.
2
3 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
4 My understanding per Robert's Rules of Order is that
5 the proposal is introduced in the affirmative, we so
6 move to adopt, et cetera, et cetera. And if the
7 Council chooses to adopt or not to adopt or defer a
8 decision on a proposal there needs to be a discussion
9 and a justification as to why and then a new motion
10 taken to adopt the other proposal.

11
12 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13
14 The question is we choose to -- do we
15 choose to motion now on proposal 18-41 and 42. If we
16 choose to modify that we have to justify why. If we
17 choose to modify that we must justify why.

18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

20
21 MS. KLOSTERMAN: So, Mr. Chair, just to
22 clarify as an example of what Zach just said, you would
23 make a motion to adopt WP 18-41/42. Then you'd have
24 discussion on it and somebody would suggest to adopt WP
25 18-41, take no action on 42. And then you would
26 support that modification.

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. You guys get
29 that, it'll have to be both 41 and 42.

30
31 MR. KRAMER: Why are they grouped
32 together, their two separate.....

33
34 MS. KLOSTERMAN: These two proposals
35 were grouped together because they cover the same
36 topic. And so they definitely impacted each other.

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. I'm trying to
39 -- like them I'm now trying to get mixed up. I know
40 what they're -- I know what you're saying, we need to
41 do them together, make an amendment and work on one and
42 discuss on the other one, right?

43
44 You get that, Enoch and Vern? Yours
45 was only for proposal 41, right, what they're saying we
46 got to do both of them.

47
48 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And we could make
2 amendments.....

3
4 MR. MITCHELL: I did mention.....

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:or make changes
7 on 40 -- under discussion, we could do 42.

8
9 MR. MITCHELL: I move to support 41 and
10 no action on 42.

11
12 MR. CLEVELAND: Second.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You guys hear that?

15
16 REPORTER: No, say that again in the
17 mic, please.

18
19 MR. MITCHELL: I move to support
20 proposal WP 18-41 and take no action on proposal WP 18-
21 42.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch. Go
24 ahead, Vern, you going to second it?

25
26 MR. CLEVELAND: Second.

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. This
29 question on 41 -- 18-41 and 42 on the -- I know we're
30 going to adopt 41, do you need to make a discussion on
31 42, WP 18-42. I know they're almost the same, that's
32 why -- that's where the mix up is coming from.

33
34 Go ahead, Kramer.

35
36 MR. KRAMER: I know one of the main
37 reasons why we pushed for 18-41 was because at the time
38 we were hoping that the special action request to shut
39 down moose hunting would have taken place. But the
40 Federal Subsistence Board had saw otherwise and decided
41 not to close it because they didn't think that there
42 was sufficient evidence to shut down the moose hunting
43 in game management unit 23 to non-Federally-qualified
44 subsistence users. So we wanted to prove to the
45 Federal Subsistence Board that we're taking cuts also,
46 but we wanted to also preserve our natural -- our
47 subsistence resources and prove to them that we're
48 taking preservative measures to conserve the moose
49 subsistence resource, moose because moose are beginning
50

1 to get hammered too as the caribou are declining and
2 they're showing up later, people are starting to get
3 moose. I've even seen some moose or bulls taken in
4 September, you know, and that's -- they're in the rut,
5 but people are still taking them because there's such a
6 desperation for meat. This is one of the reasons why
7 we put this 18-41 in place was because just in case the
8 -- we wanted to prove to the Federal Subsistence Board
9 that we were taking cuts, we wanted to preserve the
10 cows in the spring because they had babies onboard.
11 You know, we wanted to prove to the Federal Subsistence
12 Board that we were being conservative, you know. As to
13 how much our moose population has declined since, you
14 know, whether it was 25, 30, 40 percent, once the
15 agency do their reports and find out how many moose
16 were taken I think that'll be the next step into
17 putting another special action request in to further
18 enhance the conservation of our moose population to
19 only Federally-qualified subsistence users.

20
21 I support 18-41, 42 no action.

22
23 I don't think someone else from --
24 that's not from this general area should be able to
25 make decisions as to how we harvest our animals.

26
27 That's all I have for right now.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Kramer.

30
31 Anyone else, anymore comments.

32
33 (No comments)

34
35 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So we're going to --
36 I need to hear someone take a motion not to support 42,
37 is that what I'm hearing from you, Kramer.

38
39 So I need to have a motion.

40
41 MR. KRAMER: I make a motion not to
42 support 18-42.....

43
44 MR. MITCHELL: Second.

45
46 MR. KRAMER:take no action.

47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: There's a second by
49 Enoch. All in favor signify by saying aye.

50

1 IN UNISON: Aye.
2
3 (No opposing votes)
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Well, we cleared the
6 process, Zach. I want to make sure this is done right
7 because I -- it's hard for us sometime.
8
9 The Federal have so many different ways
10 of doing things and we're getting mixed up every time.
11
12 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
13
14 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
17
18 MR. STEVENSON: For clarification the
19 motion before the Council is if I understand correctly
20 to clarify, support for wildlife proposal 18-41 and no
21 action on 18-42.
22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes. Go ahead, Vern.
28
29 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, we had a motion
30 on the floor, what happened to that.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, we just voted
33 on it.
34
35 MR. CLEVELAND: No, there was another
36 motion and he just made another motion again to 42. Is
37 that a different motion? We got two motions.....
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're taking.....
40
41 MR. CLEVELAND:we got two motions
42 on the floor right now.
43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And we're taking no
45 action on 42.
46
47 MR. MITCHELL: I forgot to say my.....
48
49 MR. CLEVELAND: Oh, god. Okay.
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. You understand
2 now? I don't want leave -- I don't want to leave you
3 confused or anything. I know what you're.....

4
5 MR. CLEVELAND: Once you make a motion
6 it don't die until you refrain the motion. But there
7 one -- there's -- Enoch made a motion, now he made
8 another motion. What's Kramer? So we got two motions
9 on the floor.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes. One motion is
12 on 41, Vern, which we approved to support.

13
14 MR. CLEVELAND: Okay.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: The other motion was
17 on 42 not to support.

18
19 MR. CLEVELAND: I call the question.

20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: A different motion
22 completely. Understand? I don't want to leave anybody
23 confused and anything else. Even me I'm trying to get
24 confused. So are we done with -- we're done with WP
25 18-41 and 42. Is the agencies, whoever the recorder
26 is, happy what we're doing so far. I don't want to say
27 we should have done this and hear it later.

28
29 So we're okay?

30
31 (No comments)

32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Then we could go to
34 the next proposal. Thank you on 41 and 42.

35
36 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.

39
40 MR. STEVENSON: I'm showing that we had
41 a vote in favor of proposal 18-41.....

42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

44
45 MR. STEVENSON:with seven in
46 favor and zero opposed. Does that concur with your
47 records?

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

50

1 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you. And for 18
2 -- proposal 18-42 I'm showing zero in favor and seven
3 against. Is that accurate?

4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

6
7 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Now let's go
10 into proposal 18-43. Introductions and presentations.

11
12 MS. MAAS: All right. Thank you, Mr.
13 Chair, members of the Council. My name is Lisa Maas
14 and I'm a wildlife biologist in the Office of
15 Subsistence Management. Proposal 18-43 begins on page
16 52 of the meeting book and I'll be presenting a summary
17 of the analysis. And that's page 52.

18
19 Wildlife proposal 18-43 was submitted
20 by the Northwest Arctic Council and requests that the
21 unit 23 brown bear harvest limit be increased from one
22 to three bears per year and that the season be extended
23 to year round. The proponent notes an overabundance of
24 brown bears in unit 23 and states that the proposed
25 regulation change would reduce human bear conflicts and
26 disturbance to migrating caribou. In 2017 the Board of
27 Game increased the resident brown bear harvest limit in
28 unit 23 to two bears per year. Another federal
29 wildlife proposal, WP 18-44, could affect this
30 proposal. WP 18-44 requests that up to two brown bear
31 hides and skulls could be sold per year and will be
32 presented next.

33
34 There are many uncertainties about the
35 unit 23 brown bear population however according to
36 aerial survey data and local observations the brown
37 bear population in most of unit 23 appears health and
38 may be increasing. Brown bear populations are often
39 managed conservatively. Brown bears are a highly
40 respected and utilized subsistence resource in
41 Northwest Alaska. Bears are predominantly harvested
42 during the spring and fall, they are rarely hunted in
43 the summer because they are lean, their hides are of
44 lesser quality and they are considered more dangerous.
45 Local hunters rarely take bears in defense of life and
46 property or DLP as the process is onerous and hunters
47 fear they have broken the law. Rather nuisance bears
48 are more often killed and not reported, but their meat
49 is utilized.

50

1 Since 1990 reported brown bear harvest
2 in unit 23 has averaged 50 bears per year. Unit 23
3 residents have reported 14 brown bears per year on
4 average. However when unreported harvests are included
5 unit 23 residents have harvested an estimated 20 to 30
6 brown bears per year. While the percent of males in
7 the reported harvest has exceeded State management
8 objectives the impact of hunting on a unit 23 brown
9 bear population is unknown due to unreported harvests
10 and lack of population data. Overharvesting may
11 already be occurring within Gates of the Arctic
12 National Preserve.

13
14 One alternative considered was to
15 increase the harvest limit to two bears per year
16 instead of three due to uncertainties about brown bear
17 populations and harvest. A two bear harvest limit
18 would also reduce user confusion and regulatory
19 complexity by aligning with the recent changes to State
20 regulations.

21
22 Adoption of this proposal would
23 increase opportunity for Federally-qualified
24 subsistence users and would provide for a Federal
25 subsistence priority as Federal regulations are
26 currently more restrictive than State regulations.
27 However concurrence would be needed from the State to
28 allow Federally-qualified subsistence users to use a
29 State registration permit with season dates and harvest
30 limits that differ from existing State regulations. As
31 all edible meat must be salvaged and two bears can
32 already be harvested under State regulations an
33 increase in the Federal harvest limit is not expected
34 to result in a substantial increase in harvest.
35 Similarly as bears are traditionally harvested in the
36 spring and fall few bears are expected to be harvested
37 during the extended season in June and July. A year
38 round season may increase harvest reporting and would
39 also allow for the take and utilization of nuisance
40 bears during the summer that would not be legal under
41 defense of life and property. However there may be
42 conservation concerns for this proposal. While the
43 best available information suggests that the unit 23
44 brown bear population is stable or increasing, there
45 are still many uncertainties about the population and
46 harvest. Additionally brown bears are slow to recover
47 from overharvest. A three bear harvest limit would be
48 the highest in the State and may be unsustainable.

49
50

1 they want subsistence users to have every opportunity
2 to harvest bears. Alex Whiting commented if someone
3 wants to harvest a bear in December for the meat then
4 they should have total freedom to do that. This
5 proposal will give them the opportunity to do that.
6 They expressed their support for aligning State and
7 Federal regulations and that is taken into
8 consideration with the OSM modification. And Enoch
9 Mitchell also commented with some concern about abuse
10 of the regulation, but said if it is being abused we
11 can change it, we have to make sure that young people
12 are not misusing the regulation to hunt bears just to
13 sell the hide and if there was waste of meat.

14
15 The comment from the Kobuk Valley
16 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission was the
17 Commission agreed that the bears have been causing
18 problems with the caribou herd migration and the
19 members of the Commission were concerned about
20 increasing subsistence harvest when subsistence harvest
21 of bear meat is unpopular. Gordon Nuland talked about
22 the change in subsistence harvest of bears saying we
23 are in an area where some of the bears taste like
24 coastal bears where they eat seals. The population
25 developed a lot and has moved into our area. Bear fat
26 oil use in the -- is in the past and was mainly used
27 for cooking. Some people store it to put away for a
28 medicine, we don't use it anymore -- we don't use that
29 much anymore since we have clinics in every village.
30 That cuts down on how much people are harvesting bears
31 and it has cut down how much people are harvesting
32 bears. Greta Shirk thought that there would be
33 confusion about increasing a subsistence opportunity
34 and she said pay attention to the subsistence harvest
35 requirements for taking the meat. If the hunter is
36 confused about the regulation then they would feel the
37 consequences of wanton waste. Most of the Commission
38 members were in favor of the intent of the OSM
39 modification to propose -- to align the State [sic]
40 regulation with the State regulation by changing it
41 from a one to two bear bag limit rather than a one to
42 three bag limit.

43
44 But they didn't take any action, those
45 were just comments.

46
47 Thanks.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Hannah.

50

1 Anyone from the tribal governments.
2
3 (No comments)
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Any written comments,
6 Zach.
7
8 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, the meeting
9 book identifies presently one written comment when in
10 fact after this book was assembled there were two other
11 receives. So there should reflect now for the record
12 three written comments, two of which Hannah Atkinson
13 described. In your meeting book on page 73 opposing
14 the proposal submitted by Sterling Miller and Clait E.
15 Braun basically opposing the proposal stating that
16 economics were driving the proposal and that they had
17 concerns with the impacts biologically and ecologically
18 on an ecologically important animal in the region.
19
20 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. So the
23 one that's opposing this is from Montana or is that
24 Lolo, Montana?
25
26 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
29
30 MR. STEVENSON: The comment letter
31 opposing the proposal was submitted jointly by Mr.
32 Sterling Miller of Lolo, Montana, retired ADF&G
33 research biologist as well as Clait E. Braun, past
34 president of the Wildlife Society, former editor of the
35 Journal of Wildlife Management of Tucson, Arizona.
36
37 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
40 Okay. Number 4, other Regional Councils on proposal
41 18-43.
42
43 MS. MAAS: Through the Chair. The
44 Western Interior Council motioned to support the OSM
45 modification on this proposal.
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Fish and
48 Game Advisory Committees.
49
50

1 (No comments)

2

3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: None, okay, Fish and
4 Game Advisory Committees. SRC, anyone from the SRC,
5 Subsistence Resource.....

6

7 MS. OKADA: Mr. Chair.

8

9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead,
10 radioland.

11

12 MS. OKADA: Marcy Okada with the
13 National Park Service. The Gates of the Arctic
14 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission had the
15 following comment. The Kobuk hunters have been seeing
16 more brown bears than ever before. People think
17 they're coming down to the river from the mountain.
18 There's been report from the upper Kobuk River all the
19 way down to Kiana. Also have -- there are larger
20 numbers of brown bears on the Noatak River. Not many
21 people harvest bears, but there are certain people that
22 do so they wouldn't be opposed to allowing increased
23 harvest.

24

25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Number 5,
26 summary of written public comments.

27

28 Zach.

29

30 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
31 As previously stated we now have four written comments
32 which have been -- three of which were summarized both
33 by Hannah Atkinson as well as Marcy Okada, addressing
34 support for the proposal with modification. And as I
35 mentioned previously there was one comment letter that
36 was received opposing the proposal on the grounds
37 previously stated.

38

39 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

40

41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Number 7,
42 regional -- motion to adopt. So we need -- I need to
43 have a motion to adopt 18-43.

44

45 Go ahead, Enoch.

46

47 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair, I move to
48 support 18-43 with modifications to change three bears
49 to two bears to align with the State and so that it

50

1 won't be a conflict or -- we might have to go back to
2 it again to revise it to -- if we never modify it. But
3 there's a lot of bears, almost every river, every bend
4 on the river. So I move to support 18-43 with
5 modifications to align with State.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch.

8
9 Do I have a second.

10
11 MR. COMMACK: I second that.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Second by Louie. Any
14 discussion on 18-43.

15
16 You were tapping the table. Go ahead.

17
18 MR. McKEE: Yeah, this is Chris McKee,
19 OSM. I hate to be a stickler on these things, but the
20 -- there's a pretty good white paper here that Maija
21 with the Park Service came up with to just kind of
22 guide your discussion to go through like I said the
23 Robert's Rules.

24
25 The initial -- on your cards there at
26 the end of the public testimony there's a line that
27 says regional advisory council motion. The first thing
28 you guys do after you go through that list is someone
29 has to make a motion to adopt, to support the proposal.
30 Then you get a second. After that second that just
31 brings the proposal to the table then you can have
32 discussion about -- among all the Council members about
33 how they feel about the proposal, yay or nay,
34 modifications somewhere in between and then somebody
35 puts forward some other motion if they want to amend
36 it.

37
38 You guys kind of skipped the first
39 step.

40
41 I mean, if we get the meaning of the
42 Council that's what's really important, but I want to
43 make sure that we're at least trying to go through the
44 proper motions here.

45
46 So hopefully that helps.

47
48 I don't know if it does or not, but
49 that's kind of what that's kind of the direction we
50

1 need to go. So just putting forth a motion to support
2 the proposal doesn't mean that suddenly you're done, it
3 just means you're bringing it to the table for -- you
4 get a second and then you have discussion on the
5 proposal about how you feel about it.

6
7 MR. MITCHELL: (Indiscernible - away
8 from microphone).....

9
10 MR. McKEE: If that helps.

11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Now I could see it.

13
14 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Thank
17 you, Enoch. From Enoch, not Attamuk. Okay. Thank
18 you. So.....

19
20 MR. MITCHELL: (Indiscernible - away
21 from microphone) too, this kind of form.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I know it was motion
24 to approve by Enoch, seconded by Louie.

25
26 MR. McKEE: I could have very well
27 missed that. So if you've already did that then, okay,
28 but.....

29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, we did that.
31 And see that's the trouble with our layman terms
32 sometimes.

33
34 Okay. Then we need did the proposal,
35 we -- and it was seconded by Louie. Under discussion
36 on proposal 18-43. From the -- anyone from the
37 agencies on this proposal?

38
39 MS. MAAS: Thank you. Lisa Maas for
40 the record. I just wanted to clarify that there are
41 two parts to this proposal.

42
43 One is the harvest limit increase so
44 that's one bear to two or three bears per year.

45
46 The other is the season.

47
48 So right now the OSM preliminary
49 conclusion is to support a year round season which
50

1 provides Federal subsistence priority because you can
2 harvest during the summer whereas the State you can't,
3 but to just do a two bear harvest limit instead of a
4 three bear harvest limit. So the harvest limits
5 between State and Federal regs would align, but the
6 season would not align.

7
8 So I just wanted to clarify whether the
9 intent of the Council is to completely align the season
10 and the harvest limit between State and Federal regs or
11 only the harvest limit.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I understand what
14 you're saying. Our proposal 18-43, but to be limited
15 from one bears to three bears. 18-43.

16
17 Now you're talking about a winter hunt,
18 which is not completely -- I'm just trying not to get
19 mixed up.

20
21 MS. MAAS: Yes. Correct. So again
22 proposal 43, the -- is -- as written is asking for a
23 year round season which would extend the season through
24 July and August and then also increase the harvest
25 limit.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So under discussion
28 we could make a correction to put it on year round if
29 we want or change it from three bears to two bears.
30 That's what I was going to get to later.....

31
32 MS. MAAS: Uh-huh.

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:I mean, right
35 after this. I -- under discussion I will maybe do
36 that, we need to change it to align with the State.
37 That we have -- we won't have any conflict between two
38 different proposals.

39
40 Go ahead. You have the floor.

41
42 MR. McKEE: To try my best to keep this
43 as simple as possible, unfortunately there's a lot of
44 moving parts to this.

45
46 So you could either -- you're -- just
47 as a 30,000 foot kind of overview of the situation, you
48 could either vote -- now that the motion to adopt and
49 discuss the proposal's on the table, you can either
50

1 vote to oppose it which would be unusual since it's
2 your proposal or you can vote to support it as written
3 which is exactly the increase of three bears per year
4 and a year round season or you could also vote to adopt
5 -- to support as modified by OSM. So because our
6 modification, we modified it, it's something different
7 than what you guys originally wanted. You wanted a
8 year round season with a three bear harvest limit. OSM
9 has supported it with modification to retain the year
10 round season, but only have a two bear harvest limit.
11 So if this Council voted to support the proposal as
12 modified by OSM you would have a year round season with
13 a two bear harvest limit. So the harvest limit would
14 be in line with the State, but the season would not be.
15 So.....

16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. I get you. We
18 put -- we adopted from three. We adopt the proposed,
19 that's what I'm trying to understand and that's what
20 I'm trying to understand. Now on the discussion we
21 could make a change and amendments to the proposal from
22 three bears to two bears, right?

23
24 MR. McKEE: You could. I mean, the
25 simplest language would be to amend it to support as
26 modified by OSM which would give you a year round
27 season with a harvest limit of two bears.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Sorry about my
30 limited.....

31
32 MR. McKEE: No, that -- no, I'm --
33 believe me.....

34
35 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, I'm really
36 drowning so.....

37
38 MR. McKEE: I live with this stuff and
39 it's complicated enough for me so I understand your
40 confusion.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Sorry, Enoch, do you
43 understand what we're saying?

44
45 MR. MITCHELL: Yes.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

48
49 MR. MITCHELL: I'm.....

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So when do we make
2 amendments to make it from three to two, now?

3
4 MR. McKEE: Once you feel like you've
5 fully discussed the matter and under the white paper it
6 has agencies, all that stuff, that's only if you have
7 -- want some discussion or clarification from those
8 agencies. It's not that they're going to come up here
9 and present anything else because they've already come
10 up during the previous part of your -- the back of your
11 cards there it says agencies, tribal consultation,
12 public comment, et cetera, et cetera. That's already
13 occurred. The only reason that anybody else would come
14 up here is if you had further questions on it.

15
16 So you can make -- it's up to the
17 table, you guys can make an amendment.....

18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.

20
21 MR. McKEE:now to support as
22 modified by OSM if you're satisfied with the year round
23 season and a harvest limit of two bears. Then if you
24 voted to support that amendment that would be your
25 action.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

28
29 Go ahead, Louie.

30
31 MR. COMMACK: Our proposal was for
32 three bears, right.....

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

35
36 MR. COMMACK:am I not correct or
37 proposal.....

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes, it was for three
40 bears.

41
42 MR. COMMACK:is that the motion
43 you just made?

44
45 MR. MITCHELL: No, I made two. I made
46 the motion.....

47
48 MR. COMMACK: The motion to be modify.

49
50

1 MR. MITCHELL: I made a motion to --
2 yeah, I did that.
3
4 MR. COMMACK: Okay.
5
6 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah.
7
8 MR. COMMACK: Okay. I did not
9 understand that.
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I thought your
12 proposal was for the three bears.....
13
14 MR. COMMACK: Right.
15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:because under
17 discussion we could change it to two. That.....
18
19 MR. COMMACK: That would be modified.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:misunderstanding
22 is going on right here. Yeah.
23
24 MR. COMMACK: You.....
25
26 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah, I support it with
27 mod.....
28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We've got to start
30 with three bears.
31
32 MR. STEVENSON: Use your mic.
33
34 MR. MITCHELL:modification.....
35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Mic.
37
38 MR. MITCHELL:to get it from
39 three bears to two bears. And also I'd like to make an
40 amendment to make it July 1 to June 30.
41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And so you're.....
43
44 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah, that's in support
45 of modified as.....
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Hang on.
48
49 MR. MITCHELL:by OSM.
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Hang on. We've got
2 to do this process correctly otherwise Federal will
3 have a problem with it.

4
5 And I'm trying to make sure we pass
6 from -- first we pass from three bear per year, under
7 discussion we could change it to two bears per year to
8 align with the other agencies with a motion to make
9 some amendments.

10
11 Go ahead, you have your -- I'll get to
12 you.

13
14 MR. McKEE: You don't need to make a
15 motion to amend it to a year round season, the original
16 proposal was already a year round season. Your
17 proposal is for a year round season with a harvest
18 limit of three bears, that's the original proposal.

19
20 OSM's modification is to retain the
21 year round season as written, but change the harvest
22 limit from three to two bears. That would be your
23 amendment, but you could simply state it as make an
24 amendment to support the proposal as modified by OSM,
25 take a vote on it, if that's the way it goes that's
26 your action.

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's where we're
29 trying to go. I'm.....

30
31 MR. McKEE: Unfortunately you skipped a
32 step.

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Without getting so
35 mixed up.

36
37 MR. McKEE: You started.....

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's where we're
40 reading right now.

41
42 MR. McKEE: Yeah. You started off with
43 the amendment when you really should have said -- made
44 a motion to adopt. Then you have a second and then you
45 discuss it and then if you want to amend it you do
46 that. But as long as we all know what you guys want
47 then I think it would be maybe cleaner to just make it
48 clear what the desires of the Councils. And then we
49 start on the next proposal, maybe we can make it a
50

1 cleaner run of things. So.....

2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. I
4 think if we had put this in Eskimo we would have been
5 done already last week.

6
7 (Laughter)

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'll tell you that
10 right now. We'd understand more.

11
12 Go ahead, Louie, you had your hand up.

13
14 MR. COMMACK: No, Calvin.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Oh, Calvin.

17
18 Your mic, Louie.

19
20 MR. MOTO: I was wondering are you
21 recommending that we oppose or accept. This is
22 something that I want clarified because are we going to
23 accept this or, you know, give us a good reason why we
24 should accept it.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.

27
28 MR. McKEE: Through the Chair. Member
29 Moto, it's -- I think we all -- I think I understand
30 the majority desire of the Council is simply to adopt
31 as modified by OSM.

32
33 You're still supporting the proposal,
34 you're just submitting it with a slight difference in
35 what was originally -- how it was originally written.
36 The only thing that's different between the way you
37 guys submitted it and our modification is instead of a
38 three bear per year harvest limit it's a two bear
39 harvest limit. That's the only thing that's different
40 from your original proposal. So if you vote to support
41 as modified by OSM that's what you get, you're good to
42 go.

43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
45 Everybody understand it? The proposal was for three
46 bears, we accepted the three bear all year hunt. And
47 now under discussion we need to make modification,
48 right, from three bears to two bears all year round.
49 He had the dates.

50

1 MR. McKEE: Correct. You can simply
2 just make a motion to amend to support as modified by
3 OSM.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's what we're
6 trying to say under our ability to understand. You're
7 right up the way what we're trying to say.
8
9 MR. McKEE: Zach will.....
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're trying.....
12
13 MR. McKEE:record you faithfully
14 and accurately I'm sure.
15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: All in favor. I need
17 a motion to modify.....
18
19 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:from three to
22 two bears per year.
23
24 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.
27
28 MR. CLEVELAND: I make a motion to
29 amend modification to O what, OMS.....
30
31 MS. MAAS: OSM.
32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: OSM.
34
35 MR. MITCHELL: Support the modified by
36 OSM.
37
38 MR. CLEVELAND:OSM.
39
40 MR. MITCHELL: Okay. Was that the way
41 it was.....
42
43 MS. MAAS: Yeah.
44
45 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.
46
47 MR. McKEE: Correct.
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. I
50

1 need a second.
2
3 MR. MITCHELL: Second.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Second.....
6
7 MR. COMMACK: Discussion.
8
9 MR. CLEVELAND: Call for question.
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Question's been.....
12
13 MR. COMMACK: No, discussion.
14
15 MR. CLEVELAND: No, no, no.
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Pardon.
18
19 MR. CLEVELAND: I thought we just got
20 done discussing it.
21
22 MR. MITCHELL: We did.
23
24 MR. CLEVELAND: Sorry. Go ahead.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Wait. Wait. I'm
27 practically can't even hear you same time. I'm trying
28 to be fair with.....
29
30 Go ahead.
31
32 MS. MAAS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. You
33 also need to justify the -- your decision and just a
34 recommendation, you can just say you support the OSM
35 justification or you can say more on the record.
36
37 But just.....
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: They need us to
40 justify the OSM recommendation.
41
42 Turn your mic on please, that way the
43 recorder can.....
44
45 MR. MITCHELL: There's a lot of bears
46 all over the region, almost every bend. People been
47 having problems with bears at their cabins. Almost
48 every bend down the river we see bears, bears and
49 bears, too much bear.
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
2 You get it now? All in favor.....
3
4 MR. COMMACK: Of what?
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Pardon.
7
8 MR. COMMACK: Are we voting on the
9 modification from three bears to two bears now?
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.
12
13 MR. MOTO: I'd like a roll call.
14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, we -- that's
16 the process there. We have to use.....
17
18 MR. COMMACK: Yeah, but I will oppose
19 what they're modifying. We have.....
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You.....
22
23 MR. COMMACK:too many bear
24 problems, it should be three, not two.
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You have a right to
27 oppose it when we vote on it.
28
29 MR. COMMACK: Right.
30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You have a right to
32 oppose it. You have a right to oppose it if you.....
33
34 MR. COMMACK: Yeah.
35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead. Motion in
37 order. There's a motion to align from OSM's
38 recommendation from three bears to two bears a year.
39
40 For the vote, all in favor signify by
41 saying aye.
42
43 MR. MITCHELL: What?
44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This is the motion to
46 -- from three to two.
47
48 MR. MITCHELL: Okay. Aye.
49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. There's one
2 aye.
3
4 MR. MITCHELL: To align with the State.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And I need to hear
7 nays. I will vote nay.
8
9 IN UNISON: Nay.
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: There's too many
12 bears out there. So one, two, three, four, five.....
13
14 MR. COMMACK: Nay.
15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: nay. Six nays,
17 one yes. So we're going to keep it at three for the
18 Federal side.
19
20 MR. MITCHELL: For information what
21 does it come back to because.....
22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're done and voted.
24 Done with discussion.
25
26 We need to go on to the next proposal.
27
28 I'm trying to process this.
29
30 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
33
34 MR. STEVENSON: For clarification on
35 the record the vote shows that there was in favor and
36 six opposed to adopting proposal 18-43 as modified by
37 the Office of Subsistence Management. And that again
38 was one in favor and six against. I've made a note of
39 that and I'm going to through the Chair request a five
40 minute recess. I think this notion of Robert's Rules
41 could be improved and I wanted to just spend five
42 minutes with my team just to address that if -- with
43 your permission.
44
45 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Five minute break.
48
49 And please, I need my sane pills.
50

1 (Off record)
2
3 (On record)
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, we need to go
6 back to 18-43 and revote on it in the way we understand
7 it. But I need my proposer and my second to agree to
8 go back to 18-43.
9
10 Go ahead, Zach.
11
12 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 The question for clarification before the Council is
14 through a revote to whether or not to adopt proposal
15 18-43 as written.
16
17 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So we need a roll
20 call vote on 18-43 in favor of three bears per year all
21 year round, right?
22
23 MS. MAAS: Yes.
24
25 MR. McKEE: Correct.
26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I need your vote on
28 -- who do I start from, I hate to put anyone on the
29 bind.
30
31 I will vote -- I will.....
32
33 Go ahead, Vern.
34
35 MR. CLEVELAND: Should we make the
36 motion first or just follow that motion what we made
37 earlier?
38
39 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
42
43 MR. STEVENSON: I'm going to -- if I
44 may through the Chair do the roll call.
45
46 Member Cleveland.
47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Wait. Do we need to
49 pull our earlier proposal by the proposer and our
50

1 second?

2

3 MR. STEVENSON: No. No, Mr. Chair, at

4 this point we are reclar -- we are doing a revote just

5 to clarify precisely whether or not the Council

6 supports 18-43 as written.

7

8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

9

10 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you. And for the

11 roll call vote, Member Cleveland? We'll start on the

12 left and just work around the room.

13

14 MR. CLEVELAND: No.

15

16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That -- support 18-43

17 for three bears per year.

18

19 MR. COMMACK: Say what?

20

21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This proposal is 18-

22 43 the way it's written, three bears per year, all year

23 harvest.

24

25 MR. COMMACK: Oh.

26

27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You guys get it?

28

29 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes.

30

31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: 18-43, the proposal

32 is three bears per year, all year harvest, the dates is

33 in this proposal.

34

35 MR. STEVENSON: As written. As

36 written.

37

38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: As written.

39

40 MR. STEVENSON: So we're doing a roll

41 call vote right now of each Council member again to see

42 whether or not the Council supports proposal 18-43 as

43 written. As written.

44

45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Vern.

46

47 MR. CLEVELAND: I voted yes.

48

49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Enoch.

50

1
2 MR. MITCHELL: Opposed.
3
4 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Kramer.
5
6 MR. KRAMER: Yes.
7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I vote yes.
9
10 Beverly.
11
12 MS. MOTO: Yes.
13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Moto.
15
16 MR. MOTO: Yes.
17
18 MR. COMMACK: Yes.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And Louis, yes.
21
22 Percy, are you online yet?
23
24 (No comments)
25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: No, I guess not.
27
28 Can you read off the votes, please.
29
30 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, we have six
31 in favor and one against of adopting or I should say in
32 favor of wildlife proposal 18-43 as written.
33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
35
36 MR. STEVENSON: And for the record so
37 that the minutes accurately reflect the position of the
38 Council, I am asking for a brief justification, what is
39 the -- for the record what is the motivation for the
40 position that was taken, what is your justification?
41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We -- there's
43 so many bears out there and we need to harvest. But
44 under this one here you have to salvage the meat.
45 Better specify that that way the Natives won't get
46 cited for not salvaging the meat. That's what this
47 proposal is all about. So correct me, Enoch, and that
48 would be mine. There's too many bears out there. Like
49 Kramer said we -- he saw a bear with four cubs and my
50

1 wife and I we saw one at our Noatak camp with four
2 cubs, maybe the same one.

3
4 There's too many bears out there.

5
6 Anyone else.

7
8 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.

9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

11
12 MR. MITCHELL: I'd like to justify my
13 oppose.

14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go right ahead.

16
17 MR. MITCHELL: Okay. Two bears is
18 enough. Three bears is too much. You're going to get
19 trigger happy with bears. Just get two of them. One
20 bear bother your caribou, you got two chances to shoot
21 it, two bears.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I understand.

24
25 MR. MITCHELL: Well, I'm still
26 justifying my opposal. So the -- you can even see
27 bears make three cub, four cub, don't mean you have to
28 kill four -- three, four cubs. We're Natives, we don't
29 -- we always get what we need. And two bears is
30 enough, three bears is too much.

31
32 So you guys got to think.

33
34 I know you guys don't like bears, I
35 know there's too much bear, but don't get trigger
36 happy. Just because they ate your one caribou, there's
37 more caribou. There's lots of bears, but be
38 reasonable.

39
40 That's all.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

43
44 Anyone else.

45
46 Go ahead, Kramer.

47
48 MR. KRAMER: I think the main reason
49 why it's a good thing to make it three because, I mean,
50

1 yeah, we want to align with the State, but, you know,
2 there's just too many bears out there. You know, I
3 know there's a couple game management units down south
4 that allow the taking of a sow with cubs, you know, I
5 mean, if we have to get to that kind of management then
6 darn, we better get started because they're going to
7 start overpopulating this place here pretty quick.

8
9 There was four bears killed within a
10 five mile radius of Kotzebue this year alone, this
11 spring, summer and fall. Four bears killed within five
12 miles of Kotzebue. That's getting crazy. Me and my
13 brother pulled in back over there after commercial
14 fishing and there's a grizzly bear about from here to
15 these chairs sitting there on the beach chewing on
16 something. That bear was noted to be over by the
17 towers on that end of town, heading over to the fish
18 buying place. That bear swam all the way across from
19 the mouth of the Noatak to Lockard and worked his way
20 over here. That's a sign that a lot of these bears are
21 starting to push -- being pushed into communities. And
22 then once they get pushed in the community then they're
23 going to start causing havoc and they're going to start
24 raising Cain and people are going to start whacking
25 them. That one bear that came right here within
26 Kotzebue, there was people there ready to dispatch that
27 bear. But the city of Kotzebue said, no, you cannot
28 shoot a grizzly bear within city limits.

29
30 That's ridiculous.

31
32 The city of Kotzebue has no right to be
33 able to withdraw someone from having to protect the
34 people from a grizzly bear that has come into town.

35
36 That -- no, that's not tolerated here.

37
38
39 We cannot have a grizzly bear wandering
40 in Kotzebue. There's too many kids out there that are
41 just playing, innocent kids. We either need to take
42 action and start whacking these things or they're going
43 to start killing people. They're out of control. The
44 Federal agencies do not promote predator control, we
45 need to take other actions to be able to take care of
46 this issue. People's lives are at stake especially in
47 the villages, they're even closer, they're right at
48 their back door. It's time to start taking action and
49 start whacking these things before they kill people.

1 Because one of these days it's going to be one of your
2 loved ones that's out there enjoying the tundra and
3 picking berries and picking plants and picking other
4 subsistence -- you know, other subsistence things out
5 there and somebody's going to get killed.

6
7 What do we need to do to protect the
8 people.

9
10 We need to take adverse actions to be
11 able to knock down the population of grizzly bears
12 until they're at a range where they can be managed.

13
14 Three to four bears a year, you know, a
15 lot of these cubs are -- a lot of these sows are
16 starting to have two to three, four cubs. You figure
17 there might be 10,000 bears total maybe within this
18 game management unit, more than half of them are sows.
19 You figure two to three to four, they're going to more
20 than double their population in about three years.

21
22 We need to start taking action on them
23 now.

24
25 That's all I have.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Kramer.
28 He's right. I -- we -- a lot of commercial fishermen
29 last summer saw that bear right at the lagoon, right at
30 the mouth. And it was scary because not too far from
31 there I turned around and I told the kid there's a bear
32 over there, you better head back to town. And they
33 were within no more than 400 feet. And if they get to
34 the boundary or the bear the bear would attack them.
35 And the parents thanked me and I recognized them kids
36 and I called their mom on the cell. And that's how
37 close and I don't think Natives -- most Natives never
38 get trigger happy and shoot any animals just to kill.

39
40 We're just trying to protect our family
41 and our livelihood because what we're limited on
42 certain to get our fish like at Sisolik when the bear --
43 my cabin's right in the middle of the Nuveruk (ph) and
44 Sisolik Road and the bear come around and break my door
45 down. I got lucky he never destroyed the inside
46 because I had a lot of food in my house at Sisolik and
47 we weren't there and somebody called me up. And sure
48 we go fix it, but I think I got lucky another four-
49 wheeler chased him away. Another four-wheeler, a bear
50

1 was just getting ready to charge a kid that was walking
2 last summer and he went to my place, they dropped him
3 off at my place and say, hey, bear was going to attack
4 him. And I let him jump on my four-wheeler and they
5 runaway with that four-wheeler and he dropped him off
6 at my camp. And I talked to him, don't you ever walk
7 again without a rifle. Even if you want to take off
8 and using -- you're a healthy young kid, you could run,
9 you could only run so far, bear could out run you
10 because he got better lungs and it happened last
11 summer. An elder shot that bear, it came back to his
12 camp and it was by his camp. And he died -- Johnson
13 Stalker, he had to kill it and it was the same bear
14 that was going to attack this kid at Sisolik. And
15 there's too many bears. We're not trying to get
16 trigger happy, we're trying to protect our people.

17
18 Most Natives never get trigger happy on
19 any animals.

20
21 Reason why that number 3 is -- we came
22 up with on this Council is because there's so many
23 bears out there.

24
25 Anybody else.

26
27 Bear discussion.

28
29 (No comments)

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay, Zach, what's
32 the probable -- which way we got to go now?

33
34 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
35 That brings us to wildlife proposal 18-44 addressing
36 the allow -- allowing the sale of skulls and hides
37 and/or skulls for brown bear in unit 23 to be addressed
38 by Dr. Joshua Ream, anthropologist with the Office of
39 Subsistence Management.

40
41 That's on page 74 in your books.

42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Is he available.

44
45 MR. STEVENSON: Yes.

46
47 DR. REAM: Yes, I'm here, Mr. Chair.
48 Good afternoon, Mr. Chair, members of the Council.
49 Again my name is Joshua Ream. My Tlingit name is
50

1 Xixchl Toowo. I am an anthropologist with the Office
2 of Subsistence Management. I'm assigned to your region
3 as well as the Seward Peninsula and the North Slope.
4 I'm going to walk you through another bear proposal
5 today.

6
7 Proposal WP 18-44 was submitted by your
8 Council, it requests regulations allowing the sale of
9 up to two raw, untanned bear hides with the claws
10 attached and/or skulls per regulatory year from brown
11 bears legally harvested by Federally-qualified
12 subsistence users on Federal public lands in unit 23.

13
14 Since much of the regulatory history,
15 harvest history and the biology was presented by Lisa
16 in the last proposal I will not repeat it here. If you
17 do have any questions at the end of the presentation
18 please be sure to let myself or Lisa know.

19
20 Your Council voted to submit this
21 proposal to align State and Federal regulations in unit
22 23 by adding a provision in Federal regulations
23 allowing the sale of up to two skulls and raw, untanned
24 hides of brown bears legally harvested by Federally-
25 qualified users in unit 23 per regulatory year. And
26 the Council also voted to submit a companion proposal,
27 the previous proposal that you heard, to increase the
28 Federal harvest limit for brown bears from one bear to
29 three bears per regulatory year and to extend the
30 season year round. The proponent, your Council,
31 clarified that they only seek to allow the sale of two
32 brown bear skulls and raw, untanned hides with claws
33 attached per regulatory year.

34
35 Because of the State increase in the
36 brown bear harvest limit to two bears per regulatory
37 year in unit 23, the sale of brown bear skulls and
38 hides with the claws attached is legal under general
39 State regulations in unit 23 as of July 1st, 2017.
40 However brown bears harvested under a State subsistence
41 registration permit in unit 23 as currently required
42 under Federal regulations that are either removed from
43 the subsistence area or presented for commercial
44 tanning, must be sealed by a designated sealing officer
45 and the skin of the head and the front claws must be
46 removed and kept by the Alaska Department of Fish and
47 Game. Federal regulations currently allow the harvest
48 of one brown bear annually in unit 23 by State
49 registration permit therefore requiring that the front
50

1 claws be removed and kept by ADF&G upon sealing.

2

3 In 2008 the Board adopted proposal 08-
4 52 to allow the sale of handicrafts made from the fur
5 of a brown bear taken in unit 23 so that subsistence
6 users could more fully utilize the brown bear resource.

7

8

9 In 2012 the Board adopted proposal 12-
10 01 to require sealing of brown bear hides and claws
11 prior to selling handicrafts that incorporate these
12 parts. This was done in order to ensure that marketed
13 handicrafts were made from legally harvested bears.
14 The proposal was submitted by the Brown Bear Claw
15 Handicraft Working Group.

16

17

18 In 2016 the Board of Game adopted
19 proposal 57 to allow the sale of brown bear hides
20 and/or skulls by Alaska residents in units where the
21 harvest limit is two or more bears annually. The
22 proposal was submitted by the Nushagak Advisory
23 Committee with the stated intent of encouraging brown
24 bear harvest to reduce predation on moose and caribou
25 and to reduce bear hazards around communities.

26

27

28 In 2017 the Board of Game adopted
29 proposal 40 to increase the resident brown bear harvest
30 limit in unit 23 to two bears per regulatory year. The
31 Board of Game supported the proposal because it
32 provided more harvest opportunity because there are no
33 conservation concerns and because it was supported by
34 five local Fish and Game Advisory Committees.

35

36

37 In November of this year the Board of
38 Game will hear proposal 49. This proposal requests
39 that a permit be required before brown bear skulls and
40 hides with claws attached can be sold. This proposal
41 was submitted by the Department of Fish and Game
42 because there is currently no method to track the sale
43 of bears harvested in areas where the harvest limit is
44 two brown bears per regulatory year. The proponent
45 states that this proposal will allow the Alaska
46 Department of Fish and Game to track and quantify the
47 interest in selling brown bear skulls and hides with
48 the claws attached. The proponent also states that
49 there are concerns about the potential to commercialize
50 the harvest of brown bears and that there is interest
in knowing the magnitude of this use.

49

50

1 Raw, untanned with claws attached and
2 skulls, hides with skulls attached and skulls [sic] do
3 not align with the definition of a handicraft, but
4 these items may be sold more appropriately under
5 customary trade. Federal subsistence regulations
6 define customary trade in 50 CFR 100.4 as exchange for
7 cash of fish and wildlife resources regulated in this
8 part not otherwise prohibited by Federal law or
9 regulation to support personal and family needs and
10 does not include trade which constitutes a significant
11 commercial enterprise. If defined as customary trade
12 the sale of raw, untanned hides and skulls of brown
13 bears under Federal regulations would still require
14 adherence to the meat salvage regulations.

15
16 The issue of claw retention was
17 examined extensively by the Brown Bear Claw Handicraft
18 Working Group that was formed by the Board in 2009 to
19 discuss a range of issues relating to brown bear claws
20 including their use in handicraft, the feasibility of
21 tracking and potential changes to regulations. A
22 particular concern to this group was preventing the
23 illegal harvest and sale of brown bear parts that can
24 garner significant monetary value in worldwide markets
25 and which may incentivize illegal harvest of brown bear
26 populations elsewhere in North America where
27 conservation concerns are prevalent.

28
29 Brown bears have long been a highly
30 respected and utilized subsistence resource in
31 Northwest Alaska and the species has a prominent
32 physical and symbolic role in the lives of local
33 people. These animals provide a source of meat, raw
34 materials and medicine within the Inupiaq culture of
35 the region. Brown bears have also been prized as
36 trophy sporthunting animals in the region largely by
37 non-Native residents of the regional hubs of Nome and
38 Kotzebue. The hunting of brown bears in the Inupiaq
39 culture traditionally required strict adherence to
40 prescribed practices designed to show respect to the
41 animal and a hunter's success was considered dependent
42 on adherence to these protocols. The use of brown
43 bears for food in the region is variable among the
44 communities in the region depending on the geographic
45 location. Inland communities eat brown bear more
46 frequently while coastal communities rarely eat the
47 species unless it is harvested in interior areas where
48 bears feed on fish and berries. Coastal bears are
49 often considered unpalatable due to their tendency to
50

1 consume marine mammal carcasses along the beaches.
2 Among the edible parts of a brown bear the fat is the
3 most prized. Local hunters time their hunting to
4 correspond with when bears have the most fat and the
5 meat is of highest quality.

6
7 Customary trade is a longstanding
8 practice among Alaska Native cultures throughout Alaska
9 and closely resembles bartering practices with the
10 introduction of monetary exchange. In 2010 data on
11 customary trade for one Inupiaq community in the
12 Northwest Arctic Borough, Selawik, was documented by
13 the Department of Fish and Game. During the study
14 year, 2010 to 2011, approximately 32 percent of
15 households engaged in customary trade though brown bear
16 hides and skulls were not included in these
17 transactions.

18
19 The preliminary OSM conclusion is to
20 oppose proposal 18-44. Adoption of this proposal is
21 unlikely to significantly increase subsistence
22 opportunities for area residents. Few residents of
23 unit 23 hunt brown bears under Federal or State
24 subsistence regulations due to the meat salvage
25 requirements and the sealing requirements. These
26 requirements would remain in place if this proposal was
27 adopted.

28
29 There are law enforcement and
30 conservation concerns regarding the sale of brown bear
31 products. Global markets do drive high prices for
32 brown bear parts and are known to encourage poaching.
33 Increasing market availability and/or prices of brown
34 bear products may intensify illegal harvest from those
35 populations. Tracking the illegal harvest and sale of
36 brown bear products is very difficult.

37
38 Furthermore customary trade of animal
39 products may not rise to the level of a significant
40 commercial enterprise, but defining and enforcing the
41 parameters is challenging. Given the unaltered nature
42 of the products requested in this proposal, these
43 products also do not meet the requirements of a
44 handicraft which may already be sold under Federal
45 subsistence regulations. While there is evidence of a
46 general pattern of customary trade of wildlife in unit
47 23 there is no documented pattern as it relates
48 specifically to brown bears especially the hides and
49 skulls of the species. The most recently documented
50

1 harvest data for brown bears suggests that harvest by
2 local residents for food is low. Additionally the
3 proponent lists several justifications for the request,
4 but none of these indicate that adoption of this
5 proposal would facilitate patterns of customary trade.

6
7 Lastly population data for brown bears
8 in unit 23 is sparse and variable. Brown bear
9 populations are slow to recover from overharvest and
10 commercial incentivization may increase the risk of
11 overharvest from potentially vulnerable populations
12 elsewhere.

13
14 Thank you, Mr. Chair and members of the
15 Council.

16
17 I'd be happy to try to answer any
18 questions that you have.

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

21
22 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach,
25 I was trying to see where we're at. Go ahead, Zach.

26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair, that brings
28 us to item number 2 which was the report on Board and
29 tribal consultations. I don't have that information in
30 front of me at the moment, I'll report back to that
31 information as soon as I have it available.

32
33 Additionally we have following that
34 agency comments including ADF&G Federal and tribal
35 comments.

36
37 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. So do we
40 have anyone from ADF&G.

41
42 Come up to the table please, state your
43 name.

44
45 MR. HANSEN: Yeah, this is Alex Hansen,
46 Alaska Department of Fish and Game here in Kotzebue.
47 And I guess I just want to make a quick statement that,
48 you know, current State regulations do allow the sale
49 of brown bear hides and skulls in, you know, areas
50

1 where there's two bear harvest limits.

2
3 So just wanted to make that position
4 known.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So opposed?

9
10 MR. HANSEN: We are in support of that
11 based on the regulations currently on the books.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Anyone
14 from the Federal.

15
16 (No comments)

17
18 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Anyone from the
19 Federal on WP 18-44.

20
21 (No comments)

22
23 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
28 And I've been informed that there are no -- just to
29 clarify the item that was before us a moment ago,
30 report on Board consultations, there are no tribal or
31 ANCSA corporation comments on proposal 18-44.

32
33 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

34
35 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. So we're
36 on four now, right?

37
38 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, sir.

39
40 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Other regional
41 councils, Fish and Game Advisory Committee.

42
43 MS. ATKINSON: Hi, this is Hannah with
44 the -- Hannah Atkinson with the National Park Service
45 reading the comments from the Cape Krusenstern National
46 Monument SRC. The Commission voted to take no action
47 on WP 18-44.

48
49 In discussion Alex Whiting expressed
50

1 concern that the proposal would necessitate that NPS
2 administer the bear hunt because of conflicts with the
3 State requirements some of what Josh mentioned in the
4 analysis. Hannah Loon also expressed that it was not
5 traditional to sell hides.

6
7 And the comment from the Kobuk Valley
8 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission, the
9 Commission voted to take no action. In discussion of
10 the proposal, Shil Downey said, I have never heard of
11 people selling hides and claws, this would be putting
12 other people's values on us.

13
14 Thanks.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

17
18 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

21
22 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
23 Through the Chair. There was a regional advisory
24 council who met, that's the Western Interior
25 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council, that met on
26 October 10th and 11th in Fairbanks. And they did
27 comment on proposal -- wildlife proposal 18-44. And
28 specifically the Western Interior Subsistence Regional
29 Advisory Council wondered whether a permitting process
30 would make the proposal more palatable to the Office of
31 Subsistence Management, but that it was necessary for
32 the Northwest Arctic Council.....

33
34 Thank you. I'm going to repeat myself
35 for the record. Apparently there was an audio issue.

36
37 Regarding other regional advisory
38 councils and their comments on wildlife proposal 18-44.
39 The Council wondered whether or not a permitting
40 process would make the proposal more palatable to the
41 Office of Subsistence Management, but that it was
42 necessary for the Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional
43 Advisory Council to wade through the issue and deal
44 with the complexity of the issue. And the Western
45 Interior Council voted to take no action and defer it
46 to the home region to address.

47
48 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach.
2 Take a short break, I guess, audio/video problems.

3
4 (Off record)

5
6 (On record)

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We're back in
9 line. We are now legal again.

10
11 And so, Zach, where -- I see we're on
12 public comments now or what?

13
14 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair,
15 we're on number 5 which is the summary of written
16 public comments.

17
18 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, that's you,
19 right?

20
21 MR. STEVENSON: We have -- yes.
22 Through the Chair, yes. We received as I mentioned
23 previously one written public comment and that public
24 comment letter is on page 100 of your meeting books.

25
26 And the letter was submitted by as I
27 stated previously, Mr. Sterling Miller, retired Alaska
28 Department of Fish and Game research biologist of Lolo,
29 Montana and Mr. Clait E. Braun, past president of the
30 Wildlife Society and former editor of the Journal of
31 Wildlife Management of Tucson, Arizona. Those two
32 gentlemen oppose wildlife proposal 18-44 on the grounds
33 that they felt that there was not an overabundance of
34 brown bear in unit 23, that the best means to reduce
35 conflicts of bears was to minimize or to address
36 reduction of human interactions with brown bears and
37 stating that the concern for providing opportunity for
38 profit may be driving proposal 18-44.

39
40 And that concludes the summary of
41 written public comments received for wildlife proposal
42 18-44.

43
44 Mr. Chair.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

47
48 Anyone else.

49
50

1 You guys, you on the table, what were
2 you -- okay.

3
4 MR. STEVENSON: So we have.....

5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Now that was
7 our public from this guy, he oppose it, right?

8
9 MR. STEVENSON: The written public --
10 through the Chair, yes. The one written public comment
11 opposed wildlife proposal 18-44 as written. And that
12 -- pardon me.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Now you could
15 take over on number 7, recommendation, motion to adopt.

16
17 MR. STEVENSON: Public testimony.

18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I thought that was
20 the public testimony.

21
22 MR. STEVENSON: No, we skipped --
23 through the Chair. We skipped public testimony and I'm
24 curious if there's anyone in the audience or on
25 telephone that would -- wanted to provide public
26 testimony on wildlife proposal 18-44.

27
28 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you. It
31 was my mistake. First we're on number 5.

32
33 Anyone else on the public comments out
34 there in the radioland.

35
36 (No comments)

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not.....

39
40 MS. OKADA: Mr. Chair.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.

43
44 MS. OKADA: This is Marcy Okada with
45 the National Park Service for the Gates of the Arctic
46 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission. They
47 have a comment for WP 18-44.

48
49 Under Federal subsistence regulation

50

1 you are required to salvage the meat. There would have
2 to be a separate proposal to change that part. It
3 should have been included in the original proposal to
4 eliminate the salvage and meat in game management unit
5 23. You can sell the skin and skull, but to disregard
6 the meat is illegal.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. You get
9 that, Zach?

10
11 MR. STEVENSON: I did, yes.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Okay. Thank
14 you, Marcy.

15
16 Anyone else on radioland.

17
18 (No comments)

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Now
21 moving on to number 7 and I will hand it over to Zach.

22
23 MR. STEVENSON: So at this point, Mr.
24 Chair, the Council makes the recommendation whether to
25 support, modify or oppose the proposal followed by a
26 discussion and justification.

27
28 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

29
30 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So we need to
31 propose, right?

32
33 MR. STEVENSON: We need a motion to
34 adopt and that can also include a motion to adopt with
35 modification or oppose.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

38
39 Anyone from the Council.

40
41 Go ahead, Vern.

42
43 MR. CLEVELAND: I make a motion to
44 adopt 18-44 proposal.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Do I have a second.

47
48 MR. KRAMER: Second.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Second by Kramer. Go
2 ahead, Zach, go ahead and finish number 7.

3
4 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5
6 That takes us to justification and
7 discussion.

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We are now open for
10 discussion on proposal 18-44.

11
12 Anyone from the Council.

13
14 Go ahead, Vern.

15
16 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, that -- we are --
17 we drew past this to sell skull and hide. What about
18 the gall bladder?

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We didn't address
21 this at the time.

22
23 MR. CLEVELAND: I mean, if you're going
24 to sell the hide and skull, what about the gall
25 bladder. Are we going to sell this, the same thing,
26 and as it is because if you sell hide and skull I'm
27 pretty sure they going to be buying that gall bladder
28 too. And it's -- if we do sell I'm pretty sure he's
29 going to buy the gall bladder too.

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

32
33 MR. CLEVELAND: Because it's -- that
34 gall bladder is potent.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I understand what
37 you're saying.

38
39 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chair.

40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.
42 I'll get to you later, Zach.

43
44 MR. COMMACK: I would oppose the sale
45 of anything because it needs further discussion for
46 merit. He just brought out some of the issues that
47 might come up as we move on down the history of what
48 we're trying to do. I would think that we should take
49 the time, it's not in our traditional values that we
50

1 sell animals.

2

3 My recommendation, it merits further
4 discussion.

5

6 Thank you.

7

8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thanks, Louie.

9

10 Go ahead, Zach.

11

12 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 The -- addressing Member Cleveland's question, the
14 proposal as written does not address the sale of bear
15 gall bladders.

16

17 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18

19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, but -- okay.
20 Under discussion with Louie's comment, that was never
21 brought up, the gall bladder. And I think Louie's
22 completely right, at the time it did not even dawn on
23 me that they could try to -- since they could sell the
24 skull like Vern say, the claws and stuff like that,
25 they might try to translate it that they could sell the
26 gall bladder. And I know even me was approached by
27 people to see if I could get a bear for the gall
28 bladder and I said when do you want me to visit you
29 when you're in jail. I said I'm the Chairman for the
30 Federal and he left me now in debt real quick. And I
31 hear when this came up I was approached locally, right
32 here in Kotzebue, two different people approached me if
33 I could sell them the blad -- gall bladder. And I
34 said, no, I will not. Louie's right, I think this one
35 needs more discussion and I think we need to revisit
36 this proposal in the future and talk this over a lot
37 better because it might put our young people that don't
38 understand this regulation, if I -- you know, if they
39 could sell part of it they got to sell all of it.

40

41 So it's up to the Council what they
42 want to do with this.

43

44 Do you want to oppose this proposal,
45 Vern, or what, or take no action on it?

46

47 MR. CLEVELAND: We could vote.

48

49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Kramer.

50

1 MR. KRAMER: I'm just discussing it
2 here with Enoch and I think it is -- you know, it
3 should be adopted as such, but aligned with the State
4 because the State now we just approved last night that
5 would require a permit in order to sell a hide and
6 skull. So the State would have to align along us with--
7 I mean, the Federal or the -- the sale of these hides
8 and skulls would have to align with the State's
9 regulations where it requires a permit. This bear --
10 this hide and skull would be sealed by the State and
11 then if it was sold then it would require a permit to
12 sell that hide and skull. That way it's tracked, you
13 know, and that way there's no unnecessary --
14 unauthorized selling of other body parts. And that
15 claws should be placed in there that those unauthorized
16 body parts are not sold, that they are destroyed on
17 scene. That way it's not promoting poaching and people
18 are -- it's promoting people to be able to put money in
19 their pockets in a place of hardship. The cost of
20 living in this region is crazy. You know, it -- people
21 don't want to go commercial, they just want to be able
22 to put money in their pockets because jobs are very
23 limited, the cost of living in these villages are just
24 absolutely outrageous, \$14 a gallon for gas in Ambler
25 and Shungnak. You know, we're just trying to help out
26 people here who are having a tough time and if we could
27 benefit the people who are legally and doing this
28 legally and being able to support their families and
29 also taking a proactive role in decreasing the bear
30 population in this region. That is the sole purpose of
31 this proposal is to take care of the population
32 increase of bears in this region to prevent conflict
33 between bears and people.

34
35 Thank you.

36
37 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

40
41 MR. MITCHELL: Doesn't seem like we
42 need -- we just got through passing three bears per
43 season. Now you could get three bears. I ask this
44 question. Why would you want to get three bears, you
45 need lots of meat or you just want to kill the bears.
46 And if you do you've got the claws, you got the skin,
47 you got three sets of claws, three skins, are you going
48 to use them all. I see -- I know there's a cause of
49 this, but I'm pretty sure there's pretty good people in
50

1 there that's responsible. But I seen carvers made a
2 necklace out of the claws on the bear and sell them to
3 get gas to go hunt. You have to hunt them. And three
4 bear skins, I don't need three bear skins. It would be
5 good to sell one for gas.

6
7 And so you got to think about your
8 actions, what you just made two, you just -- you just
9 allow people to get three bears. Now you started to
10 say people might go kill bears just for the claws or
11 just for the gall bladder. Why you guys going to say
12 that after you guys make it three bears now, why didn't
13 you guys change that three bears to one bear so they
14 won't get the claws. And I understand you guys are
15 going to kill three bears for protection, for family,
16 but that -- I understand that.

17
18 And you got to think of our actions, of
19 what we do here.

20
21 We just made three bears and I believe
22 we should make that same opportunity for those that got
23 those three bears to be able to make money, to get gas.

24
25 Thank you.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you,
28 Enoch.

29
30 Yeah, go ahead.

31
32 DR. REAM: Thank you, Mr. Chair. For
33 the record this is Joshua Ream. I just wanted to point
34 out two things. Currently the Federal regulations link
35 the hunt to the State subsistence registration permit
36 therefore if it stays coupled you do have to turn over
37 the skin of the head and the front claws. Don't want
38 to take you down a rabbit hole, but if your Council
39 decides to support this proposal on page 93 of your
40 Council books we've walked through an alternative which
41 was to support, but we would need to do several things.
42 One would be to uncouple the regulations from the State
43 subsistence permit so in a sense create a general hunt
44 on the Federal side as well as explicitly say in the
45 regulations that this would be for sale through
46 customary trade.

47
48 And then we would like to have
49 additional discussion from your Council on how this
50

1 meets the definition of customary trade.
2
3 Thank you.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
6
7 Anyone else.
8
9 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.
12
13 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair. Dr.
14 Ream, for your -- for clarification you're suggesting
15 that what you've just -- what you just mentioned could
16 be a potential modification.
17
18 DR. REAM: This is Josh Ream. I --
19 yes, it would need to be a modification in order for
20 this to be enacted in Federal regulation, both of those
21 criteria separating from the State's subsistence
22 registration hunt and including the language through
23 customary trade would need to take place for this to
24 become regulation.
25
26 Thank you.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
29
30 Go ahead, Zach.
31
32 MR. STEVENSON: And a follow-up
33 question being you mentioned the need -- if this
34 modification as you've just described were to be
35 entertained by the Council that there would need to be
36 clarification of customary trade.
37
38 Can you please elaborate on that?
39
40 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
41
42 DR. REAM: Sure. Because the Council
43 is asking for the sale of products that are unaltered
44 they would not meet the definition of a handicraft. In
45 order for the sale to then take place it -- a more
46 appropriate spot in the regulation would be through
47 customary trade, but in order to express to the Board
48 what your justification for that would be, you'd need
49 to probably have additional discussion about when and
50

1 how this is done, when it's been done traditionally if
2 it has, et cetera.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

7

8 Go ahead, Zach.

9

10 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
11 I -- through the Chair. I wasn't aware of that
12 development and I just wanted to make certain that that
13 information is clear because it does provide another
14 item for consideration by this Council.

15

16 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17

18 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Correct me -- which
19 agency are you with? I'm getting.....

20

21 DR. REAM: I'm an anthropologist with
22 the Office of Subsistence Management, U.S. Fish and
23 Wildlife Service.

24

25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
26 Yeah, go ahead.

27

28 MR. MCKEE: I'm probably just going to
29 repeat what Zach -- sorry, Josh has already said here,
30 but right now under current Federal regulations for
31 brown bears in unit 23 it's a -- requiring a State
32 subsistence registration permit. And so one of the
33 requirements for that permit as he's already stated is
34 that the skin and -- the skin of the head and front
35 claws would be removed by ADF&G if you hunt under that
36 permit. And so because you -- what you want to be able
37 to trade is the skull and the hide with the claws
38 attached, you would need to modify to uncouple it from
39 that State requirement. You can't just simply support
40 it and move on because it's -- you need to change that
41 Federal regulation that couples the harvest of brown
42 bears with that State subsistence registration permit
43 because if you stay with that the claws go away. You
44 can't -- it's not going to get you what you want so
45 you're going to have to have some modification.

46

47 Right now there's a proposal that's
48 going to be coming before the Board of Game next month
49 to allow this kind of trade in areas where there's a
50

1 two bear bag limit to allow -- by a State permit, to
2 allow for the sale of these parts. But right now
3 there's no specific State regulation so I think what
4 would probably happen is if you guys modified it as we
5 discuss on page 93 through a Federal permit that's
6 probably what we would take to the Board and then
7 probably have some discussion with the State depending
8 on how the Board of Game comes down in the State
9 proposal next month. So it's fairly complicated sorry
10 to say.

11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.

13
14 MR. STEVENSON: For those on the
15 telephone there's been some deliberation about the
16 information that was just shared by Dr. Ream and Mr.
17 McKee. And if I could summarize and correct me, Chris,
18 if I'm not describing this accurately. The
19 consideration could be to -- for the Council to
20 potentially modify wildlife proposal 18-44 to adopt the
21 modifications that have been outlined by Josh, by Dr.
22 Ream, to allow for -- I'll leave it at that.

23
24 Is that an accurate description of one
25 potential path of action.

26
27 MR. MCKEE: Yeah, we're discussing the
28 other alternatives considered which I believe is on
29 page, what is it, 93 of the analysis of the analysis.
30 So that's what would need to be modified if you want to
31 support this proposal.

32
33 That would be the necessary
34 modification to uncouple it from that State subsistence
35 registration permit.

36
37 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead, Zach.

40
41 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

42
43 On page 93, the modification would read
44 the utilization of fish, wildlife or shellfish. Item
45 (13), you may sell raw, untanned, tanned hide or cape
46 from a legally harvested caribou, deer, elk, goat,
47 moose, muskox or sheep.

48
49 Item lower case (i), you may sell

50

1 through customary trade the skull or raw, untanned or
2 tanned hide with claws attached and the skull from up to
3 two brown bears legally harvested on Federal public
4 lands in unit 23 annually. And each skull or hide must
5 be sealed by an ADF&G representative prior to sale.

6
7 And then addressing unit 23 brown bear,
8 unit 23 brown bear, one bear by State subsistence
9 registration permit August 1 to May 31st or one bear by
10 Federal registration permit, August 1 to May 31st.

11
12 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So on this proposal
15 in order for us to do this better I'd - do we need to
16 revise this proposal 18-44 to this consideration the
17 way you read it out from page 93, right? So as a
18 Council we need to oppose this or could we support it
19 with modification later through this here?

20
21 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
26 With the information that's been shared we need to
27 state very clearly what is the intent of the Council,
28 do you want to see proposal 18-44 as written adopted,
29 modified or opposed and explain why and then we'll take
30 a roll call vote.

31
32 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. The roll call
35 vote is just the way it's written on page 74.

36
37 MR. STEVENSON: So.....

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Because what they're
40 telling us is on our proposal 18-44 will not work
41 unless we -- better to work if we modify it to the
42 State's regulation, right?

43
44 MR. MCKEE: Mr. Chair, if you want to
45 get at what you -- the original proposal wants, you're
46 going to have to go with the modification as described
47 on page 93 of the analysis.

48
49 You have to uncouple the hunt of brown
50

1 bears in unit 23 from that State subsistence
2 registration permit in order to sell the parts you're
3 talking about in the proposal. It doesn't remove the
4 State registration permit, people can still hunt under
5 those regulations, they just wouldn't be able to sell
6 any parts from those bears harvested under that permit
7 because it requires that the claws stay attached to the
8 hide. And so in order to sell the hide with the claws
9 attached as was the desire of this proposal, you need
10 to uncouple from that permit and have a Federal
11 registration permit allowing people that hunt under
12 that permit to sell these parts. And clarify that it's
13 through customary trade. So in order to get what you
14 want in this proposal you would need to modify it as
15 it's described on page 93 of the analysis.

16
17 That's the simplest way I know how to
18 describe it.

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. From the
21 Council I need someone to propose it as he said it.

22
23 So I need someone.

24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

28
29 MR. STEVENSON: So again the way to
30 achieve the Council's intent would be to have the
31 Council adopt wildlife proposal 18-44 with the OSM
32 modification as stated on page 93.

33
34 And again that approach would meet the
35 Council's wishes.

36
37 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

38
39 MR. MITCHELL: You need a motion?

40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

42
43 REPORTER: People on the phone say
44 you're really faint and they're having a hard time
45 hearing you.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
48 Sorry about that, radioland.

49
50

1 state the only thing allowable for the hunt of brown
2 bears is via State registration permit. So in the
3 modification that you've -- you want to vote on on page
4 93 uncouples the Federal regulations and allows for two
5 ways for people to hunt brown bear. Either you can
6 continue to hunt under the State subsistence
7 registration permit and not be able to sell these brown
8 bear parts as you're requesting in the analysis or you
9 can hunt by Federal registration permit.

10
11 That would be a brand new regulation
12 under Federal regulations.

13
14 If you harvested a brown bear under
15 that Federal registration permit you would be allowed
16 to sell up to two brown bears with the skull and the
17 hide with the claws attached.

18
19 And so because right now that proposal
20 that we're talking about on the State side has not gone
21 before the Board of Game yet, they're going to be
22 talking about it next month, but right now there's no
23 State regulation. So they're going to be talking about
24 it next month. When it comes up to the Board the Board
25 may have two choices. Assuming the Board of Game
26 adopts that regulation they may choose to just have a
27 separate Federal registration permit, but a lot of
28 times the Board likes to go along with the State
29 permitting system because it's cleaner, it's less
30 confusing, but right now there is -- that doesn't
31 exist.

32
33 So we need some method for the Council
34 to vote to move forward to uncouple from the current
35 State subsistence registration permit in order to allow
36 for the sale of these parts as was requested in the
37 original proposal.

38
39 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: I'm not hearing
40 you, sir.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: He must be up close
43 to the mic, I don't know what's wrong. Our volume on
44 this side might be low.

45
46 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Are you playing?

47
48 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Can you hear us
49 better now on radioland?

50

1 MR. McKEE: I think somebody needs to
2 mute their phone, we're hearing some crosstalk. I
3 don't think that had anything to do with what we were
4 discussing.

5
6 So again the modification on page 93 is
7 a requirement if you want to the intent of what you're
8 asking for in the proposal to go forward under Federal
9 regulations right now.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. The way I
12 understand you is we need to modify to page 93?

13
14 MR. McKEE: Correct.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Correct. But, I
17 mean, my vote or my proposal -- that way we could do it
18 legally, that way we would be under one regulation by
19 the State and the Federal, it'll be passed easier by
20 the Board of Game. Is that right?

21
22 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chair.

23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Louie.

25
26 MR. COMMACK: Thank you. I refer back
27 my comment to Mr. Cleveland's comment about certain
28 body parts that are not listed in this modification you
29 want to talk about. Okay. If we're going to do a
30 modification exactly -- I would like to know the exact
31 wording.

32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, you have
34 the floor.

35
36 MR. McKEE: Through the Chair. Zach
37 already ready the exact modification and it's on page
38 93 of the analysis, it's the other alternatives
39 considered.

40
41 Are you -- do you have your analysis
42 open to page 93? That's the modification we're
43 discussing. And it's very specific, it says you may
44 sell through customary trade the skull, raw, untanned
45 or tanned hide with claws attached and the skull from
46 up to two brown bears legally harvested on Federal
47 public lands in unit 23 annually. Any skull or hide
48 must be sealed by an ADF&G representative prior to its
49 sale.

50

1 And then we have the existing Federal
2 regulation which is by one State -- one bear by State
3 subsistence registration permit or one bear by Federal
4 registration permit. And that Federal registration
5 permit is the -- is the modification that would be
6 required in order to sell those parts.

7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, and I hear what
9 Louie's saying and Vern is saying earlier that they're
10 worried about the gall bladder. Is there any way that
11 we could modify -- add not to sell the gall bladder,
12 right?

13
14 DR. REAM: Mr. Chair, this is Joshua
15 Ream for the record. It is -- you are not able to sell
16 the gall bladders of brown bears currently and you
17 would not be able to if this was passed.

18
19 Thank you.

20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Did you get that
22 Louie, can't sell the gall bladder right now.

23
24 MR. COMMACK: Pardon.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You can't sell the
27 gall bladder right now under State regulation and the
28 Federal regulation.

29
30 MR. COMMACK: I -- Mr. Chair, thank
31 you. I fully understand that, the section you're
32 talking about. What I'm referring to Mr. Cleveland's
33 comment is the black market.

34
35 MR. MCKEE: Through the Chair. I mean,
36 if people are going to break the law they're going to
37 break the law regardless of whether we have -- I mean,
38 it's they're already -- they would already be breaking
39 the law under both State and Federal regulations
40 regardless of what goes on here today. We can't --
41 people are going to -- if people are bound and
42 determined to do something illegally they're going to
43 do it regardless of how this Council acts on this
44 proposal.

45
46 You can't stop people from doing the
47 wrong thing basically.

48
49 I don't know how else to put it.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.
2
3 MR. COMMACK: No comment on that.
4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Vern.
6
7 MR. CLEVELAND: So you want me to
8 rephrase my motion to modification to this?
9
10 MR. MCKEE: I think we already have
11 that on the record if I'm not mistaken.
12
13 MR. CLEVELAND: Okay.
14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Kramer. I have to
16 look at you to get your name.
17
18 MR. COMMACK: Go ahead.
19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Kramer.
21
22 MR. KRAMER: You know, this whole thing
23 is getting confusing.
24
25 You know, all we're trying to do is
26 just control a population. And it's not a permanent
27 regulation, it's not a permanent regulation, it's just
28 a temporary thing, you know, to see if we can at least
29 somewhat start bringing them down to where they're
30 within a reasonable limit.
31
32 You know, the sale of gall bladders,
33 that is absolutely illegal.
34
35 What we're trying to do is we're just
36 trying to make honest people be able to put a little
37 money in their pocket because of the cost of living
38 within this area is tough. That's all we're trying to
39 do. We want to bring down the bear population to where
40 it's within a reasonable limit and to legally be able
41 to sell bear hides and skulls. It's nothing difficult,
42 you shouldn't have to go through, you know, a train, go
43 grope whatever it is just to be able to sell them.
44 Yeah, it should be able to align with the State. If I
45 harvest two bears and if I want to sell one of them I
46 should be able to sell one of them. But I should be
47 able to get a permit to sell that animal, that hide and
48 skull if need be. That way you're tracking, you're
49 tracking what is being sold and how much is being sold.
50

1 I mean, if I sold one I would do it to get rich.

2

3 You know, the one question I have is
4 let's just say I'm out there and I'm up Kobuk River and
5 I'm on Federal lands and I shoot a grizzly bear and I
6 claim him under my State general hunt where I don't
7 have to harvest the meat, but I do have to bring the
8 hide and skull in to have it sealed. That's legal,
9 State, somebody?

10

11 DR. REAM: Through the Chair. This is
12 Joshua Ream. The State does allow the sale of those
13 items under their general hunt, but if this was done
14 under the Federal regulations the meat salvage
15 requirements would still be in place. And I just
16 wanted to point out if this is done under customary
17 trade according to the definition it would be to
18 support personal and family needs. The definition of
19 customary trade says nothing about the reduction of
20 predator populations.

21

22 Thank you.

23

24 MR. KRAMER: My question is I'm on the
25 Kobuk River, I shoot a grizzly bear. But if I want to
26 claim it under my State, I bring it into Alaska
27 Department of Fish and Game, have it sealed, I do not
28 harvest the meat under the general hunt. Can I -- I
29 mean, can I legally sell that under the general hunt
30 under the State permit?

31

32 MS. ATKINSON: I believe -- we can look
33 it up in our regulation book, but I believe that if
34 you're on the Kobuk Valley National Park then you have
35 to be hunting under the Federal subsistence hunt which
36 is administered by the State, but there's a State hunt
37 where you don't have to salvage the meat and there's
38 the Federal subsistence hunt which is administered by
39 the State. So you go over there to get your permit,
40 but it's a Federal hunt where you're doing it for
41 subsistence purposes to harvest the meat.

42

43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You know, to make
44 everything less confusing I think what we need to do is
45 put our State and the Federal regulations together,
46 that way they will be one. That's the problem we're
47 having, State lands and the Federal lands. And that's
48 what he saying. He get it in the Federal land, yet
49 when he come to Kotzebue he could register it under --

50

1 he get it under the State land. That's what he's
2 saying. I think what we need to do is forget
3 everything, let's start over and modify, just put them
4 all one regulation. If we're going to make it easier
5 on everybody we -- just follow the State regulation and
6 forget everything. We don't have to worry about
7 proposals from the Federal people anymore or us.
8 That's just a feeling I'm getting now.

9
10

Go ahead.

11
12

13 MS. ATKINSON: I understand your desire
14 to do that to reduce confusion, but the reality is that
15 we have a game unit that is State land and it's Federal
16 land and there's different land ownership. And the
17 reason that we have the regulation on Kobuk Valley
18 National Park is that there's only Federal subsistence
19 hunting there, there is no hunting by any other users
20 besides the Federally-qualified subsistence users. And
21 so people who are hunting under the State regulation
22 aren't hunting on the Federal lands with those
23 regulations.

24
25

26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Someone
27 else had their hand, was it you, Zach, on this side?

28
29

No.

30
31

Who was it or am I seeing things now.

32
33

Go ahead, Zach.

34
35

36 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
37 And again just to clarify I think that the Council has
38 stated clearly on the record the -- their concerns and
39 the support for adopting wildlife proposal 18-44 as
40 modified and the modifications being reflected on page
41 93 of your meeting books.

42
43

44 And what I hear the Wildlife Division
45 chief, Chris McKee stating, is that those modifications
46 would get us -- would get the Council closest to its
47 desire as stated in the original proposal as written.
48 And that what that modification would allow for is a
49 legal approach that would be in the interest of the
50 Council so that the proposal could be implemented
effectively.

49
50

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Go ahead.

2
3 MS. ATKINSON: I just want to make sure
4 that everyone's clear because with those modifications
5 on page 93 it's making -- so right now you go to the
6 State office to get your permits for -- if you're going
7 to do a subsistence bear hunt and harvest the meat you
8 go to the State office, if you're going to do a bear
9 hunt and not harvest the meat you're going to go to the
10 State office. And this would require -- these
11 modifications would change it a lot so that the State
12 is no longer able to administer the hunt and the
13 Federal agencies have to administer the hunt. So it
14 would create this new system of getting bear permits,
15 bear hunting subsistence permits.

16
17 So I just wanted to make sure that's
18 clear because these questions are coming up about the
19 different bear hunts and the State and the Federal
20 management of it.

21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. I got you.....

23
24 MS. ATKINSON: Okay.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:maybe.

27
28 MS. ATKINSON: It's no problem if you
29 don't.....

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, but.....

32
33 MS. ATKINSON:we can talk about
34 it.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:now we have to
37 go back to Vern's concern, the gall bladder. I know
38 it's not on the table or it's not written, we have to
39 address his concern because that's part of it. I know
40 it's going to be under black market.

41
42 Vern, I -- you hear what I'm saying, I
43 want to address your gall bladder because personally I
44 was approached by two people here in Kotzebue. I hear
45 what he's saying. And Commack supported him.

46
47 We need to move on this -- with this
48 proposal here, adopt it or not. With -- maybe with
49 modification as in written number 93, but the question
50

1 is back to this, when do we address Vern's concern on
2 the gall bladder.

3

4 Go ahead, Zach.

5

6 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.

7

8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.

9

10 MR. BALLOT: I've been listening to the
11 conversation and you're all making a lot of sense, but
12 I'm trying to think, you know, when we were first
13 concerned about bears, that we're getting overpopulated
14 with bears and I'm for one trying to make it something
15 easy for people to get -- be able to get the bear
16 population down whether it's subsistence or general
17 hunt. And I'm not really so much as customary trade
18 and stuff, but if we were to focus on that, I don't
19 know why we need to be worried about gall bladders,
20 it's against the law anyway already.

21

22 So I think our focus should be whether
23 we want to downsize the caribou or do we need to work
24 on our -- try to make available more -- use up the hide
25 or claws or something.

26

27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

28

29 MS. DAGGETT: Mr. Chair, this is Carmen
30 Daggett. I have a comment too when.....

31

32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead. That
33 was Percy Ballot.

34

35 Yeah, go ahead. You have the floor.

36

37 MS. DAGGETT: So there's two things
38 that kind of came up that I thought might be
39 appropriate to mention.

40

41 First of all is that we have a lot of
42 vendors, the State of Alaska has a lot of vendors in
43 the villages, especially where the -- well,
44 particularly in the villages where the National Park
45 Service has land too. And right now we administer a
46 lot of our permits through those vendors and make them
47 available to people in the villages that way.

48

49 And so I guess what I was thinking was

50

1 that I know that there's a State regulation right now
2 to kind of create a permit for this hunt going through
3 the Board of Game. And I'm wondering if it would make
4 sense to maybe not necessarily create a separate thing
5 right now because the State might create something that
6 will alleviate this problem a little bit more and
7 create a system for dealing with it. And then the Feds
8 could pay back off of that instead of preemptively
9 trying to create a system ahead of time and then having
10 two separate systems to deal with and two different
11 offices and two different sets of vendors in different
12 places and things. So those are just some thoughts for
13 consideration, not to muddy the water anymore, but.....

14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Thank you.

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

Go ahead, Zach.

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33

MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
I wanted to take a moment to respond to a question I
heard voiced by Member Vern Cleveland and also by
Member Louie Commack. And the question was what about
the sale of gall bladder, what about the sale of gall
bladder and how would proposal 18-44 whether adopted or
adopted as modified, affect the sale of gall bladder.
And conferring with Wildlife Division chief, Chris
McKee, we've confirmed that the sale of wildlife --
pardon me, the sale of gall bladder is presently
illegal and would remain illegal under this proposal,
whether adopted or adopted as modified.

34
35

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

36
37
38

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Okay. Thank
you. You get that, Vern and Louie?

39
40

Go ahead, Louie.

41
42
43
44

MR. COMMACK: Yeah, I fully understand
that. And I know that it's not legal. And I want to
keep it that way. I'm not supporting this.

45
46
47
48
49
50

What we're talking about is specific on
the paper itself, but then when Mr. Cleveland brought
in a few body parts that probably will create a market
by itself, illegal of course, I'm not for that.

1 That's why I asked for further
2 discussion whenever it may be, maybe take it back to my
3 village, talk about it.

4
5 Thank you.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
8 Before I get to you, Moto, what I'm hearing this is
9 maybe we've got to table this until you come back from
10 your village.

11
12 Go ahead, Moto.

13
14 MR. MOTO: Yeah, just before we vote on
15 this. I just want to pass on, I see toward the end of
16 this there's a cultural knowledge and traditional
17 practices on hunting brown bear. I was fortunate to be
18 born in the '30s and '40s where our elders used to talk
19 about it was taboo to mention that you were going to go
20 out and hunt a bear, brown bear. Not only was it
21 taboo, parts of the bear were medicine that only
22 practiced women could do. You -- you know, the liver
23 of the brown bear and the polar bear which are related,
24 you will see -- find out they're both same, but one is
25 black -- one is white, one is brown, but they're
26 related. The liver if you're -- you not supposed to
27 eat too much of it, it's very rich in vitamin A. If
28 you have a deficiency in vitamin A then they let you
29 have it, I don't know how they used to know. But they
30 knew when somebody was sick, some part of a bear like
31 the pancreas or the kidney or the liver were good for
32 you. I just wanted to bring that up before we vote
33 because it was something that I believe in tradition
34 and culture -- our culture.

35
36 So I just wanted to say that.

37
38 Thank you.

39
40 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Yeah, go
41 ahead. I think we're spending a lot of time on this
42 18-44.

43
44 Go ahead, you have the floor.

45
46 DR. REAM: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This
47 is Joshua Ream. I'll make my comment brief.

48
49 But just to respond additionally to Mr.

50

1 Commack and Mr. Cleveland, as is reflected in the
2 analysis there is concern about increasing the
3 availability of brown bear products and what that does
4 for worldwide markets. And also while you may have
5 many brown bears here in your unit, that's not
6 necessarily the case throughout the rest of North
7 America. And so increasing market availability could
8 increase the incentivization for people to poach bears
9 in other areas.

10

11 Thank you.

12

13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Go ahead.

14

15 MR. COMMACK: No, I.....

16

17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

18

19 MR. MITCHELL: I would like to say that
20 there's not all bad people out there, they're not all
21 black market people out there. There's good people in
22 the (indiscernible) do good with these bears. You
23 know, we shouldn't stop these good people from trying
24 to do good by making money for their gas or for their
25 food or for their family just to watch out for bad
26 people. If they break the law then there's the cops,
27 there's the law so let the law break them. But we
28 shouldn't look at the negative side of this too much
29 because there is a positive side of this for good
30 people to make good money. And we shouldn't stop those
31 good people just because of gall bladder or something
32 like that. I didn't even know it was the gall bladder.
33 Anyway that's the law, let the law handle that, not us,
34 we're not the law here. But we're to try to help good
35 people that try to put food on their table or get gas
36 money.

37

38 We shouldn't try to stop good people
39 like that.

40

41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch. Go
42 ahead. I'll ask Mike to make a motion on 18-44.

43

44 MR. KRAMER: I make the motion to amend
45 the current proposal, add the changes on page 93. My
46 justification is so that you can sell the hides with
47 claws and the head.

48

49 That's my justification.

50

1 MR. CLEVELAND: Second.
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Motion and a second
4 on the floor. Could I have a vote, a roll call please,
5 Zach.
6
7 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
8
9 Member Cleveland.
10
11 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes.
12
13 MR. STEVENSON: Member Mitchell.
14
15 MR. MITCHELL: Yes.
16
17 MR. STEVENSON: Member Kramer.
18
19 MR. KRAMER: Yes.
20
21 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Member Moto.
26
27 MS. MOTO: Yes.
28
29 MR. STEVENSON: Member Moto, Sr.
30
31 MR. MOTO: Oh, we're voting.
32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We're voting.
34
35 MR. STEVENSON: Voting.....
36
37 MR. MOTO: On what?
38
39 MR. STEVENSON:to adopt wildlife
40 proposal 18-44 as modified by OSM with the language
41 reflected on page 93 of your meeting book.
42
43 MR. MOTO: Yes.
44
45 MR. STEVENSON: Yes?
46
47 MR. COMMACK: And page 93 was -- what's
48 the modification?
49
50

1 MR. STEVENSON: The mod -- through the
2 Chair. The modification again as specified on page 93
3 of your meeting books would read the utilization of
4 fish and wildlife or shellfish.

5
6 You may sell the raw or untanned and
7 tanned hide or cape from a legally harvested caribou,
8 deer, elk, goat, moose, muskox and sheep.

9
10 You may sell through customary trade
11 the skull or raw, untanned or tanned hide with claws
12 attached and the skull from up to two brown bears
13 legally harvested on Federal public lands in unit 23
14 annually.

15
16 Any skull or hide must be sealed by an
17 ADF&G representative prior to sale.

18
19 And in unit 23 for brown bear one bear
20 may be harvested by State registration permit August 1
21 to May 31 or one bear by Federal registration permit
22 August 1 to May 31st.

23
24 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

27
28 Go ahead, Louie.

29
30 MR. COMMACK: I haven't voted yet.

31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You haven't -- yeah,
33 you haven't voted yet. So far we have five, four yes.

34
35 MR. COMMACK: I abstain.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Your mic, please.

38
39 MR. COMMACK: Yeah, I abstain. And I
40 would like to explain why.

41
42 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

43
44 MR. COMMACK: I abstain because again I
45 needed more time personally to go over this and talk to
46 my elders.

47
48 The way I'm understanding it is now
49 we're selling animal parts. If I'm wrong, correct me.

50

1 And maybe again and here we are selling. This is --
2 this is my justification. I'm not understanding you
3 right.

4
5 Is that -- Mr. Chairman, the question
6 to you is how much body parts are we now selling as
7 people that live off the land.

8
9 Somebody need to explain this.

10
11 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

12
13 MR. McKEE: Through the Chair. Member
14 Commack, the only thing that you would be doing if you
15 supported this proposal, the only thing that you're
16 talking about selling is the skull and the hide with
17 the claws attached.

18
19 That's it.

20
21 We're not talking about gall bladders
22 or any other part of the bear. The only thing that
23 would be allowed under Federal regulations would be the
24 parts that I just discussed.

25
26 MR. COMMACK: I still abstain.

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

29
30 Go ahead, Zach.

31
32 MR. STEVENSON: Yeah, so we have our
33 vote. Five for -- pardon me. Five for the proposal
34 18-44 as modified by OSM on page 93 of the meeting book
35 and one abstention.

36
37 Motion passes.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We are short one.

40
41 MR. STEVENSON: Pardon me.

42
43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We are short one
44 vote. We are short one from -- there's seven of us
45 here and you mentioned six.

46
47 MR. STEVENSON: Beverly, did you vote?

48
49 MS. MOTO: Uh-huh.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We haven't
2 heard Calvin's.
3
4 MR. STEVENSON: Pardon me from Ms.Moto.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, that's what I
7 never hear too, Ms. Moto.
8
9 MR. CLEVELAND: Got to turn your mic
10 on.
11
12 MR. STEVENSON: Speak loud into the
13 mic.
14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Just restate
16 what.....
17
18 MS. MOTO: I voted yes.
19
20 MR. MOTO: You turned it off before you
21 voted.
22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You turned it off too
24 early.
25
26 MR. MOTO: It's on.
27
28 MS. MOTO: Okay. Sorry. I voted yes
29 on that.
30
31 MR. MOTO: Okay. Now you can turn it
32 off.
33
34 MS. MOTO: Sorry about that.
35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: It's all right. It's
37 all right. You're new.
38
39 Now, Calvin, they need to hear your
40 vote, I heard yours earlier.
41
42 MR. MOTO: I vote yes.
43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Did you get it, he
45 voted yes.
46
47 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Percy.
50

1 MR. BALLOT: Yeah, as I understand it I
2 voted for proposal WP 18-44 with the modification.

3
4 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

5
6 MR. BALLOT: So I vote yes, Mr.
7 Chairman.

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you Percy.
10 Percy Ballot voted yes for the record.

11
12 MR. STEVENSON: Yeah.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Yeah, go
15 ahead, Zach.

16
17 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
18 I'd like the record to reflect that we show seven votes
19 in favor of wildlife proposal 18-44 as amended by OSM
20 with the amended language reflected on page 93 of the
21 meeting book, and one abstention.

22
23 The proposal carries as modified.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Okay. It
26 is now 4:30. How does it looked for us to -- by
27 finishing by tomorrow?

28
29 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead. Could you
32 hold your comments to yourself please, we're trying to
33 -- it's hard for me to listen to everybody when we're
34 -- they're mumbling and we need to hear. I'm not
35 trying to be -- but I need to hold your comments to
36 yourself for now because we need to respect the other
37 speakers.

38
39 Yeah. Go ahead, Zach.

40
41 MR. STEVENSON: I'm aware of the time,
42 that it's 4:30. And Marcy Okada with Gates of the
43 Arctic National Park had indicated that Dr. Anette
44 Watson who Member Louie Commack had mentioned this
45 morning about requesting an update today.....

46
47 MR. COMMACK: Yes.

48
49 MR. STEVENSON:on the Ambler Road
50

1 issue. She's in South Carolina right now, and it's now
2 almost 8:30 her time.....

3

4 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay.

5

6 MR. STEVENSON:on the east coast.
7 And I know Louie had needed to get home tomorrow so
8 he.....

9

10 MR. COMMACK: Call tomorrow checking at
11 2:30. So.....

12

13 MR. STEVENSON: You want to table that
14 until tomorrow?

15

16 MR. COMMACK: Yes.

17

18 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair.

19

20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

21

22 MR. STEVENSON: Okay. That would bring
23 us -- I'm noticing that we would -- our Wildlife
24 Division was prepared to address next not 18-45, but
25 skipping to 18-46/47. And we could certainly continue
26 with that now at 4:30, but that would be the next
27 proposal we would be addressing is 18-46/47 on page 142
28 of your meeting book.

29

30 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

31

32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'm worn out from all
33 these. Yeah, I think we could cover 18-46. Do we need
34 to address both of them together or could we just
35 address 46 and go back to 47?

36

37 Go ahead, you have the floor.

38

39 MS. MAAS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Lisa
40 Maas for the record. The next four proposals, so
41 that's 45, 46/47, 32 and 48/49, those all are caribou
42 proposals dealing with the Western Arctic herd. So
43 it's probably best to kind of address them as a group
44 together. So it's up to you whether you'd want to
45 maybe just go to -- we could probably do WP 18-51 which
46 is a stand alone now and then start fresh tomorrow
47 morning on the caribou proposals since they're all kind
48 of related to each other.

49

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So you -- but you're
2 recommending that we go to 51, classification of bait
3 probably on the bears.

4
5 MS. MAAS: Yeah, that's correct.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. We're going to
8 be full -- busy tomorrow again. So should we go to --
9 what does the Council think, we'd have to modify the --
10 we don't have to modify the agenda. Should we go
11 to.....

12
13 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.

14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:WP 18 -- yes,
16 Percy.

17
18 MR. BALLOT: Yeah, I'm just wondering
19 was that (indiscernible - background noise) caribou
20 proposals, sound like that they're related and I was
21 just wondering in what way, whether they're
22 regionalized or is there anything that is coming out of
23 our RAC that we need to think about for tomorrow or
24 these are all proposals by individuals or what?

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: You broke up. What
27 you're saying maybe there's a few of them that we could
28 do it as a block, couple of proposals together?

29
30 MR. BALLOT: Yeah, I was just wondering
31 if anybody has the summary of all the proposals and how
32 they relate to each other like they're not
33 controversial for our region? I guess that would be
34 the question I have.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. What you're
37 saying, we could probably cover under block WP 45,
38 46/47, 32 and 49 that all have to do with caribou in
39 unit 23 except WP 18-32 have to do with caribou on unit
40 31, 22, 24, 25, 26A and B. Did you get it Percy, that
41 there's one that kind of has a lot of different units.

42
43 MR. BALLOT: Roger. Yes. I'll read up
44 on that.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. So should we
47 continue with 45? Let's go to WP 45.

48
49 MS. MAAS: Okay, Mr. Chair. My -- I
50

1 was prepared to present 46/47 just the way they all
2 relate to each other if you -- but you prefer to do 45
3 first?

4
5 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Proposal 45, 46, 47
6 are close to.....

7
8 MS. MAAS: Yeah, Mr. Chair, I was
9 prepared to present 46/47 first because that's the
10 closure and the closure may affect 45 which is the
11 harvest limit.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. With approval
14 of the Board I think we could go to 46/47 is what
15 you're saying?

16
17 MS. MAAS: Yes, please. So that would
18 be first before.....

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Let's -- okay.
21 With the Council approval I'll open the floor for
22 proposal 18-46/47. I need to hear from introductions
23 and presentation.

24
25 Go ahead, Enoch.

26
27 MR. MITCHELL: She has the floor.

28
29 MS. MAAS: All right. Yes. Thank you,
30 Mr. Chair. My name is Lisa Maas and I'm a wildlife
31 biologist in the Office of Subsistence Management. And
32 again there are four proposals concerning caribou
33 regulations across the ranges of the Western Arctic,
34 Teshekpuk and Central Arctic caribou herds, including
35 WP 18-32, 45, 46/47 and 48/49. These proposals will be
36 presented consecutively and overlapping information
37 such as caribou biology and harvest will only be
38 presented once to reduce repetition and redundancy.

39
40 So first up again is wildlife proposal
41 18-46/47 which begins on page 142 of the meeting book.

42
43 Wildlife proposal 18-46 was submitted
44 by the Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group or
45 WACH Working Group. And wildlife proposal WP 18-47 was
46 submitted by Enoch Mitchell of Noatak. Both proposals
47 request that the Federal public lands in unit 23 be
48 closed to caribou hunting except by Federally-qualified
49 subsistence users. Although WP 18-47 specifically
50

1 requests that the closure extend for two years only,
2 from July 1st, 2018 to June 30th, 2020. Both
3 proponents are concerned about the decline of the
4 Western Arctic herd and noted that the 2016/17 closure
5 to non-Federally-qualified users helped local hunters
6 meet their subsistence needs by reducing user conflicts
7 and hunting activity by non-local hunters. Both
8 proponents also emphasize the vital cultural and
9 nutritional role of caribou to unit 23 residents. The
10 proponent for WP 18-47 also stated that aircraft noise
11 from guides and transporters can disrupt caribou
12 migration which is a source of user conflict.

13
14 Co-sponsors for WP 18-47 include the
15 Native Village of Noatak, Cape Krusenstern National
16 Monument Subsistence Resource Commission, Kobuk Valley
17 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission and the
18 Noatak/Kivalina Fish and Game Advisory Committee.

19
20 Federally-qualified subsistence users
21 are depicted in map one on page 154 are those residents
22 with the customary and traditional use determination
23 for caribou in unit 23.

24
25 In 2015 the Alaska Board of Game
26 enacted restrictions to caribou regulations across the
27 ranges of the WACH and the Teshekpuk caribou herd in
28 response to declining caribou populations. The Federal
29 Subsistence Board adopted similar restrictions in 2016,
30 including reducing the unit 23 harvest limit from 15
31 caribou per day to five caribou per day. In 2016 the
32 Board adopted wildlife special action 16-01, closing
33 all Federal public lands in unit 23 to caribou hunting
34 by non-Federally-qualified users for the 2016/17
35 regulatory year. In June, 2016 the State submitted
36 temporary special action request WSA 16-03 to reopen
37 Federal public lands in unit 23. And the Board
38 rejected this request. In June, 2017 the Board adopted
39 wildlife special action 17-03, closing a portion of
40 Federal public lands in unit 23 to caribou hunting by
41 non-Federally-qualified users for the 2017/18
42 regulatory year. This targeted included Federal public
43 lands along the Noatak River and within the Squirrel,
44 Eli and Aggi River drainages.

45
46 There are several management areas that
47 affect caribou hunting and address user conflict in
48 unit 23 which are depicted in map two on page 155,
49 including the Noatak controlled use area which is
50

1 administered by the State, the National Park Service's
2 special commercial use area and portions of Selawik
3 National Wildlife Refuge that are closed to commercial
4 hunting.

5
6 Caribou migration routes vary annually
7 and their populations naturally fluctuate over time.
8 The WACH population peaked at 490,000 caribou in 2003
9 and has since declined over 50 percent to approximately
10 201,000 caribou in 2016. Bull/cow ratios are within
11 State management objectives.

12
13 Harvest from the WACH approximates the
14 estimated harvestable surplus for this herd. In 2016
15 the harvestable surplus was about 12,000 caribou. The
16 long term annual harvest estimate also averages about
17 12,000 caribou. On average local hunters within the
18 range of the WACH account for 95 percent of the total
19 WACH harvest while non-local hunters account for 5
20 percent. Most WACH caribou are harvested in unit 23.
21 On average 58 percent of the total WACH harvest is by
22 unit 23 residents while 76 percent of the harvest by
23 non-local hunters occurs in unit 23. In 2016 during
24 the Federal lands closure 149 non-Federally-qualified
25 users hunted caribou in unit 23 which is down from a
26 long term average of 487 non-Federally-qualified users.
27 However this number also somewhat decreased in 2015
28 after restrictions to State regulations. And there may
29 still be some outstanding 2016 harvest reports.

30
31 Most local hunters access caribou
32 hunting areas by boat while most non-local hunters
33 access hunting areas by plane.

34
35 Caribou have been a primary resource
36 for the Inupiaq of the Northwest Arctic region for
37 thousands of years and continue to dominate the
38 subsistence harvest of the region. In household
39 harvest surveys were often the most harvested species
40 accounting for 100 to 200 pounds per person.

41
42 User conflicts between local and non-
43 local hunters have been well documented in unit 23
44 since at least the 1980, particularly in Noatak
45 National Preserve and the Squirrel River drainage.
46 Local hunters have expressed concerns over aircraft and
47 non-local hunters disrupting caribou migration by
48 scaring caribou away from river crossings, landing and
49 camping along migration routes and shooting lead
50

1 caribou. Other sources indicate that while aircraft
2 can affect caribou behavior in the short term they
3 likely do not impact long term caribou behavior or
4 migration through Noatak National Preserve. Short term
5 disturbance could still affect hunter success.

6
7 Several efforts have been made to
8 address and mitigate user conflicts in unit 23
9 including the formation of the Unit 23 Working Group as
10 well as the various management areas such as the Noatak
11 controlled use area. In addition the Unit 23
12 Interagency group was established in January of 2017
13 when the Federal Subsistence Board directed OSM to
14 organize a group of State and Federal representatives
15 to discuss possible solutions to unit 23 user conflicts
16 such as targeted closures. This group met in April,
17 2017 and agreed upon a possible targeted closure.
18 However more could be done by the State and by Federal
19 land management agencies to address user conflicts in
20 unit 23.

21
22 User conflicts occur more frequently in
23 some areas of unit 23 than in other. Specifically
24 portions of the Noatak National Preserve and Squirrel
25 River drainage have repeatedly been identified at
26 regional advisory council and public meetings as areas
27 where conflicts are concentrated. Conversely other
28 Federal public lands in unit 23 such as Bering Land
29 Bridge National Preserve, Selawik National Wildlife
30 Refuge and Gates of the Arctic National Preserve have
31 not been identified as areas experiencing much user
32 conflict. Due to this discrepancy in user conflict a
33 partial Federal lands closure as depicted in map 10 on
34 page 189 may be more appropriate and more effective
35 than a unit wide Federal lands closure. And that page
36 again was 189. Indeed a unit wide closure may
37 represent an unnecessary restriction on non subsistence
38 uses. The targeted closure as depicted in map 10 on
39 page 189 is the area suggested by the unit 23
40 Interagency Group.

41
42 If this proposal is adopted caribou
43 hunting on Federal public lands in unit 23 would be
44 closed to non-Federally-qualified users. Regulatory
45 year 2018/19 would be the third year of a closure. No
46 biological impact is expected from approving this
47 request as non-Federally-qualified users account for
48 such a small percentage of WACH harvest. While the
49 number of non-Federally-qualified users and aircraft in
50

1 unit 23 would likely decrease substantially, use may
2 become more concentrated on State lands, particularly
3 on gravel bars below the mean high water mark. Other
4 users such as moose hunters, private planes and
5 recreational boaters would still be able to fly over
6 and access Federal public lands. Subsistence
7 opportunity for Federally-qualified subsistence users
8 may increase. Local residents particularly from the
9 Village of Noatak recognize positive effects from the
10 2016/17 closure citing higher harvest success.

11
12 Currently according to the WACH Working
13 Group's management plan the WACH population is on the
14 line between preservative and conservative management.
15 One recommendation under preservative management is
16 closure of some Federal public lands to non-qualified
17 users. Two criteria for restricting non subsistence
18 use under Title VIII of ANILCA are conservation of
19 healthy wildlife populations and continuation of
20 subsistence uses. Closure for conservation reasons is
21 not warranted however closure of some Federal lands for
22 the continuation of subsistence uses is warranted due
23 to continued user conflicts in the Noatak and Squirrel
24 River drainages as well as the benefit of the 2016/17
25 closure to Noatak residents.

26
27 As I'm reading the OSM preliminary
28 conclusion it may help to refer to map 10 on page 189.
29 The OSM preliminary conclusion is to support proposal
30 WP 18-46 with modification to close all Federal public
31 lands within a 10 mile wide corridor, five miles either
32 side, along the Noatak River from the western boundary
33 of Noatak National Preserve upstream to the confluence
34 with the Cutler River, north of the Noatak River
35 between and including the Kelly and Nimiuktuk River
36 drainages, within the northern and southern boundaries
37 of the Eli River and Aggi River drainages respectively
38 and within the Squirrel River drainage to caribou
39 hunting except by Federally-qualified subsistence users
40 and take no action on proposal WP 18-47.

41
42 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Number --
45 we need to go number -- on consultation from tribes and
46 ANCSA corporations.

47
48 Go ahead, Zach.

49
50

1 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
2 There were no comments from either tribes or ANCSA
3 corporations on wildlife proposal 18-46/47.

4
5 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Zach.
8 Okay.

9
10 Number 3, ADF&G.

11
12 MR. HANSEN: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 This is Alex Hansen, Department of Fish and Game here
14 in Kotzebue. I'm the Western Arctic herd caribou
15 biologist. And I just want to make I guess our
16 position known here locally in the Kotzebue Fish and
17 Game office is that we don't necessarily support these
18 recommendations on biological reasons.

19
20 What we are finding is that we have
21 good biological metrics, our adult survival is high
22 right now, our calf recruitment is very high coming up
23 from the past few years and the decline. Calf survival
24 based on the last two years of our studies is
25 considerably high as well, 84 and 85 percent or sorry,
26 88 percent respectively, and calf production is up as
27 well. What we're seeing also is, you know, our body
28 conditions for animals that we captured in Onion
29 Portage, those body conditions are up, our calf weights
30 are up. And our herd composition, this is another
31 metric we look at, the bull to cow ratio is up as well.

32
33 So based on biological considerations
34 we feel like, you know, cutting out harvest of about,
35 you know, as mentioned here, between three and 600
36 individuals is not going to help the situation
37 biologically.

38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Okay. Thank
40 you.

41
42 MR. HANSEN: Thank you.

43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Anyone from the
45 Federal.

46
47 (No comments)

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not, tribal.

50

1 (No comments)

2

3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: If not, I hear -- I'm
4 seeing nothing, number 4, other regional councils.

5

6 MS. MAAS: Mr. Chair, the Western
7 Interior Council voted to support the OSM modification,
8 so the partial Federal lands closure.

9

10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

11

12 MS. ATKINSON: Thank you. This is
13 Hannah Atkinson with the National Park Service and I
14 have comments form Cape Krusenstern National Monument
15 Subsistence Resource Commission.

16

17 The Commission voted to support the OSM
18 modification of WP 18-46. Enoch Mitchell commented
19 that the 2017 and 2018 closure had worked for Noatak to
20 harvest their needed caribou. But Alex Whiting liked
21 the OSM modification to include from the western
22 boundary of the Noatak National Preserve upstream to
23 the confluence of with the Cutler River, north of the
24 Noatak River, between and including the Kelly and
25 Nimiuktuk River drainages.

26

27 The Kobuk Valley National Park
28 Subsistence Resource Commission had the following
29 comment. Enoch Mitchell said that the modifications
30 are good, but we hope to keep it the same as it was in
31 the WSA 17-03 proposal. Shil Downey, Greta Shirk and
32 Nellie Grist all questioned the impact of closing
33 Federal lands in the Noatak and the impact that it
34 would have on the upper Kobuk hunting areas. Shil
35 Downey relayed a concern from Louie Commack because
36 Louie Commack was absent from the meeting and said
37 Louie Commack that fly in hunters will crowd upper
38 Kobuk on the lower Selawik side, the State lands near
39 Selawik. They were worried about hunters in that area.

40

41 Thank you.

42

43 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Let's
44 see, where was I. Oh, Fish and Game. Yeah, I was at
45 Fish and Game Advisory Committee, right?

46

47 MS. MAAS: That was the SRC. Marcy on
48 the phone might.

49

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.
2 Anyone on the radioland from number 4, advisory.....

3
4 MS. OKADA: Hello, this is Marcy, Marcy
5 with the National Park Service for Gates of the Arctic
6 National Park Subsistence Resource Commission.

7
8 The SRC asked the question if proposal
9 18-45 was meant to lower the bag limit from five
10 caribou per day to three caribou why would it be
11 necessary to submit this proposal to close Federal
12 public lands to non-Federally-qualified users. This
13 proposalis asking for harsher restriction. Concerns --
14 there are concerns that non-Federally-qualified users
15 would move to State lands to go caribou hunting and
16 there are State lands near the community of Ambler
17 where thousands of caribou go through.

18
19 And that's it.

20
21 Thank you.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

24
25 Go ahead, Zach.

26
27 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
28 I've been informed that the Seward Peninsula
29 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council in the Nome area
30 has voted to support wildlife proposal 18-46/47 as well
31 as signing on to participating in the Subsistence
32 Regional Advisory Councils' caribou working group.

33
34 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. I was
37 looking for the OSM's modification. I need to see it.

38
39 Yeah, go ahead.

40
41 MR. STEVENSON: The proposed OSM
42 modification can be found, bear with me just a
43 moment.....

44
45 MS. MAAS: It's on page 192. That's
46 where all the written verbal justification and
47 regulations are. But on page 189 is like the visual
48 map version of the modification. So 189 and 192.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.

2

3 MS. BRAEM: Thank you. Nikki Braem
4 with National Park Service.

5

6 Just a clarification. The Seward
7 Peninsula RAC voted to support this with -- as modified
8 by OSM, as OSM had recommended.

9

10 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Nikki.

11

12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.
13 Are we done with number 4, SRC -- yes. We need to go
14 to summary of -- are there any public comments?

15

16 MS. MAAS: There are no written public
17 comments.

18

19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you.

20

21 Go ahead, Zach.

22

23 MR. McKEE: There are no written public
24 comments, but I believe we have somebody here in the
25 public that wants to testify on this proposal.

26

27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.
28 Anyone from the public.

29

30 MS. MONIGOLD: Hello, my name is Karmen
31 Monigold, I'm a current resident of Kotzebue.

32

33 I was looking at the modifications for
34 the OSM to the original proposal and one thing that
35 struck me is how it's going to displace the problem. I
36 understand the people on the Noatak that have their
37 issues with airplanes and user conflicts, but I'm
38 looking at this map and I see that BLM lands are right
39 behind my back door and if other areas are closed, but
40 not all lands are closed then it's going to -- it may
41 potentially become our problem behind our back door and
42 having user conflicts in our area. So I just wanted to
43 make note of that.

44

45 Otherwise I would have supported the
46 OSM recommendations, but I would like to say that I
47 would support it as it's written because as soon as you
48 start just blocking certain areas that are more heavily
49 conflicted you're just moving the problem from one
50

1 place to another because it may be Noatak's problem
2 right now, but now you're going to make it Ambler's
3 problem, now you're going to make it my back door's
4 problem, you know. And so that would be my -- as a
5 user of traditional resources.

6
7 Thank you.

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

10
11 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Zach.

14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
16 This question is for Ms. Monigold, just to clarify.
17 You support proposal 18-46 as written?

18
19 MS. MONIGOLD: As written.....

20
21 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.

22
23 MS. MONIGOLD:for full closure.

24
25 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you.

26
27 MS. MONIGOLD: Thank you.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. We're
30 take number 7 and I will give it over to -- turn it
31 over to Zach for a motion to process.

32
33 We are now using the -- go ahead, Zach.

34
35 MR. STEVENSON: So the question before
36 the Council is to entertain a recommendation, a motion
37 to adopt wildlife proposal 18-46/47. And again to
38 clarify that can be as written, modified, to defer,
39 reject.

40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Vern, you had
42 your hand up or no -- go ahead, Vern.

43
44 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I make a motion
45 to approve 18-46/47 as written.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Do I have a second.

48
49 MR. KRAMER: Second.

50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Second by Kramer. Go
2 ahead.

3
4 MS. MAAS: Sorry. There is a slight
5 difference between 46 and 47. 47 is only asking for a
6 two year closure. So it might be easiest to consider
7 these -- you know, take separate actions. Because if
8 you support both of them there's a conflict because
9 one's asking for a two year closure and one's asking
10 for an indefinite closure.

11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, I see that.
13 One is for 2018 to 2020. Correct me if I'm wrong.

14
15 MR. MITCHELL: Which one of them is the
16 indefinite closure?

17
18 MS. MAAS: 46 which was submitted by
19 the Western Arctic Herd Caribou Working Group was the
20 indefinite closure and then 18-47 which is Mr.
21 Mitchell's proposal was a two year closure. So that
22 would be June or July 1st, 2018 through June 30th,
23 2020.

24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Could you rephrase
26 that so I could take notes. Which one is -- which one
27 is for 2020, 47 or 46?

28
29 MS. MAAS: 47 is a two year closure, 46
30 is an indefinite closure.

31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Indefinite.

33
34 MS. MAAS: So, I mean, it's permanent
35 until another regulate -- you know, a proposal comes
36 along that opens it.

37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. I gotcha. Why
39 don't -- okay. Yeah, those are two different things
40 the way this stuff -- I think it's better off if we
41 vote one thing at a time, we start with 46 and work up
42 to 47.

43
44 You get that, Zach?

45
46 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, I did, Mr. Chair.
47 I -- pardon me, Mr. Chair. I've noted that for the
48 record that given that as the biologist with OSM, Lisa
49 Maas, has pointed out, given that the proposals have a
50

1 different time scale that 18-46 specifically would
2 affect -- would be in effect indefinitely until some
3 other proposal removed it and conversely whereas
4 proposal 18-47 would only have a two year shelf life,
5 that they will be considered separately.

6
7 So again for that -- is that
8 clarification clear?

9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

11
12 MR. STEVENSON: Okay.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And we -- and the SRC
15 supported this with the modification, talk about 46.

16
17 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.

18
19 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.

20
21 MR. MITCHELL: I'm in support of 46.

22
23 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: 46 is just until next
24 year, right?

25
26 MS. MAAS: No.

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's what I got
29 written -- that's what I get -- this is what I got, I'm
30 seeing in front of me and that's why I'm getting
31 confused. One is saying 2/20 until 2018 and the other
32 one is different. See, 2018.

33
34 MS. MAAS: Yeah, don't look at this.
35 Look at this. So.....

36
37 MR. STEVENSON: Page 142.

38
39 MS. MAAS: Yeah.

40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's why I'm
42 getting mixed up, there's two different years.

43
44 MS. MAAS: Yeah, don't look at that.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Why?

47
48 MR. STEVENSON: They were wrong.

49
50

1 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. They were
2 wrong.
3
4 MS. MAAS: Yeah, the 47.....
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Is until '20.
7
8 MS. MAAS: Well, yeah, so this is.....
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Until '20. And 46
11 is.....
12
13 MS. MAAS: Indefinite.
14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Indefinite.
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:indefinite.
18
19 MS. MAAS: Yep.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Indefinite. I know I
22 supported this. Okay. Enoch, your proposal is -- I
23 mean, your proposal is for 18-46, that indefinite,
24 right?
25
26 MR. CLEVELAND: Mr. Chair.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Vern, go ahead.
29
30 MR. CLEVELAND: I'll pull my motion
31 back from 18-46 and 47, refrain -- pull back my motion.
32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: And that's -- I need
34 to hear from the second.
35
36 MR. KRAMER: Pull my second.
37
38 MR. CLEVELAND: And I'll second Enoch's
39 motion.
40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. There's a
42 motion by Enoch. Seconded by Vern. We need to take a
43 roll.....
44
45 MS. MAAS: Now there's time for
46 discussion and justification on why you would
47 support.....
48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
50

1 MS. MAAS:or oppose.
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: This indefinite is
4 sticking to me now completely different.
5
6 I'll say what I need to say.....
7
8 MR. CLEVELAND: Discussion.
9
10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:under discussion
11 I guess.
12
13 Go ahead on 18-46 -- go ahead, Zach.
14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Yes, we are at
16 discussion regarding proposal 18-46 which again
17 addresses the proposed indefinite closure of unit 23 to
18 Federal public lands be closed to caribou hunting
19 except by Federally-qualified subsistence users. Again
20 indefinitely. And that's wildlife proposal 18-46.
21
22 We're asking for a discussion and
23 justification on that issue.
24
25 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
26
27 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Anyone on this
28 discussion.
29
30 MR. MITCHELL: Mr. Chair.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Enoch.
33
34 MR. MITCHELL: Yes, I'd like to say --
35 well, I know this closure like Karmen said it kind of
36 moves the problem from Noatak to Ambler side, Kobuk
37 side or.....
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.
40
41 MR. MITCHELL:North Slope side or
42 wherever, but, you know, that problem was our problem
43 and we deal with it. And if it start on the Kobuk side
44 you can deal with it the same way I did. And if it go
45 to the Slope side they can deal with it the same way I
46 did. I work on it. The people of Noatak have
47 documented traditionally and scientifically conflicts
48 for years, 10 plus years. And I worked on it that
49 long. And we've been having that problem that long.
50

1 I don't -- I don't feel good about this
2 problem being moved over to Kobuk side, I don't feel
3 good about it moving to Karmen's back yard.

4
5 I don't feel good when it moved to
6 North Slope.

7
8 We the people of Noatak did not make
9 this problem, we try to get rid of it.

10
11 The State make this problem, the
12 outside hunters make this problem. We tried to fix it,
13 that's all, we did not try to hurt the Kobuk side or
14 Karmen's back yard or anybody else.

15
16 We have no intention of hurting
17 anybody.

18
19 We have no intention of moving this
20 problem around.

21
22 We don't want to hurt you guys too.

23
24 I feel for you guys too, but that
25 problem caused a lot of hunger for our people for a
26 long time.

27
28 It caused a lot of conflict.

29
30 We're paying high price of gas. And
31 we've got a lot of hardship. I don't feel good when we
32 move that problem around. I think we should all come
33 together, (in Native), all of us, Kobuk area, Noatak
34 area, North Slope, and get rid of this problem together
35 and not just move it around to each other, but get rid
36 of it for good, for all of us, for our children, not
37 just for us. Look at -- look at these proposals right
38 now. This proposal I'm doing is from 2018 to 2020, two
39 years only. I'm asking -- that's like asking for two
40 years of peaceful hunting. And then after that we
41 going to go back to what we were doing again,
42 struggling.

43
44 I try, I really worked on this, even
45 before I come here. I pray about this. I can't handle
46 it myself, it's too big. I need help so I pray to god
47 to help me. I'm -- in this room I'm the only one in
48 here from Noatak, I'm the only one speaking on behalf
49 of a lot of people. And they really enjoyed (in
50

1 Native). They really enjoyed that and that caribou
2 again. They really enjoyed taking their children out
3 again.

4
5 I don't want to move this problem
6 around, I want to say I'm sorry if it move over to you
7 guys or if it cause problems.

8
9 That -- and then now when I hear
10 Attamuk speak about this he said that an elder told him
11 in his lifetime he seen this happen before when there
12 was no caribou at Onion Portage. Maybe that's one of
13 the cycles that they have, maybe next year it'll get
14 better. Maybe you guys will get caribou again, maybe
15 it's just a cycle of the caribou. But the
16 sporthunters, they're not the cycle, they come and go
17 when they want to. They cause problems for us by
18 letting us buy expensive gas to go further up.

19
20 And when I look at this proposal I try
21 to do just to help our people for two more years, but
22 what about my grandchildren. My grandchildren. What
23 about my children, what about their children. They got
24 -- this 2020, it's going to go real quick. But we all
25 like caribou, we all like to hunt peacefully, we all
26 want to get our quota, we all want to feed our
27 children, we all want to be a good provider, we all
28 want to be a good hunter, we all want to put food on
29 our table. We don't want problems, we don't want to
30 cause problems, we don't want to fight over our
31 animals. So, I mean, I worked on this hard. And if
32 you really want I could help you guys work on it too
33 for your area, for you that care, for the Arctic Slope.
34 The elders here to tell us (in Native), it means
35 together. And together we're strong, we've got a
36 voice. If we all get together we can all deal with
37 this problem together. I'm willing to help you guys.
38 I'm willing to travel to your villages and to help you
39 write proposals just the way I did just so we won't
40 push this problem around, just so I feel good, just so
41 I won't hurt you guys, just so you could put food on
42 your table too. I don't know -- I know we did not let
43 them come to our river, we did not put them there, we
44 did not create that problem, that problem was created
45 by someone else and we tried to fix it. That's all,
46 that's all I tried to do. I did not try to hurt
47 nobody. I did not try to send hunters to your -- I did
48 not try to put problems in your hand. All I try to do
49 is eliminate some problem for us so we could put food
50

1 on our table.

2

3 And somehow I feel like I'm here all
4 alone. And you guys aren't all from other villages.
5 And that's all I can do is talk and hope that maybe
6 someday we'll fix this problem all together.

7

8

Taikuu.

9

10 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Enoch. I
11 hear you completely. And I hear Karmen also, I hear
12 both ways because originally I'm from Noatak.

13

14 First time they get a lot of caribou in
15 Noatak and my boys and my daughter first time they
16 wanted to follow them on to Noatak. And my boat got
17 too small. They're -- inside of their hearts they're
18 from Noatak. And we did -- and Enoch did this because
19 Noatak had no caribou for how many years.

20

21 But I understand Karmen's and probably
22 will be Louie's problem, we're pushing the problem
23 somewhere else.

24

25 But Enoch is right, when you -- they
26 take away your harvesting, makes a big hardship. First
27 time I haven't -- I've been up the Noatak first years
28 in 22 years, I go up this summer. And were they happy,
29 they were happy to see it, my boys were happy to see
30 it, like I said my boat got too small, but I was
31 willing to take them. And this is the worry I have,
32 Enoch, is I support you, yet I'm worried what the upper
33 Federal Board, how they going to vote on this. It -- I
34 welcome support from here, but I don't know how they
35 going to vote on it, they might put us down, but I will
36 support you all the way if I could of this closure for
37 two years at Noatak.

38

39 But I'm also like you, I'm worried
40 about what's going to happen to Kiana, upper Kobuk,
41 where the Federal lands begins, you know. We heard --
42 remember I always testify how many times that when the
43 trans -- planes used to take hunters all the way to
44 Cutler, that's where Noatak coming from there hear me
45 say that there was hunters that was dropped off at
46 Cutler, right at the headwaters of Cutler. They were
47 well off people when they could hire two people to take
48 care of their caribou. Now they can't go there,
49 Noatak, first in what, two years, three years, first

50

1 time they get caribou without having to go to Kiana and
2 spending about six, seven drums of gas.

3
4 Personally on the discussion I will
5 support Enoch and yet I'm worried what the upper
6 Federal, how they will vote on us.

7
8 We could vote in support of this or not
9 or make some amendments. Maybe we will have to make
10 some amendments for another year, Enoch. What I'm
11 trying to do is make it pass. And the upper Federal
12 might deny us on this.

13
14 That's my thought.

15
16 Anyone else on this thought here.

17
18 (No comments)

19
20 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I guess if not.....

21
22 Go ahead, Kramer.

23
24 MR. KRAMER: We all know that Federal
25 Subsistence Board will probably do a partial closure
26 again or opening or whatever it may be. They'll
27 probably go with OSM's preliminary conclusions. And if
28 so this is our recommendations. Fifty permits will be
29 available within -- with a in person registration. In
30 person. If you are not here you will not get a permit.
31 Fifty permits will only be available because I know
32 that the Federal Subsistence Board is going to go
33 straightaway from what we believe in and that's
34 protecting our subsistence way of life because we put
35 in a closure -- a special action request and they
36 denied it. So they decided to put in a partial closure
37 to avoid conflict.

38
39 These registration permits would be
40 available from June 1st to June 7th, that is the time
41 limit, June 1st to June 7th with no exceptions, no
42 calling in and say I want a permit. No, in person,
43 June 1st to June 7th, 50 permits and that is it. No
44 more than 50 permits. That -- if the Federal
45 Subsistence Board decides to go with OSM's conclusion
46 that's how it's going to be, but if the Federal
47 Subsistence Board decides to support 46 and 47 then
48 they're on our side.

49
50

1 My suggestion is is that if it does --
2 if they do not support 46 and 47 and go with a full
3 closure, if the full closure does not go into effect
4 then maybe the two year closure, but if neither get
5 accepted and they decided to go with OSM's conclusion,
6 this is how it's going to be.

7
8 We write the rules, this is our
9 country, we subsist out there. We want to conserve
10 these caribou for generations to come. We want to
11 conserve these caribou for other outside hunters to
12 come. Once our population becomes healthy then there
13 is a possibility that -- you know, that these hunts can
14 continue. I was out there a few weeks ago sitting
15 there with a bunch of boats and this one guy, he stated
16 the absolute truth. He said five, six years ago you
17 could go up river and definitely come home with
18 caribou. Now that we're 200,000 caribou shy, man, your
19 changes have dropped more than 50 percent. There's
20 still a lot of boats out there that still have not
21 gotten any caribou, I'm one of them. I spent a lot of
22 money to go out there and have an expensive camping
23 trip. Yeah, we saw caribou, but they just weren't
24 moving.

25
26 This is what needs to happen, we need
27 to have control.

28
29 That's all I have.

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you.

32
33 Anyone else on this.

34
35 MR. MOTO: Mr. Chair.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Calvin.

38
39 I'll have one more follow-up after
40 that.

41
42 MR. MOTO: Yeah, I hope.....

43
44 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Calvin's going to
45 talk, Percy. You'll be next.

46
47 MR. MOTO: I'd hope that decisions
48 we've been making are fruitful. I want to see how --
49 where our caribou and all our different species of
50

1 animals that we subsist on stabilize. And I hope that
2 we're making the right decisions on how we should
3 protect them or how we should use them, you know,
4 because if you're looking at the long picture, if we
5 could keep them up for our future generation of young
6 people that are coming up. I'm happy to say that in
7 our village we are teaching our young men how to hunt,
8 how to be conservative. Like last October or November
9 one of my great grandsons he came in smiling away, his
10 first caribou. He gave it to me. And I'd like to say
11 that this young man was only nine years old, he got his
12 first caribou. And that's how it was -- that's how it
13 is in our village. If a young man or get -- or a young
14 lady get a first caribou or something they give it to
15 an elder that they respect. It's still -- we're still
16 trying to pass that on to our young people at home.

17
18 And we have -- we have the respect of a
19 lot of our young people, you know. I can tell you one,
20 but every time I try to walk to the store all of a
21 sudden there'll be somebody behind me with a hand,
22 where you going, grandpa. But this is something that
23 we try to pass on when we have Inupiaq days, tell the
24 stories about how we used to hunt, how we used to
25 gather -- our women used to gather the plants and the
26 fish and stuff that we subsisted on during the winter
27 and how they preserve them. This is something that we
28 hope never diminish.

29
30 So I wanted to thank you, our
31 biologist, all you people that work for the different
32 agencies and the reports you give to us so that we can
33 know what -- how we should vote, how we should act. I
34 want to say that I have great respect for some of you,
35 for you people that have to do all the work and gather
36 for us to make decisions. And I wanted to thank the --
37 my fellow members on us working together even though
38 sometimes we have differences of opinion, we still work
39 together, you know, we got to keep that up.

40
41 I want to thank you for giving me the
42 opportunity to say something.

43
44 Thank you.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you. Percy,
47 you had something to say?

48
49 MR. BALLOT: That I support proposal

50

1 46, right?

2

3

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes. If you want.

4

5

MR. BALLOT: I'm in support of it.

6

7 I do have a question I wanted to
8 discuss. I didn't know how you guys are doing this
9 year. I'm sitting out here and we finally see caribou
10 the last few days here in the river and it's now
11 October 25. And I saw our bull harvest probably went
12 to October 14 for the first hunt. And I was just
13 wondering what you guys -- I heard they haven't been
14 getting any up there at Ambler way or Shungnak or maybe
15 Kiana too. I'm kind of wondering if you guys want to
16 discuss that October 14th date, otherwise I'm pretty
17 okay with because it's killing cows and it's killing
18 bulls, but they just coming around. So I thought I'd
19 throw that in there.

20

21

Otherwise I will support it as it is if
22 nobody seems to think that date matters right now.

23

24

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Percy,
25 we'll vote on it in a few minutes. And I will rephrase
26 one last time.

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

I support this, but I'm scared like I
say what the upper Federal will vote because the vote
is three Native votes and five -- no eight, non-voting
Natives most likely. I'm scared, I hope they make --
don't make us fail, I hope they adopt it, Enoch.
That's what I'm trying to say. And if they decide to
fail I think the approach we need to use is RM 80 type
like I discuss with Kramer that -- and others here in
Kotzebue where they have to register in person, not on
the phone or have someone register for them, that they
come to Kotzebue to register to harvest -- to hunt
caribou. That might not stop all outside hunters, but
might eliminate some. I think that approach we have to
use.....

42

43

MR. BALLOT: Okay.

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:but we will find
out how the Federal Board vote. I'm -- like I say I
will vote in favor of what it is. So we need to
reinstate the final motion, Enoch's motion to adopt 18-
46 closure. Roll call vote on 18-46 as written.

1 Go ahead, Zach. Oh, go ahead, take
2 over.

3
4 MS. MAAS: Thank you. This is Lisa
5 Maas for the record. And I just wanted to clarify the
6 motion before you all vote.

7
8 So W 18-46 is the indefinite, quote,
9 permanent closure to all Federal lands for caribou
10 hunting to non-Federally-qualified users. So just
11 clarifying this is the indefinite, quote, permanent
12 closure.

13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Gotcha.

15
16 Go ahead, Louie.

17
18 MR. COMMACK: You're mentioning closure
19 to all Federal lands, that the Preserves.....

20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

22
23 MR. COMMACK:National Parks, all
24 this stuff.

25
26 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: For non-Federally-
27 qualified.....

28
29 MR. COMMACK: Yes. Right.

30
31 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:users.

32
33 MR. COMMACK: The sporthunters,
34 whoever.

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah.

37
38 MR. COMMACK: Okay. My village is
39 surrounded by State lands and BLM lands and Selawik
40 area is BLM lands, we're surrounded by all that land.
41 So and we're one hour away from Fairbanks by plane. I
42 respect you guys' work so you've just -- Preserve gets
43 closed, they got no place else to go. So I'll still
44 respect you guys' work.

45
46 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you, Louie.
47 Yes. I honor your respect. But I think you hear where
48 we're saying it most, I got a feeling it's going to --
49 on the final vote by the Federal it's going to fail.

50

1 Yeah, go ahead. You had your hand up
2 or who? No. Yeah, go ahead.

3
4 MR. McKEE: I just wanted to say that
5 -- I mean, you're -- if you're about to take a straight
6 vote on the full permanent closure from 46, you could
7 also -- I mean, you can take this as a separate vote
8 since you're already kind of going down that route on
9 46. Since 47 is as Lisa stated is just for two years,
10 if you vote to support 46 you could then take a -- make
11 a motion subsequent to that to just take no action on
12 47.

13
14 Just as a suggestion.

15
16 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.

17
18 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, Percy.

19
20 MR. BALLOT: I'm sorry, I didn't catch
21 that -- the indefinite closure thing. I didn't catch
22 all your comments because I ran out of power on my
23 phone so I never get to hear some of your comments.
24 But are -- you're thinking about supporting -- is the
25 motion right now to support 46 as it stands with the
26 indefinite closure for unit 23?

27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes, Federal land.
29 On the Federal lands. Can you hear, Louie, that it's
30 -- we're going to give the problem to Louie. We will --
31 I will say that openly. Sorry, Louie, but it.....

32
33 MS. MONIGOLD: No. No, only if
34 you.....

35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:because it's
37 going to -- no, on the Federal closure on 46 is
38 indefinite, the way it's written.

39
40 Yes.

41
42 MS. MONIGOLD: Isn't that only if you
43 adopt as amended or as recommended by OSM?

44
45 MS. MAAS: Through the Chair. This is
46 Lisa Maas. This closure only applies to Federal lands,
47 not State lands.

48
49 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

50

1 MS. MAAS: So.....
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Only on Federal
4 lands. I'm going.....
5
6 MS. MONIGOLD: Yes, I know that.
7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:I'm sorry if I
9 misquote or.....
10
11 MS. MAAS: Right. So there are State
12 lands north of Ambler, Shungnak, Kobuk.....
13
14 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
15
16 MS. MAAS:in the Squirrel River
17 drainage around Candle, up by Kivalina. So if all the
18 Federal lands are closed the potential to concentrate
19 non-local users on these State lands is there.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah. Okay.
22
23 MR. COMMACK: Behind Kiana.
24
25 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes. I think we need
26 -- it's 5:30 now, let's vote on this one.
27
28 Zach, take a roll call vote, please.
29
30 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
31 So through the Chair, the roll call now addresses a
32 vote from the Council on wildlife proposal 18-46.
33 Again which would provide for an indefinite closure of
34 Federal public lands in unit 23 to caribou hunting by
35 non-Federally-qualified meaning nonresidents
36 indefinitely in unit 23 as written in your books, as
37 written. And as Chris McKee had stated should the
38 Council choose to vote for 18-46 the recommendation
39 again would be too take no action on proposal 18-47,
40 again because that was simply a recommended two year
41 closure instead.
42
43 So again roll call vote.
44
45 Member Cleveland.
46
47 MR. CLEVELAND: I vote yes.
48
49 MR. STEVENSON: Member Mitchell.
50

1
2 MR. MITCHELL: Yes.
3
4 MR. STEVENSON: Member Kramer.
5
6 MR. BALLOT: Mr. Chairman.
7
8 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead. Hang on.
9 Go ahead, Percy.
10
11 MR. BALLOT: I'm just wondering are we
12 -- are you guys all ready to vote. After I'm looking
13 through this stuff and kind of having some thoughts
14 about it. I haven't heard Enoch's words or
15 that's -- I never got that chance or you other guys,
16 but just talks about an indefinite vote and if it's
17 voted it's something that the Federal Subsistence Board
18 will support or not support. And I saw the
19 modification, I don't know if that's included, because
20 I didn't know about you guys, but I was thinking I
21 might sleep on it a night, but you guys are all ready
22 to go.
23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So what you're saying
25 you wanted to vote in the morning after you decide and
26 think this over?
27
28 MR. STEVENSON: No, Mr. Chair.
29
30 MR. BALLOT: I would think so.
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I know I.....
33
34 MR. STEVENSON: Point of order.
35
36 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
37
38 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.
39
40 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Percy have a right to
41 think.
42
43 Go ahead, Zach.
44
45 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair.
46 Percy, I -- this is Zach. I just wanted to update you.
47 It sounds like you may have stepped out a moment when
48 some of the discussion was going on. We were doing a
49 roll call vote and addressing your question directly.
50

1 Enoch Mitchell provided some discussion earlier about
2 the importance of caribou to the (in Native), people of
3 Noatak. And the effort that has gone into developing
4 proposal 18-46. And there was a public comment
5 delivered by Karmen Monigold of Kotzebue that voiced
6 some concern about whether or not this proposal may
7 shift user conflicts to areas that were not currently
8 experiencing some of those problems. And there was
9 discussion of OSM's proposed modification to the
10 proposal which instead rather than closing all of unit
11 23 proposed closing the most high user conflict areas,
12 a five mile corridor on each side specifically in the
13 Noatak region, the Squirrel River, the Aggi and the
14 Eli. And there also was some concern about even if the
15 Council, this Council, were to support proposal 18-46
16 whether or not there would be sufficient support,
17 enough support from the Federal Board to see this
18 carried out when they make their final vote. So I
19 provide that to you only to give you a summary of the
20 discussion and that brings us present to the vote which
21 we're now taking the roll call vote to support proposal
22 18-46, again the proposed indefinite closure of unit 23
23 to caribou hunting by non-Federally-qualified or
24 nonresident users.

25
26 And that is the status of where we are
27 now as we take the roll call vote.

28
29 Did that answer your question, Percy.

30
31 MR. BALLOT: Yes.

32
33 MR. STEVENSON: Taikuu.

34
35 MR. BALLOT: It does.

36
37 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead, continue to
38 voting roll call.

39
40 MR. STEVENSON: Okay. I believe we
41 were at Member Kramer.

42
43 MR. KRAMER: Yes.

44
45 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Chair.

46
47 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

48
49 MR. STEVENSON: Beverly Moto.

50

1 MS. MOTO: Yes.
2
3 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Your mic.
4
5 MS. MOTO: Yes.
6
7 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Calvin.
8
9 MR. MOTO: Are we still voting?
10
11 MR. STEVENSON: Yeah.
12
13 MR. MOTO: Yes.
14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Mr. Moto said yes?
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
18
19 MR. STEVENSON: Member Commack.
20
21 MR. COMMACK: I would abstain and I
22 would like to justify why.
23
24 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yeah, go ahead.
25
26 MR. COMMACK: Like I stated earlier
27 there will be a dramatic shift. So I would have to
28 talk to my people, but I do respect your work. And
29 we'll still be friends.
30
31 Thank you.
32
33 MR. STEVENSON: And on the -- thank
34 you, Louie. On the telephone, Percy, are you there?
35
36 MR. MOTO: Where are we going.
37
38 MR. STEVENSON: Roll call vote from
39 Member Percy Ballot.
40
41 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Percy, you there?
42
43 (No comment)
44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. He said yes.
46 Earlier he said yes come to think of it.
47
48 Go ahead, read the results.
49
50

1 MR. STEVENSON: So there were seven
2 votes in favor of adopting wildlife proposal 18-46 for
3 the indefinite closure as written. And there was one
4 abstain vote. So proposal 18-46 -- adoption of
5 proposal 18-46 as written carries with seven votes.

6
7 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8
9 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. Thank you,
10 Zach.

11
12 I think we need to -- it's now 5:30.

13
14 MR. STEVENSON: Hold on.

15
16 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.

17
18 MR. McKEE: You voted on 46, now just
19 to be clear on the record you need to take another vote
20 on 47. You've already acted on 46 so.....

21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.

23
24 MR. McKEE:my suggestion would be
25 for you to take a vote to take no action on 47.

26
27 Mr. Chair.

28
29 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: So we need a motion
30 to take no action on proposal 47.

31
32 MR. MITCHELL: Why do you suggest that?

33
34 MR. McKEE: Through the Chair. Member
35 Mitchell, because you just voted to a full --
36 essentially an indefinite closure. So there's no need
37 to vote on a proposal that's only asking for a two year
38 closure which was what yours was asking for.

39
40 MR. MITCHELL: Okay. So if 46 never
41 pass the Federal Subsistence Board what are we going to
42 do with 47?

43
44 MR. McKEE: I can't predict how the
45 Board's going to vote.

46
47 MR. MITCHELL: Yeah, that's why we need
48 47 too, if one fail the other one might.

49
50

1 MS. MAAS: Yeah. Through the Chair.
2 They're in conflict with each other so you can't really
3 support an indefinite closure and a two year closure.
4 You can't.....
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: We need to.....
7
8 MS. MAAS:do both.
9
10 MR. MITCHELL: Oh.
11
12 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT:we supported
13 your 46.
14
15 MR. MITCHELL: Okay. Thank you.
16
17 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: 47 is different.
18
19 MR. MITCHELL: Okay.
20
21 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: That's why we need to
22 -- what he said we need to do. So I need a motion on
23 the floor to not support 47.
24
25 MR. MCKEE: To take no action would be
26 the proper language.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'm sorry. To take
29 no action on 47. Do I have a motion on the floor?
30
31 MR. COMMACK: Mr. Chairman, for the
32 record and what is 47?
33
34 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead. It's only
35 for two years. And 46 is indefinite.
36
37 MR. COMMACK: 142.
38
39 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: It's on page 142, yes
40 -- go ahead, Zach.
41
42 MR. STEVENSON: Through the Chair.
43 Addressing Member Louie Commack's question.
44
45 To restate the point that was mentioned
46 a moment ago by Wildlife Division chief, Christ McKee,
47 the thought process here is that a vote of take no
48 action on proposal 18-47, which is only the two year
49 closure is the way to go because the Council has
50

1 already voted in support of 18-47 which was the
2 indefinite closure.
3
4 MS. MAAS: 46.
5
6 MR. MCKEE: 46.
7
8 MR. STEVENSON: Pardon me, 18-46 which
9 was the indefinite closure.
10
11 I hope that's clear.
12
13 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
14
15 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Go ahead.
16
17 MR. CLEVELAND: I make a motion to --
18 not to support.....
19
20 MR. STEVENSON: Take no action.
21
22 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: No, it's need no
23 action. Sorry.
24
25 MR. CLEVELAND:need no action on
26 18-47.
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I need a second.
29
30 (No comments)
31
32 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: I'll second it I
33 guess. I'll second it.
34
35 Roll call.
36
37 MR. STEVENSON: Member Cleveland.
38
39 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes.
40
41 MR. STEVENSON: Member Mitchell.
42
43 MR. MITCHELL: Yes.
44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Turn your mic on.
46
47 MR. MITCHELL: Yes.
48
49 MR. STEVENSON: Member Kramer.
50

1 MR. KRAMER: Yes.
2
3 MR. STEVENSON: He said -- member --
4 pardon me. Through the Chair.
5
6 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Kramer said yes.
7
8 MR. STEVENSON: Kramer said yes. Thank
9 you.
10
11 Mr. Chair.
12
13 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Yes.
14
15 MR. STEVENSON: Beverly Moto.
16
17 MS. MOTO: Yes.
18
19 MR. STEVENSON: Calvin Moto.
20
21 MR. MOTO: Yes.
22
23 MR. STEVENSON: Member Commack.
24
25 MR. COMMACK: Again, Mr. Chair, through
26 the Chair. Could you again clarify what I'm voting on?
27
28 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Take no action on
29 proposal 47.
30
31 MR. COMMACK: Take no action.
32
33 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Take no action on
34 proposal 47.
35
36 MR. COMMACK: Yes.
37
38 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Thank you all. I
39 think we're all not tired, we're overtired now I think.
40 We all need to rest. And we need to continue 9:00
41 o'clock in the morning.
42
43 MR. STEVENSON: Yes.
44
45 CHAIRMAN SHIEDT: Okay. 9:00 o'clock
46 in the morning. Let's continue 9:00 o'clock in the
47 morning.
48
49 (Off record)
50

(PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28
- 29
- 30
- 31
- 32
- 33
- 34
- 35
- 36
- 37
- 38
- 39
- 40
- 41
- 42
- 43
- 44
- 45
- 46
- 47
- 48
- 49
- 50

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2
3 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
4)ss.
5 STATE OF ALASKA)
6

7 I, Salena A. Hile, Notary Public in and for the
8 state of Alaska and reporter for Computer Matrix Court
9 Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:

10
11 THAT the foregoing pages numbered ___ through
12 ___ contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the
13 NORTHWEST ARCTIC FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY
14 COUNCIL MEETING, VOLUME I taken electronically on the
15 25th day of October 2017 at Kotzebue, Alaska;

16
17 THAT the transcript is a true and
18 correct transcript requested to be transcribed and
19 thereafter transcribed by under my direction and
20 reduced to print to the best of our knowledge and
21 ability;

22
23 THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or
24 party interested in any way in this action.

25
26 DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 11th
27 day of November 2017.
28
29
30

31 _____
32 Salena A. Hile
33 Notary Public, State of Alaska
34 My Commission Expires: 09/16/18
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50